DEVELOPING SPIRITUAL MATURITY IN MINISTRY LEADERS THROUGH A WHOLE-BIBLE THEMATIC INSTRUCTION

Eric John Palmu
Southeastern University - Lakeland, erickaren55@gmail.com

Follow this and additional works at: https://firescholars.seu.edu/dmin
Part of the Christianity Commons, Organizational Behavior and Theory Commons, and the Religious Education Commons

Recommended Citation
https://firescholars.seu.edu/dmin/6

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Barnett College of Ministries & Theology at FireScholars. It has been accepted for inclusion in Doctor of Ministry (DMin) by an authorized administrator of FireScholars. For more information, please contact firescholars@seu.edu.
DEVELOPING SPIRITUAL MATURITY IN MINISTRY LEADERS
THROUGH A WHOLE-BIBLE THEMATIC INSTRUCTION

By

Eric J. Palmu

A Project Dissertation Submitted to the Faculty of
SOUTHEASTERN UNIVERSITY
In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree
DOCTOR OF MINISTRY

April 2019

Doctor of Ministry Director:  
Dr. Jim Vigil

Second Reader:  
Dr. James Anderson

Third Reader:  
Dr. Sam Hemby
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents  ii

Acknowledgments  iv

Abstract  v

Chapter 1  Introduction  1
  Relationship to the Writer  4
  Contextual Scope and Limitations  6
  Project Goals and Objectives  7

Chapter 2  Project in Perspective  10
  Historical Perspective  10
    Five Theories of Learning  12
    The Learning Experience  19
  Knowing & Self  21
    Presuppositions  27
    Biblical Levels of Learning  30
  Theological and Biblical Dimension  32
    The Imago Dei Identity  33
    A Relational Hermeneutic  37
    The Heart and Transformation  43
    The Old and New Covenants  45
    Christian Thinking  47
  Attributes of Spiritual Formation  49
  Sociological Perspective  55

Chapter 3  Literature Review  58
  Conclusion  69

Chapter 4  Project Narrative and Field Work  72
  Project Narrative  74
  Intensive Interview Preparation  75
  Invitation and Interview Guide  77
  Project Curriculum  78
  Spheres of Examination  80
  Lesson Plans  84
  Spiritual Assessment  86

Chapter 5  Project Evaluation  88
  Pastors’ Interviews  88
  Focus Groups  91
  Spiritual Framework  93
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am so grateful for the perseverance and commitment to this work by my committee. Each has provided support and guidance in a unique way. I want to give special thanks to Dr. Jim Vigil for his enthusiasm, encouragement, and analysis throughout the process. In addition, to my second and third readers, Dr. James Anderson and Dr. Sam Hemby, I appreciate their invaluable advice and suggestions. They all have servant hearts and are led by the Spirit. Also, I am so thankful to my work supervisor, Pastor Alex Anderson, executive pastor of Bayside Community Church (FL), who made me “an offer I could not refuse” to seek this degree. Please forgive me those days that I was not a focused employee because of demands of reading and writing (lack of sleep). I am so thankful for Dr. Cindy Campbell in the Graduate Writing Service office for her patience and longsuffering with my writing style, or lack thereof. I offer a special thanks to Mrs. Shelly Manning for agreeing to be my editor, a monumental task that she was not expecting. I also thank my good friend, Tye Hefner, in assisting me in developing lessons for my students. He has a pastor’s heart for the lost. Most importantly to my wife, Karen, my gratitude for your patience during these three years of my absence and all the late night reading and writing assignments. We’ll take a trip now that it is over.
ABSTRACT

The purpose of this dissertation is to describe the development of an instructional program to teach and instruct ministry leaders in spiritual formation. The research reveals that current ministry leaders either lack a level of comfort in discipling team members or lack the capacity to teach and instruct volunteers in spiritual formation. If current ministry leaders do not disciple well, then future leaders will lack necessary leadership skills—an ominous outcome. Consequently, the purpose of the project is to develop a whole-Bible thematic instruction that will improve the discipleship skills of ministry leaders. The curriculum project is designed to develop in the ministry leader a spiritual framework in which to build the firm foundation of faith; a spiritual maturity resembling an *imago Christi* identity in order to grow volunteers and coaches. Focus groups were presented the project curriculum and learning was assessed through a spiritual assessment. Specific qualitative results were encouraging but inconclusive. However, anecdotal responses and enthusiasm for further post-presentation discussion revealed a response not easily detected by the spiritual assessments. Ultimately, the research provided great insight into a new approach to discipleship training and establishing a spiritual framework leading to a firm foundation in Christian identity.
Chapter 1

Introduction

The purpose of this dissertation is to describe the development of an instructional approach that will prepare church ministry leaders to manifest the spiritual maturity resembling a Christ-like identity. The ultimate goal is to multiply the number of future leaders. To that end, the objective is to establish whole-Bible thematic instruction based on the biblical themes critical to spiritual formation. This will equip ministry leaders in their approach to discipling their volunteers and coaches.

Much has been written about spiritual formation over the past several decades, and any discussion should always begin with a clarifying definition. The definition of spiritual formation developed by Leclerc and Maddix involves transformation into Christlikeness, interaction with God, personal soul care, and a lifelong process.¹ The authors provided a thorough but broad examination of spiritual formation. Mulholland’s definition was similar to that of Leclerc and Maddix’s but adds a developmental operation “as a process, of being formed, in the image of Christ, for the sake of others.”²

Other researchers focused on describing the process. Dallas Willard and James Wilhoit took the process to a deeper level and were more succinct in their definitions. Willard adds that spiritual formation “is the process of transforming the person into

Christlikeness through transforming the essential parts of the person. Though transforming the mind is absolutely fundamental, the other parts of the self also have to be transformed.”³ The key to spiritual transformation is the specific points of self that need to be addressed. Willard said, “Spiritual transformation is not about behavior modification. It is about changing the sources of behavior, so the behavior will take care of itself. When the mind is right and the heart is right . . . the whole person simply steps into the way of Christ and lives there with joy and strength.”⁴ Wilhoit stated similarly regarding spiritual formation that it “(1) is intentional; (2) is communal; (3) requires our engagement; (4) is accomplished by the Holy Spirit; (5) is for the glory of God and the service of others; and (6) has as its means and end the imitation of Christ.”⁵

The critical point for Willard was to address the sources of behavior and not change the outward behaviors alone. James Bryan Smith emphasized dramatic human change. He maintained that behavior change “does not rely on willpower.”⁶ Smith is in agreement that spiritual maturity is not a matter of acting like Christ but being in the *imago Christi*. Paul best describes the image of Christ that believers are to seek after:

15 The Son is the image of the invisible God, the firstborn over all creation. 16 For in him all things were created: things in heaven and on earth, visible and invisible, whether thrones or powers or rulers or authorities; all things have been created through him and for him. 17 He is before all things, and in him all things hold together. 18 And he is the head of the body, the church; he is the beginning and the firstborn from among the dead, so that in everything he might have the supremacy. 19 For God was pleased to have all his fullness dwell in him,²⁰ and through him to reconcile to himself all things, whether things on earth or things in heaven, by making peace through

⁴ Ibid., 14.
⁵ James C. Wilhoit, *Spiritual Formation as if the Church Mattered: Growing in Christ through Community* (Grand Rapids: Baker Academics, 2008), 23.
his blood, shed on the cross. (Col. 1:15-20 NIV)

The internalization of change can only be accomplished by confronting the sources of behavior. Smith referred to the causes of behavior as influencers. Influencers are those aspects of the self that influence the will such as thinking, complex inner workings of impulses, and understanding the dynamics of the social context.⁷

All of these authors agree that an essential requirement of spiritual formation and developing maturity in Christlikeness is the study of Scripture. Leclerc and Maddix stated, “The ultimate goal of Scripture study for Christians as Christians must be to encounter the living God…”⁸ Surprisingly, some authors did not tie the definition of spiritual formation to studying the Scriptures. Only Wilhoit, Foster, and Leclerc and Maddix include a significant focus on Scripture study in their work regarding spiritual formation.

Examining the various content provided by the authors revealed two glaring issues. First, Bible study is considered a primary spiritual discipline in most definitions of spiritual formation, focusing on traditional spiritual disciplines. Scripture study must be considered the foundation of spiritual formation. Second, spiritual formation must include a scriptural study leading to the development of an *imago Christi* identity, connecting the believer to the God story. Wilhoit committed a chapter to the discipline of Bible study.⁹ Consequently, the goal of this project hinges on developing a whole-Bible thematic instruction, holistic in design, which leads to improving the spiritual maturity of its church ministry leaders.

---

⁷. Ibid., 22.
⁸. Leclerc and Maddix, 18-29.
⁹. Wilhoit, 46.
The subject of this DMin dissertation project is discussed within the university campus staff meetings on a regular basis. Southeastern University (Lakeland, FL) has launched an initiative to provide churches with accredited academic courses that deliver a quality biblical instruction for its members and leaders, both present and future. Bayside Community Church, in a collaborative educational agreement with Southeastern (SEU), supports a regional campus at its main campus in Bradenton, Florida. The megachurch serves 12,000 congregants each weekend through its six central and western Florida satellites. Student enrollment at SEU Bayside is 160 undergraduate students and 15 graduate students that support six undergraduate degrees and three graduate degrees. SEU Bayside’s primary mission is growing church leaders for the next generation.

As campus director of SEU Bayside, it is critical that the staff assess the preparedness of its graduates. Staff conversations continually examine issues surrounding the institution’s curriculum and whether they are growing leaders prepared to lead as men and women of God. If the staff vision is to prepare this young leadership for the next generation, then an intentional process must be developed that will ensure the desired results. Consequently, the purpose of this project was to develop an instructional approach leading to that end.

In a recent intensive interview, a satellite campus pastor respondent discovered that spiritual maturity was missing in the ministry leaders who are in charge of specific ministry areas. Historically, the goal was hiring good people that will complete operational tasks within the ministry area with excellence. Unfortunately, prioritizing
spiritual maturity in this process was not the preference. Only later did the pastor realize that the leaders were not discipling their volunteers, nor were they exhibiting Christ-like character. The expectation is that a spiritually mature disciple will exhibit more Christ-like actions.

In the academic setting, the challenge is just as real with two issues of significant concern. First, it is clear that Generation Z has a growing disconnect with faith. Recent Barna Group research indicates a doubling of atheism as well as a passionate pursuit for occupational success over previous generations. That aside, some well-intentioned students are entering college with every desire to serve the Lord. Unfortunately, a desire for spiritual growth is secondary to career success causing a serious disconnect between their lack of biblical knowledge and their goals. They have not developed an attitude toward distinctive Christian thinking. Second, the students will enter the classroom with the assumption that a rigorous academic pursuit will result in all the necessary biblical knowledge and spiritual maturity necessary to lead. The college staff knows these two issues provide a significant hurdle in developing strong spiritual leaders.

All of this leads to a concern for the ministry leader who exhibits good Christian behavior and lacks the spiritual maturity required for disciple making. However, the ministerial leaders are considered great taskmasters.

---

10. Millennials & Generations. Atheism Doubles Among Generation Z and Is Generation Z the Most Success-Oriented Generation? The articles contain recent research results on two different studies by the Barna Group, January 24, 2018, and June 6, 2018, respectively.
Contextual Scope and Limitations

This work is not designed to be an exhaustive research on spiritual formation, but to scrutinize current methodology and to determine the quality of instructional design for implementation at SEU Bayside. The review is to establish a theological foundation for spiritual training not considered to date. However, the report will address key challenges to research in spiritual formation. The presuppositions of this work are grounded in a belief that the God narrative is true. A relational hermeneutic will be the guide. Vital to this project is an understanding of the central theme of Scripture: God’s desire for a loving relationship with the created. This research will presume that a ministry leader possesses a personal faith in God.

This is not a thorough study of Christian spirituality. The Scriptures are the curriculum and the study will demonstrate “an obedience or conformity to Christ that arises out of an inner transformation accomplished through purposive interaction with the grace of God in Christ.”¹¹ Short analytical distinctions within topics of naturalism and supernaturalism will be addressed. The ways of understanding transcendence are another topic for discussion. In short, Christian spirituality encompasses the soul-deep nature of the beliefs, attitudes, and actions that reflect an embedded truth in the heart of a person that results in a behavior referred to as Christlikeness. McGrath stated that Christian spirituality is “the quest for a fulfilled and authentic Christian existence, involving the

¹¹. Willard, 22.
bringing together of the fundamental ideas of Christianity and the whole experience of living on the basis of and within the scope of the Christian faith.”

Some terminology can be confusing; for example, spiritual formation can also mean spiritual maturity or character development. The research here is focused on equipping the ministry leaders to pour into volunteers and coaches (non-paid and entry-level paid employees) to not only carry out their jobs effectively but also to act as examples of the *imago Christi*.

The primary goal is teaching the lessons leading to spiritual maturity. The ministry leader must learn to teach and instruct the lived faith in his or her life. Biblical literacy is about the specific acquisition of biblical knowledge.

**Project Goals and Objectives**

The objective of this project is to develop an effective whole-Bible thematic instructional unit that will substantially improve the spiritual maturity of ministry leaders, which will thereby improve their discipleship efforts. To that end, several questions must be addressed.

**The driving research question:**

How does one effectively and accurately develop a whole-Bible thematic instruction that will result in the development of an *imago Christi* identity for the purpose of disciple making?

Corollary questions:

1. What are the parameters to spiritual formation?
2. Do presuppositions play a role in identity development?
3. How is an identity defined or described?
4. How is an *imago Christi* identity defined?
5. Who are examples of a Christ-like identity?
6. What characteristics make up the Christ-like identity?
7. What biblical mandate or theological bases apply to this project?
8. What is thematic instruction?
9. What is the nature of a whole-Bible thematic methodology?
10. What learning theories apply?
11. What will be a good pre- and post-assessment of knowledge acquisition?

Targeted objectives:

1. The examination of the theological basis for identity as seen in God’s creative *imago Dei* and supernatural transformation to *imago Christi*;
2. The selection of biblical themes leading to the development of a biblical understanding of the God narrative to becoming a Christ-follower;
3. The review of the current viewpoints regarding stages of spiritual formation as well as the spiritual disciplines.

Overview of the instructional unit:

The instructional plan will consist of seven lessons presenting a holistic understanding of God’s covenantal relationship with humankind. The curriculum will be delivered through a lecture/discussion format to 3-5 focus groups consisting of 10-20
ministry leader participants. Each lesson will be 30 minutes in duration and end with a question and answer session. In a workshop approach, each lesson will consist of 3-5 themes critical to understanding the God narrative: “Anyone who listens to my teaching and follows it is wise, like a person who builds a house on solid rock” (Matt. 7:24 NIV). Participants will be expected to demonstrate an understanding of the critical themes as well as provide a connecting-the-dots summary of the God narrative.

Participants will complete an online assessment prior to instruction. Post-instruction assessments will take place once the lessons are completed. In addition, assessments of participants will be scheduled thirty days after instruction and a final assessment will be administered to randomly selected participants in focus groups to determine the transfer of knowledge.
Chapter 2

The Project in Perspective

In this project, the examination of the historical, theological, and sociological roots as well as a cursory philosophical discussion is crucial. Each perspective examined here provides valuable insight to the instructional design chosen. The curriculum being developed for this project is distinctly different from traditional instructional approaches. Before the curricular design is considered, several questions must be addressed. This chapter on disciple making, the teaching and instructing of the believer, begins with an historical overview of closely related issues to include educational theory, Christian education, spiritual formation, and philosophical foundations. Understanding disciple making includes its theological and sociological foundations that will be examined in the second half of this chapter. Ministry leaders are disciple makers.

Historical Perspective
A starting point in developing an instructional design is the consideration of traditional educational approaches implemented by local churches. Christian education, historically, has focused on disciple making through biblical knowledge. Dependent upon the number of congregants, most mainline and non-denominational churches host Sunday schools for elementary-age children as well as programs and classes for middle and high school students and adults. Under the direction of the local church’s educational supervision, the curriculum will be designed or purchased to meet the expectations of the pastor, its governing body, and the denominational doctrines of faith. Other churches, following the guidance of a spiritual director “will work within the structure of the belief system of the faith community.”

In these churches, the taught curriculum focuses on biblical stories or other minutiae and presented according to the age-appropriate learning level of each group. Like compulsory education, the work of educators is in the challenge of determining which information is taught and how much. To this end, a statement by Eavey made over fifty years ago still rings true: “The Bible is a history of salvation, not the history of Christian education.” Horton agreed and said “the term Christian education does not occur in the Bible, the Bible speaks of the moral and spiritual instruction of believers in general and of children in particular.” Gangel emphasizes education’s importance and said, “The early church seriously committed itself to educational ministry.”

---

focus on biblical knowledge. Said another way, the greater issue for Christian education is determining what is taught and how the curriculum is to be taught. Gangel added that the Bible offers “no treatise on learning theory.”\textsuperscript{17} For all teachers, they will necessarily employ deep thinking to develop good instructional planning. However, that will require sufficient knowledge of learning theory. As a result, the challenge in creating an in-house disciple-making curriculum begins with understanding the history of secular and Christian education.

**Five Theories of Learning**

Five theories have markedly influenced education’s lesson planning. Progress in instructional design is an ongoing focus for educational leaders. Every facet of learning theory is being explored. Researchers are asking how people come to know and which instructional methods lead to learning. In addition, researchers must consider the complexity of learning and the impact of social and cultural influences. Some educational researchers have examined the influence of affective preconditions on learning. The results have provided several theoretical approaches to teaching and learning. The five best-regarded educational theories are behaviorism, constructivism, social constructivism, information processing theory, and a consideration of the differentiated learner possessing multiple intelligences.\textsuperscript{18} What follows below is a brief overview of each.

\textsuperscript{17} Ibid., 22.

Behaviorism maintains that human experience causes people to make their choices based on extrinsic rewards, negating magnanimity, and selflessness. In educational settings, learners maximize the pleasure of good grades and minimize the pain of failure. If the teacher will discover what motivates a student and then pair learning to a reward, the learner will be motivated to learn.\textsuperscript{19} Skinner concludes that all of human action is a function of internal causes deeply rooted in personal preferences and with no connection to free will. It is simply a deterministic perspective.\textsuperscript{20} We eat ice cream because it is pleasurable. Learners make choices based on reward and punishment. Compulsory schooling uses grades to reinforce studying and learning that ultimately leads to a good grade reward. Surprisingly, learners are not always cognizant of their internal drive to seek a reward. As an example, a young learner is driven to seek good grades in order to avoid some form of alternative punishment. In college this learner continues to seek good grades because the behaviorist believes her actions are deeply influenced by early childhood training.

The second educational theory, cognitive constructivism, grew out of the work of Jean Piaget. Unlike behaviorism, cognitive constructivism holds that integral to human experience is a significant cognitive process inherent in learning.\textsuperscript{21} The reward is internal and motivates the learner for the sake of learning. Moreover, learning to the cognitive constructivist is a matter of the mind constructing and organizing images from reality. The mind builds a cognitive framework of the perceived reality through experience.

\textsuperscript{19} Graduate School Instructor, 2018.
\textsuperscript{21} Graduate School Instructor, 2018.
In this cognitive process, as the learner engages more experience, she will either assimilate new information into existing mental structures in the mind, or she will build new mental files to accommodate the information.\textsuperscript{22} For this learner, motivation is intrinsic. The impetus for learning is an expanded construction of the mental framework. For teachers, learning is facilitated in an environment that provides for discovery, the expansion of mental structures. Important to note, as the learner grows and matures, the level of cognitive processes is able to handle more complex experiences, adding a greater construction of reality. The teacher focuses on the general, the big picture issues, then the particulars. The specific details presented are based on age-appropriate learners.

As humans grow and mature, so also does the capacity of the mind to process more complex experiences. Piaget describes the species’ capacity to interpret reality through its advancing stages of cognitive development. His theory examines how humans developmentally come to acquire, construct, organize, and use the data. He identifies the improvement resulting from biological maturation. He believes that humans, from childhood, will construct an understanding of the world around them from experiential changes between what they already know and the new discoveries in their environment, and then adjust their ideas accordingly. Further, the acquisition of language is contingent on knowledge and understanding acquired through cognitive development.\textsuperscript{23}

Piaget’s work has been discussed, accepted, challenged, and revised. Interestingly, as a consequence of Piaget publishing his work, Erikson’s research resulted in a developmental theory of his own. To this day it is a widely respected approach that


describes the developmental stages and the inherent paradoxes of socialization influenced by experience across the whole lifespan. For Erikson, the social interactions and relationships played a profound role in the development and growth of human beings.\footnote{24. Encyclopedia Britannica, “Erik Erikson”, accessed February 26, 2019, https://www.britannica.com/biography/Erik-Erikson}


Piaget did not receive as much attention for his moral development theory as he did for his work in cognitive development, but his work did set the stage for Kohlberg’s moral development theory. What we have learned is that the mind’s maturational development as demonstrated through cognitive, psychosocial, and moral development reveals an ever-increasing complexity in human thought processing. The theories reveal a gradual advancing in cognitive processing, an organized and developing process from simple mental operations to more sophisticated levels of critical thinking skills as suggested by Piaget. Pivotal in this discussion of educational theory is understanding how it shapes the learner.

The third learning theory is social constructivism, considered a combination of behaviorism and cognitive constructivism. This learning theory comes from the work of Vygotsky and focuses on social factors in the human learning experience.\footnote{26. Luis Moll, \textit{L. S. Vygotsky and Education} (New York: Routledge Publishing, 2014), 43.} Bandura would later forward a more detailed and research-based social learning theory.\footnote{27. Albert Bandura, \textit{Social Learning Theory} (London: Pearson Publishing, 1976).} Through the cognitive and social contexts, the social learning is reflected: the learner seeks both intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. In short, the learner’s behavior is determined by a
thoughtful analysis of the environment and is rewarded when he duplicates the behavior. In influential social contexts the experience is thoughtfully learned, adding reward for doing so. Consequently, learning together, cooperatively with others, provides the best learning environment both cognitively and socially. Each of these theories contributes to educational design for teachers.

The fourth learning theory is a more recent research development and comes on the heel of computer programming. Yount believes that Edward Tolman is considered by many as the grandfather of information processing theory (IPT). Unfortunately, he wasn’t able to see the value of his work. It wasn’t until the advent of the computer age that significance of his work was realized. The cognitive processes found computerized programming terms like sensory input, short-term and long-term memory as well as terms like stimuli, encoding, retrieving, and maintenance rehearsal, etc. Consequently, deeper levels of metacognition were also part of the IPT discussions.\(^{28}\)

The last theory comes from the work of Gardner and his study of multiple intelligences. Gardner proposed a different perspective on learning and intelligence. His research led him to believe that learning and identity development were more flexible and fluid. His position ran against the tendency to see development processes as rigid. As a result, Gardner’s theory of multiple intelligences maintained that different people learned in different ways. In fact, he identified seven “modalities” of intelligences.\(^{29}\) Each modality differentiates intelligence into attitude, inclination, or temperament rather than seeing intelligence as dominated by a single general ability.


Gardner’s theory is set upon a new definition of what has been referred to as learning styles. Gardner provides a cognitive model that claims there are multiple intelligences or learning preferences. This is the list of the original seven intelligences: musical-rhythmic, visual-spatial, verbal-linguistic, logical-mathematical, bodily-kinesthetic, interpersonal, and intrapersonal. Consideration was given to two additional intelligences later in Gardner’s work, existential and moral. It is interesting that he did not include spiritual, but preferred existential.\(^\text{30}\)

Gardner’s work was well received by academia and public education that until now felt as if each student worked from a single learning modality. Consequently, his work set the stage for educational research to shift its focus from understanding learning styles to differentiated instruction. Educator and researchers began analyzing not only the content taught, but also delivery methods, behavioral management, classroom settings, student attitudes and preconditions, and matching instructional techniques to meet individualized student learning preferences. One of the earliest educational innovators was Madeline C. Hunter, a product of these breakthroughs in educational thinking.

Hunter believed that a critical issue for the classroom teacher was decision making. She maintained that a teacher’s classroom instruction can be placed into one of three categories: first, content issues, what the teacher will teach; second, the teacher’s behaviors, the teacher’s actions that will facilitate and increase a student’s desire to learn; and third, learning behavior issues, how the student learns and how the student demonstrates they have learned. Hunter’s work resulted in the ITIP method. The

instructional design acronym was the instructional theory put into practice that influenced Christian educators as well. The keys to this design are in several steps:

First, the anticipatory set is used to set the student’s mind on instruction. The teacher asks questions or makes a statement to create mental images that initiate the learning process; second, is stating the objectives in order to let the student know what they will need to do and the purpose of the lesson; third, is the instructional input which is the knowledge needed to achieve the objective; fourth, the teacher models how to achieve the objective; fifth, the teacher checks for understanding by asking questions to determine if a concept or process has been learned; sixth, a guided practice in which the student demonstrates successful knowledge or process acquisition with little support for completion; seventh, an independent practice to ensure the student is able to perform the objective without support; and finally, in closing the teacher reviews what has been learned and may connect the next day’s lesson to the end.31

The work of Gardner and Hunter dramatically changed the landscape of public and private educators as well as the educational researchers. New instructional strategies and learning preferences were tested. The best empirical research results led teachers to try new instructional practices and environmental settings providing the motivation to evaluate best practices. The educational research of Marzano, Reeves, and others led to empirical data for determining the best practices. Reeves ask the teachers to change their focus from planning activities to planning outcomes. This paradigm shift places the focus on learning the objectives. Reeves said, “This is the deep work of teaching: designing instruction that takes teachers deep into content and deep into consideration of their students’ learning.”32 Marzano provided teachers and administrators with empirical-based evidence for the classroom and leadership data for school administration. A more

recent work by Marzano provides an in-depth analysis of instructional strategies that represent the current state of knowledge about effective instruction.\(^{33}\)

In another recent work, Brown, Roediger, and McDaniel researched the most promising instructional strategies and spoke to trainers, coaches, and teachers about teaching techniques. The authors, two of the cognitive psychologists and a writer, revealed that some teaching strategies work better than others. Their holistic research includes interviews, measuring the workplace production goals that explain how the strategies work and why. Most of the strategies are familiar and evidence is provided as to why they remain strong instructional methods. The authors’ research recognizes the work of Gardner and Bloom. Even some older techniques were found still very practical, like the Thayer method and storytelling. The objective of this research is to reveal the instructional techniques that make learning stick.\(^{34}\)

Needless to say, the research here has not only influenced public education but also private and parochial education. An educational ministry in the local church must support the ministry leaders in developing more effective methods of equipping the ministry leaders in discipling volunteers and coaches. The review of these theories is not to develop ministry leaders into teachers but to encourage the local church to consider the work being done in applying educational research to leadership preparation. In addition, their research explanations have developed over time morphing from theory into more intricate and practical models. Despite all the advances, a commonality exists in the


perception, interpretation, encoding, and mentally organizing the environmental stimuli.\textsuperscript{35}

All of these have contributed markedly to secular and Christian instructional design. Ministry leaders will only need those research-based results to provide insight in discipling volunteers and staff.

The Learning Experience

Like their secular counterparts, Christian educators utilize these theories in instructional planning.\textsuperscript{36} Any debate within learning theory must include a fundamental discussion focused on the common denominator in each of these theories: the human experience. Experience is the intersection between perceiving, interpretation, and an objective reality. Conversely, perceiving and interpreting the phenomena in reality is the goal of the human experience. Studying the structures in experience, or interpreting them in our consciousness, is referred to as phenomenology.\textsuperscript{37} Making judgments about the phenomena is the process of knowing. Engaging in new learning experiences is a mode of discovery and, according to Piaget, unique learning experiences will add to the schemata, the cognitive mental structures of the mind. As the number of experiences grows, so also do the cognitive structures in significance and complexity. The developing complexity plays a vital role in more complex learning and the project curriculum.

\begin{footnotesize}
35. Yount, 279.
36. Yount, 287
\end{footnotesize}
While the five well-respected theories just discussed, or their morphisms, hold the attention of most researchers, all theories focus on the experience and knowing as vital to learning. In light of this, it is appropriate to consider additional research results noteworthy to learning theory. Yount stated that the experiences in which we come to know could be categorized into seven epistemological ways of knowing. Knowing and subsequent learning can come through tradition, common sense, authority, intuition, and experiential, deductive, or inductive reasoning. Other epistemological research has developed into broad topics of perception, interpretation, and information processing theory. Herrenkohl and Mertl have offered that the interpretive process in learning theory is inextricably interwoven in all facets of life.

Ultimately, educational research is not in agreement about successful outcomes coming from applied learning research. Vaill offered a more ominous perspective on the success of teaching and learning in secular education. He suggests that historic institutional education has ill-prepared the future leaders for the world they inhabit. He understands that learning in all environments must free the mind and spirit.

What the educational psychologist continues to investigate is the minute phenomena on behavioral change. This research has begun to move beyond the models to biological brain research. Carey considers the brain research as important, but doesn’t want to lose sight of the person in the process. The challenge is determining what

---

38. Yount, 38.
42. Carey, 15.
happens in the process of comprehension and interpretation that results in changed behavior and how the interpreter subjectively influences the process.

**Knowing and the Self**

To this point in the chapter, important learning theories have been stressed. The focus is examining specifically how we come to know through experiences, a discipline called epistemology. In epistemology, researchers attempt to ascertain exactly how learners determine what is real and what is not or, in other words, what is true about the environments with which they interact.

An important but brief consideration is the philosophical underpinnings to epistemology. A fundamental issue influencing each theory is the mind-body orientation, a critical presupposition to any discussion about learning. In short, learning theory is anchored in the nature of human beings. Cartesian discussions in the 17th century examined the essence of the mind and body as central to human nature and playing a critical role in the human experience. Descartes presented dualism, a separation of mind and body referred to as the mind-body problem. Shaffer wrote of Descartes’ thoughts that the “body is extended and unthinking; mind is thinking and unextended.” Simply put, the mind and body make up the essence of human beings and are divided. Bishop Berkley nearly a century later refuted successfully that there was no separation of the

---


mind and body, but they were indivisible, meaning they were one. In his treatise on human knowledge, Bishop Berkley presented another perspective. Berkley countered Descartes’ position by presenting a supreme perceiver centered between subjective perceiver and a verifiable perception. Berkley’s inclusion of the third player in the mind-body dichotomy, while not accepted within philosophical academia, unified dualism and became the mind-body-spirit trichotomy. Berkley’s position, contrary to the Cartesian mind-body dualism, became the dominant and widely held approach to understanding the nature of human beings within theological schools.

Biblically, the mind-body-spirit alignment is unique. We only see it once in the New Testament when Paul refers to the alignment in his letter to the Thessalonians, “May God himself, the God of peace, sanctify you through and through. May your whole spirit, soul and body be kept blameless at the coming of our Lord Jesus Christ” (1 Thessalonians 5:23 NIV).

Contemporary learning perspectives have similar explanations regarding the trichotomy. Palmer expanded upon the mind-body-spirit and described the unified trichotomy as self. Palmer stated that the knowing learner possesses an essence that allows for awareness of the self. Palmer stated that “knowing requires a personal relationship between the knower and the known.” The epistemologist points out that the learner-self has the opportunity to interact with the world around him; this process is

47. Parker Palmer, To Know as We Are Known: Education as a Spiritual Journey (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 1993), 11. Palmer is a popular speaker and educator with a focus on a theology of education. He maintains that learning is an experience taking place with the transcendent leading the learner to be re-formed in our original, created image.
48. Ibid., 35.
both learning and relationship. Coming from the cognitive constructivist perspective, Palmer maintained that the knower must recognize a relationship in knowing, that transformation will take place in discovery learning. Knowledge can initiate behavioral change.49

Learning is not a one-way process. Coming to know is a transactional operation between the self and the objective reality outside of the learner. Learning is not only a process in which the objective reality influences the mind; the subjective perceptions within the learner’s interpretive processes will significantly influence the mind. The culmination of these influences produces a self with a worldview or identity. For Palmer, a profound dynamic for educators lies within the learner, an impulse that engages the knower with its perceptions of reality. With each experience, the learners discover something new about themselves and the world around them. They perceive, interpret, and organize the sense data from the reality to be known.50 The atheist Russell is correct in recognizing that the human mind accompanied by its sensory system is bombarded by millions of stimuli moment by moment that will be interpreted and categorized in the mind. From infancy to death, the sensory system processes the sense data in experience. These experiential images become the organized reality.51

This historical perspective in educational theory, its cognitive development, the philosophical foundation, and epistemological analysis reveals a growing body of research to facilitate teacher instruction. The discussions describe the perceptual and interpretive processes. This thesis project is not taking issue with the credibility of the

49. Ibid., 40.
50. Palmer, 29.
works of Piaget, Erikson, or Kohlberg, and others. Their efforts have been profoundly influential in explaining how the mind works. The point here is to take this discussion of the knowing self one step further. As stated, it is through the learner’s interaction with reality and the cognitive processing emerges the self. The significance of self requires elaboration. McMinn poignantly stated that the emerging self “learns to distinguish its nature as separate from the rest of the world.”

Central to any discussion about the self is the need to consider Rogers’ personality theory and its influence on the concept of self. Rogers describes the emergent self as "the organized, consistent set of perceptions and beliefs about oneself." The theory of self focuses on the individualized person. In short, the culmination of each person’s experiences, positive or negative, will result in the emergence of a self. According to Rogers, the fully functioning self is driven to expand and enhance experience, referred to as actualization. Actualization is a process of reaching personal goals and creating within the self a sense of accomplishment despite all obstacles. Actualization develops a self-confidence that emanates from the core of being and creates a firm security in the self. At some point there exists for everyone confusion as the learner discovers conflict in beliefs or other statements. Rogerian theory identifies this incongruence in the maturing self as a disconnection between who one would like to be (ideal self), how one perceives herself (perceived self), and the real self, which is determined through honest introspection. Congruence occurs when the confusion is

54. Rogers, 2.
55. Rogers, 3.
reduced or eliminated through a consistent reasoning process. Unhappiness can occur when the familial experiences, education, socialization, or the stresses of life are not positive; or the incongruence resolved. To attain the fully functioning self requires a self-awareness that can stand in opposition to the negative challenges life presents.

This historical perspective offers the critical research necessary in understanding the self and how the self learns. Important to note is that the research and theories presuppose the neutrality of the self and assume that a wholesome, fully functioning person will emerge, given the right knowledge, positive personal experiences, and appropriate socialization. Hall identifies the concept of self in psychological terms. The self is the culmination of the individual’s interaction with the world. She also implies that the development of self is not innate but learned. Conversely, the ideal self and a person’s self-image can become mutually joined and “shaped via interactions with significant others, i.e. parents, siblings, relatives, peers, teachers, and so on.”

Finally, surprisingly, theists are not the only ones considering mind-body-spirit essence of humankind. Wickett presents a human learning perspective that includes a spiritual self. Clearly, he recognizes that a spiritual element exists and influences learning. He is calling for intellectual honesty because all experiences should be evaluated. The article focuses on the adult learning theory. Wickett breaks from the traditional learning models noting “for those who believe that there is a greater spiritual power in the universe, the spiritual must be considered as we review any aspect of human

58. Ibid., 157.
experience of the world, including learning.” Further, Wickett undermines any esoteric religious discussion by stating “the historical approach to spirituality has led us to see this as valuable whether it occurs in a monastic or societal context.”

In summary, a review of educational theory and the realization of self were presented as a background and support for ministry leaders to understand the developmental history of human learning. The research discussed provides an overview to how secular research has developed to its current theoretical approach. This review then shifted from the broader perspective to the individual learner and a focus on experience and knowing, determining that human interaction with reality and experience require some thoughtful assessment. Of profound importance, the mind-body discussion led to a unity of mind, body, and spirit that eventually describes the self. Additionally, the work of Wickett, Palmer, and others claim a spiritual essence in learning. In the final analysis, inclusion of the spiritual experience in learning will play a critical role in the way in which Christian education is conducted. Humanistic education teaches the mindfulness of the self, while Christian education teaches the spiritual essence of the self.

Presuppositions

The goal in the previous section was to reveal the complexities of major learning theories, human experience, the learning process, and the emergence of self as a learner, all of which must be considered when developing a curriculum. The next discussion

59. Ibid., 162.
60. Ibid., 163.
focuses on what humans believe about their existence, which is crucial to the project curriculum.

When considering the nature of existence, there are two groups of people in this world that maintain fundamentally different presuppositions regarding the world around them and what can be known about it. The first group believes only what they can know through proof. To them, there is nothing existing beyond what can be proven to be true.\(^6\) This naturalist believes in what can be known and is commonly referred to as existentialism. Within this approach the scientific method is the crucible for knowing what is true. The method seeks the facts. It gathers evidence, proposes possible connections between the facts and phenomenon, then it works to prove how the idea does or does not manifest itself in reality. In short, the existentialist must \emph{know in order to believe}.

The other group is referred to as supernaturalists because they believe that it is possible for something to exist beyond man’s capacity to prove it through the scientific method. The supernaturalist believes there is something beyond what can be proven by scientific man. For instance, because of the beautiful and orderly nature of the universe, there must be a grand designer. The God-followers believe that God has revealed himself through his beautiful design and his revealed truth, the Word. More importantly, followers believe they can experience supernaturally their relationship with God. Moreover, the God-follower can experience God intervening in their lives.

Interestingly, the supernaturalist often agrees with the existentialist conclusions. Supernaturalists believe much of what has been proven but also believe that just because

something isn’t proven does not mean it is not true. However, it is critical that the proof fits within the realm of what they believe and know. Consequently, the supernaturalist holds that one must first believe in order to know. The supernaturalist presupposition is important because of the nature of the truth that is being presented in the project curriculum.

Believing what is true is critically important to humankind and understanding significance in the face of objective reality. Being right about what one knows or believes is critically important to their existence. From the wise proverb it reads, “A person may think their own ways are right, but the Lord weighs the heart.” (Pro. 21:2 NIV). The Hebrew יָעַן (‘ayin) can be expressed as the right-thinker to be an inclination or as one thinks best in his heart as right or considered the equivalent to opinion and judgment. However, that translation must be understood in opposition to the usage found in Proverbs 12:15 regarding right-thinkers which reads “The way of fools seems right to them, but the wise listen to advice.” Discerning the rightness of action in objective reality in order to substantiate being right is humanity’s greatest challenge and results in destruction or eternal life. Making a commitment to a belief about reality can produce a perspective that is mutually exclusive of other evidence. In that verse was a reminder on what a person believes to be right, only God really knows.

For a Christian, depending on their level of spiritual maturity, it can have eternal consequences as they learn to “Trust in the Lord with all your heart and lean not on your own understanding; in all your ways submit to him, and he will make your paths straight” (Pro. 3:5-6 NIV). As it reads, in all your ways, includes thinking in submission to God’s

62. TWOT, 1612a.
guidance that provides the only way to being right-thinkers. Understanding בִּינָה (biynâh) renders the Hebrew as insight or discernment of truth\(^63\) and considered a deeper level than תָּבוּן (tâbûwn). The accumulation of experiences provides a keen insight regarding the presuppositions but truth must be discerned and coherent with everything else a person believes. Driving this point about truth home, Pannenberg states

> whatever we take as true in experiential immediacy may be challenged. All momentary certainty stands in need of further confirmations and interpretation, and it is only by reference to the unity of all our experience and our knowledge that we can determine what is true. Coherence provides the final criterion for truth, and it can serve as such criterion because it also belongs to the nature of truth: Whatever is true must finally be consistent with all other truth, so that truth is only one, but all-embracing, closely related to the concept of the one God.\(^64\)

A ministry leader must be able to understand and teach this coherence regarding truth.

**Biblical Levels of Learning**

A Christian learner must begin with the assumption that biblical principles are to be believed. Spiritual formation is contingent upon this presupposition. If teaching is taking place, then spiritual formation will follow. There is a progressive process that reflects the work of Jesus teaching his followers. The followers should become a reflection of the teacher, “The student is not above the teacher, but everyone who is fully trained will be like their teacher” (Luke 6:40 NIV). In this instance, fully trained is καταρτίζω (katartízō) which means to mend, repair what has been broken to the extent that it is able to strengthen, perfect, complete, and make one what he ought to be\(^65\). Jesus

---

63. TWOT, 239b.
clearly states that learning from the teacher will repair what is broken to become what he ought to be. More importantly, Jesus is making the point, once fully trained, they become like the teacher. That the volunteer will become like the ministry leader if they will take the time to “fully” teach and equip. Ultimately, the goal is the learner will comprehend what is being taught and moreover, the comprehension will permeate the heart of the learner resulting in modified behavior.

The Scriptures speak of learning in three ways. The most common level is that of knowledge, or in this case, biblical knowledge. “The fear of the Lord is the beginning of knowledge, דַּﬠַת (da’ath), but fools despise wisdom and instruction.” (Pro. 1:7 NIV) The Theological Wordbook of the Old Testament (TWOT) depicts this as a wise and cunning knowledge. Simply put, to reverence God requires knowledge of God’s Word. The second level of learning is understanding and clearly possesses a different meaning than specific knowledge or wisdom as seen in this verse. “My mouth will speak words of wisdom; the meditation of my heart will give you understanding” (Psalm 49:3 NIV). This is the most common usage of understanding, תָּבוּן (tâbûwn), which implies intelligence or insight that is considered of godly discernment. Proverbs contains several verses that distinguish understanding from wisdom, such as verse 19:8, “The one who gets wisdom loves life; the one who cherishes understanding will soon prosper.” This is clearly indicating a different level of learning, suggesting a progressive process in spiritual formation. Another verse in Proverbs with the same distinction is 4:5, “Get wisdom, get understanding; do not forget my words or turn away from them.”

66. TWOT, 848c.
67. TWOT, 239c.
Finally, the third level is wisdom. “Wisdom is found on the lips of the discerning, but a rod is for the back of one who has no sense” (Pro. 10:13 NIV). Or, in another verse, “I instruct you in the way of wisdom and lead you along straight paths. When you walk, your steps will not be hampered; when you run, you will not stumble” (Pro. 4:11-12 NIV), which implies that wisdom results from knowledge and understanding. In each instance, the noun wisdom is translated from חֲכָמָה (chokmâh); wisdom of shrewdness and a greater sense of God. Paul highlights this third level of learning in writing to the Church at Colossae. Wisdom provides the ability to discern truth.

2 My goal is that they may be encouraged in heart and united in love, so that they may have the full riches of complete understanding, in order that they may know the mystery of God, namely, Christ, 3 in whom are hidden all the treasures of wisdom and knowledge. 4 I tell you this so that no one may deceive you by fine-sounding arguments. (Col. 2:2-4 NIV)

Yount said that, “the Lord leads us beyond understanding into wisdom.” In the same way and as the lessons are developed, the project curriculum will be presented with a wisdom level of learning in mind.

Theological and Biblical Dimensions

Scripture is the revelation of a self-disclosing God. It is the community of faith that uses it to communicate the narrative about its God. In His revelation, that community maintained oral and written traditions about the historical events in which God reveals

68. TWOT, 647a.
Himself. Interestingly, the themes of these ageless stories still ring true in the lives of its believers today. Bratcher said in agreement “the Scriptures reflect this dynamic of the ‘story of God’ woven into the life of the community of faith through the centuries.”

Ministry leaders are responsible to carry on the story of God. To do so is to matheteuo, to teach and instruct. The influence of the story exists in the Christian education or discipleship ministry curriculum. In Matthew 28:19 is the Great Commission:

Go therefore and make disciples of all the nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father and the Son and the Holy Spirit.

How the local church interprets the Great Commission, Jesus' final instruction, in Matthew, Jesus' final instruction, determines how local discipleship is to be conducted. Either the Church will be a task-oriented group of workers building toward the weekend service, or the Church will be filled with Christ-followers joyfully engaged in Christian education and discipleship. The emphasis of matheteuo is not to make disciples but to instruct and teach. Inherent in the making are three parts. The first is the learning of biblical principles, and the second is discipling a Christian. The third piece substantially belongs to the interaction between the individual and the Holy Spirit. This biblical view of disciple-making is a process of transformation led by disciples. Consequently, the teaching and/or instruction involves a complex set of issues necessary for ministry leaders to pour into volunteers. Examining these inherent issues in disciple development

is paramount to creating the educational curriculum for this project. Not only is it critical to the neo-disciple, but it is firstly essential that the ministry leader understands how to pour the nature of this relationship into the volunteer. It is the ministry leader who reflects the relational approach of Jesus and then shares the God narrative while making frequent comparison to living a life of worship. This must be accomplished relationally while building on Scripture. Therefore, the following theological themes: identity, thematic and relational theology, covenants, and heart transformation will be in the lessons presented to the ministry leaders. A summary will include an overview of the project curriculum based on the insight found here.

The *Imago Dei* Identity

A ministry leader, in discipling their volunteers and coaches, must include a clear understanding of the *imago Dei*. As well, conveying the *imago Dei* must be a crucial part of the project curriculum. In addition, any conversation regarding *imago Dei* must include the specific terms regarding image and likeness. It all begins in Genesis 1:26, “Then God said, ‘Let us make mankind in our image, צֶלֶם (an image or resemblance), in our likeness, דְּמוּת (a similitude or model), so that they may rule over the fish in the sea and the birds in the sky, over the livestock and all the wild animals, and over all the creatures that move along the ground.’” Estep and Kim distinguish *tselem* as a physical representation and *demuth* as a state of bearing a

---

72. TWOT, 1923a.
73. TWOT, 437a.
similarity to the original.\textsuperscript{74} Anthony Hoekema maintained that the words are so close in usage that they are nearly interchangeable.\textsuperscript{75}

Hoekema adds a universal characteristic of creatureliness to all animals and the Created stated, “In sum, the human being is both creature and a person…”\textsuperscript{76} In addition, he identifies this seeming paradox of both creature and person as the critical enigma of the Created. Anderson agrees and refers to the humanity as creatureliness but states that human is differentiated from non-human.\textsuperscript{77} Estep and Kim have identified four different perspectives of \textit{imago Dei}. They include the substantive view, functional perspective, relational view, and teleological perspective. Each one focuses on a specific aspect of the \textit{imago Dei}.\textsuperscript{78}

The Created are formed in their “\textit{image and likeness to God}”. Profoundly important here is that God’s creatures are completely dependent on Him but humanity maintains a relative independence.\textsuperscript{79} The spirit emerges from God’s effort to breathe, \textit{nâphach}\textsuperscript{80} His spirit, into the nostrils \textit{’aph}\textsuperscript{81} of the Created (Gen 2:7 NIV); his breathe of life, translated \textit{neshama}\textsuperscript{82} \textit{n’shâmâh} (\textit{chay})\textsuperscript{83}. God not only breathed life \textit{hay} into the male, but also His spirit of wisdom \textit{neshama}. This breath is clearly different from that of the animals that God also created but temporarily

\textsuperscript{76} Hoekema, 6.
\textsuperscript{78} Estep and Kim, 18.
\textsuperscript{79} Hoekema, 6.
\textsuperscript{80} R. Laird Harris, Gleason Archer, and Bruce Waltke, \textit{The Theological Wordbook of the Old Testament (TWOT)} (Chicago: Mood Press, 1980), 1390.
\textsuperscript{81} TWOT, 133a.
\textsuperscript{82} TWOT, 1433a.
\textsuperscript{83} TWOT, 644a.
considered a companion to the male. Jamieson, Fausset, and Brown also maintain that this is a powerful passage that highlights the Created’s earthly dominance. This is also found in the Targums of Jonathan and Oneklos, authors of the Targum Oneklos and is mentioned several times in the Talmud; both agreeing that the words of God succinctly distinguish animal from Adam, one who possesses the breath of God.\footnote{84. Jamieson, Fausset, and Brown. V.1, 35.}

Whether a ministry leader understands the mind-body hurdle as a crucial issue is not important. What is important is to discern someone who possesses a worldview that does not include the spirit. The critical starting point in the first biblical theme to be considered is that of the \textit{imago Dei}, the Created’s identity. A critical distinction must be made when discussing the nature of the Created. This examination of the \textit{imago Dei} must review several matters prior to moving forward. First, and most critical, is the status of the image bearers. It is clear that the creation story reveals that a God who is Love loves the Created and they are objects of His love because they are in his image.\footnote{85. Steven Harper, “The Asbury Theological Journal” \textit{Old Testament Spirituality} (1987) Vol. 42, No. 2, 63-77.} Second, as bearers of God’s image, the Created are endowed in their nature with specific qualities. God begins with the forming but also provides His critical life-giving breath (Gen. 2:7 NIV).

With the new essence, the Created are able to determine the aesthetics of beauty, whether it is within something good or bad for them, “When the woman saw that the fruit of the tree was good for food and pleasing to the eye… “ (Gen. 3:6a NIV). They have the cognitive capacity to identify the “stuff” around them including naming the animals.

Now the Lord God had formed out of the ground all the wild animals and all the birds in the sky. He brought them to the man to see what he would name “them; and whatever the man called living creatures,
that was its name (Gen. 2:19 NIV).

They are instructed to care for the garden, “The Lord God took the man and put him in the Garden of Eden to work it and take care of it” (Gen. 2:15 NIV). According to Harper, humanity is given authority and dominion over the animals and the land.86

Then God said, “I give you every seed-bearing plant on the face of the whole earth and every tree that has fruit with seed in it. They will be yours for food. 30 And to all the beasts of the earth and all the birds in the sky and all the creatures that move along the ground—everything that has the breath of life in it—I give every green plant for food.” And it was so.” (Gen. 1:29-30 NIV)

It can be agreed that with each creative step, the Creator reveals a profound commitment to the Created. It can also be agreed that this relational love is central to Christlikeness. Powell recognizes the creatureliness and that man can rise above it.

Genesis is telling us that who we are—our most fundamental nature—is determined by God’s creative act, and in this act, something of God passes over into human nature. But it tells us also that in creating human beings, God makes creatures responsible to God. We must answer to God for the use of the dominion we have received. We should use our intellect and will in ways that honor the God whom they reflect. We are to be holy as God is holy. Our resemblance to God establishes a moral demand; our relation to God is a relation not only of likeness but also of responsibility.87

Harper is succinct and reminds us that humanity are the bearers of His image, which carries with it a moral and dominion responsibility.88

In the same way that God endowed his Created with his image, so also did the apostle Paul implore the church to exhibit the new nature, “…[having] put on the new self, which is being renewed in the knowledge in the image of its Creator” (Col. 3:10 NIV). Paul indicates a clear and obvious connection of the old self with the new self as

86. Harper, 68.
being foundational to the work of the Creator God. Paul recognizes the connection and the godly characteristics that must now become a part of the believer’s life.

12 Therefore, as God’s chosen people, holy and dearly loved, clothe yourselves with compassion, kindness, humility, gentleness, and patience. 13 Bear with each other and forgive one another if any of you have a grievance against someone. Forgive as the Lord forgave you. 14 And over all these virtues put on love, which binds them all together in perfect unity. (Col. 3:12-14 NIV)

Christians and ministry leaders are saddled with the goal to raise up new believers to be an outward and inward reflection of Christ. The resemblance of the image-bearer was corrupted or distorted as a result of the rebellion. Living a life of worship means that a ministry leader will consistently and vigorously announce their identity in Christ. Moreover, they are expected to raise up their staff and volunteers in ownership of this Christlikeness and its intimate relationship. The project curriculum will include an emphasis on the critical nature of the *imago Dei* essence in presenting the God story.

A Relational Hermeneutic

It is the setting of this Creator and the Created that gives attention to a God that has a relationship in mind as well as relational boundaries and responsibility. It is a hermeneutical perspective that guides the understanding regarding humankind’s relationship with God. God has a plan as he begins his creation process. It isn’t expected that the ministry leader would become a theologian. However, it is expected that they embrace their godly relationship with a passion and own their Christian identity. As a result of this identity, they should be able to share it with the volunteers and coaches.

With the end in mind, He envisions a relationship with the Created. His plan centers on creating human beings, male and female. They will be in His likeness. To
prepare, God uses five days to hang stars, planets, and a moon for evening lighting; a warm sun for day lighting; he plants flowers with sweet aromas to fill the air; he grows trees and shrubs for a beautiful, life-giving ambience; he creates birds for delightful music; and places rivers for the soothing sounds of a babbling brook. All of this is accomplished for Day Six! On Day Six, He introduces the Created to this magnificent creation. It is a unique and utterly unimaginable environment for the Created with their *imago Dei* identity (Gen. 1:1-2:25 NIV). We know God enjoys the created environment, “…the man and his wife heard the sound of the Lord God as he was walking in the garden in the cool of the day” (Gen. 3:8a NIV). Undoubtedly, this was created to be a paradise for the three of them to commune and enjoy a loving and everlasting relationship.

It cannot be disputed that the Created were designed for a relationship. Harper comes to the same conclusion saying, “Therefore, the task which should consume our time and energy is the cultivation of our relationship with God through Christ to its maximum potential.”89 It was accomplished. In all creation, science research, and scientific investigation, a firm time for Adam and Eve’s duration in the garden has not been determined. We can only guess they had dominion for a long time, and it included a relational boundary and set the stage for understanding the nature of God’s covenantal relationship.

The Lord God took the man and put him in the Garden of Eden to work it and take care of it. 16 And the Lord God commanded the man, “You are free to eat from any tree in the garden;17 but you must not eat from the tree of the knowledge of good and evil, for when you eat from it, you will certainly die.” (Gen. 2:15-17 NIV)

89. Harper, 70.
Paramount at this point for the Created is accepting the burden of God’s image. The *imago Dei* identity makes them distinct. They are able to aesthetically appreciate beauty, accomplish meaningful work, be creative in naming animals, and more importantly, enjoy an intimacy with one another.\(^90\) The burden of the image-bearer possesses a freedom and responsibility that must be accepted by choice.\(^91\) Anderson held that despite the creatureliness, human beings are differentiated from creatures in their response to Scripture.\(^92\) The identity also provides dignity. McMinn affirmed the truth of their identity, “Christians believe the source of human dignity comes from God…”\(^93\) It is the ministry leader that must share this truth with each volunteer. The vital praxis of the ministry leader is leading the volunteer or coach to a deeper relationship with God, moreover, encouraging the team member to develop a godly identity. The *imago Dei* ministry leader must demonstrate a life that reflects the embedded truth of God’s presence in their journey.

The believers’ identity as image bearers plays a crucial role in their spiritual formation. When asked what was the most important commandment, Jesus responded, “Love the Lord your God with all your heart and with all your soul and with all your mind” (Matt. 22:37 NIV). It is important to note that this encouragement was for both the new and old covenants. Moses implored the people of God, “Hear, O Israel: The Lord our God, the Lord is one. Love the Lord your God with all your heart and with all your soul and with all your strength” (Deut. 6:4-5 NIV).

\(^{91}\) Richards, 73.
\(^{92}\) Anderson, 35.
Before going on, a word about the verses from Matthew and Deuteronomy must be said because the relationship between God and the follower was different due to the role of the Holy Spirit. Under the Abrahamic covenant, the believer focused on biblical knowledge and managed their outward behavior to comply with the perception of holiness. The Ten Commandments and the 650 clarifying and applicable laws were designed to govern the behavior of His people. One was spiritual or holy if the law was kept. Boys were taught from a young age to memorize the Torah as well as apply the scriptural principles to their behaviors. It was more difficult for the untaught females. In some situations, God poured out his Spirit on those he needed for service or leadership, mostly his kings and prophets. Anointing by the Spirit of God was given to a few.

The new covenant included an alternative emphasis by God. With each believer’s prayer of confession, repentance was sealed by the Holy Spirit for those who confirmed a belief in the work of Christ on the cross. In full submission to God, a new covenant believer was filled with the Holy Spirit as a sign of covenant participation. As a result, developing an intimate and personal relationship with God is available to anyone stating a believer’s prayer of faith, not so for old covenant believers. The change being driven by a new covenant membership was made real to Nicodemus when Jesus informed him of the need to be born again, clearly revealing a different spiritual growth process. Jesus reveals this transformational process in a sobering parable regarding their hearts, “Woe to you, teachers of the law and Pharisees, you hypocrites! You clean the outside of the cup and dish, but inside they are full of greed and self-indulgence. Blind Pharisee! First, clean the inside of the cup and dish, and then the outside will also be clean” (Matt. 23:25-26 NIV). It is a spiritual rebirth that starts on the inside and changes the outward behavior. In
short, the distorted *imago Dei* identity is relatively restored through the heart change found in *imago Christi* (1 Cor. 15:52-53 NIV).

Within the relational hermeneutic is a communication element. There are three examples of this supernatural communication between God and His people revealing a unique relationship. First, Jesus instructs the disciples not to worry about going before any authority because “the Holy Spirit will teach you at that time what you should say” (Luke 12:11-12 NIV). Second, in those precious moments while promising the arrival of the Holy Spirit, Jesus instructs them regarding a supernatural communication that will take place to help them and, “…will teach you all things and will remind you of everything I have said to you” (John 14:26 NIV).

In a third example, is private and personal communication between Jesus, Peter, and God. The evidence of this interaction is found in Matthew’s account of the conversation between Jesus and Peter. This conversation reveals a communication process that exists between God and his people suggesting that God communicates with his believer.

When Jesus came to the region of Caesarea Philippi, he asked his disciples, “Who do people say the Son of Man is?” 14 They replied, “Some say John the Baptist; others say Elijah; and still others, Jeremiah or one of the prophets.” 15 “But what about you?” he asked. “Who do you say I am?” 16 Simon Peter answered, “You are the Messiah, the Son of the living God.” 17 Jesus replied, “Blessed are you, Simon son of Jonah, for this was not revealed to you by flesh and blood, but by my Father in heaven. 18 And I tell you that you are Peter and on this rock, I will build my church, and the gates of Hades will not overcome it.” (Matthew 16:13-18 NIV)

These communications reveal a highly relational hermeneutic that is only possible with a loving God and a submitted believer. The Greek here is ἀποκαλύπτω (apokalýptō)
and means to uncover or lay open what was veiled. It was important enough that Jesus instructed those present not to tell anyone what Peter said.⁹⁴

This revelation led the German theologian Oepke to his contribution in the TDNT that would undermine humanity’s ability to use knowledge properly, “Human knowledge is a hindrance rather than an advantage for the reception of this knowledge which is from God.”⁹⁵ Oepke words are strengthened through the psalm, “It is better to take refuge in the Lord than to trust in man” (Psalm 118:8 NIV).

Finally, there is an inherent theme throughout Scripture that humanity is made whole as a result of becoming God’s people. Brown, et al. understood Paul’s letter to the Thessalonians presented a wholeness, “²³ May God himself, the God of peace, sanctify you through and through. May your whole spirit, soul and body be kept blameless at the coming of our Lord Jesus Christ. ²⁴ The one who calls you is faithful, and he will do it as a form of holiness” (1 Thess. 5:23 NIV). Brown stated that “…here the intersection of a number of biblical motifs that helpfully inform our discussion of human wholeness: peace, holiness, completeness, and blamelessness.⁹⁶ In the project curriculum, the curriculum will note the supernatural nature of a word of knowledge and word of wisdom as a heavenly download.

---

⁹⁵. Ibid., 581.
The Heart and Transformation

Ministry leaders must be heart surgeons. They must be able to discern the difference between a Christ-like identity, *imago Christi*, and an existential worldview. The ministry leader must desire to conform to the image of Christ, the *imago Christi*, as instructed by Paul, “…to be conformed to the likeness of His son” (Romans 8:29 NIV). Hoekema taught “that our the goal of our redemption in Christ is to make us more and more like God, or more and more like Christ who is the perfect image of God.”97

The project curriculum will equip ministry leaders with the ability to provide guidance for team members in developing a self-analysis of their own guiding principles to see if they are of the true faith. The apostle Paul alluded to this necessary process to determine if the follower’s identity is Christ-like, “Examine yourselves to see whether you are in the faith; test yourselves. Do you not realize that Christ Jesus is in you—unless, of course, you fail the test?” (2 Cor. 13:5 NIV). This is a critical statement and concludes with, “…if you fail the test.” In a humanistic worldview, this is referred to as being of the world; however, the encouragement is to live as Christ-followers in the world.

Jesus made it clear to the Hebrews that the love of the law required a new perspective. A change of perspective was now a law of love that required a new heart. This would be a challenge for the Hebrews who understood the problematic nature of the heart. Jeremiah reveals a stark reality about the heart, “The heart is deceitful above all things and beyond cure. Who can understand it?” (Jer. 7:9 NIV). However, the Hebrews recognized and are encouraged by another perspective in Proverbs, “Above all else,

97. Hoekema, 28.
guard your heart, for it is the wellspring of life” (Pro. 4:23 NIV). Considering their elaborate law writing, it is evident the Pharisees’ concern for the heart’s wickedness is clear and must be controlled by them.

Jesus, in his mission to teach love and forgiveness, didn’t ignore the essence of the heart. Mark records a striking statement. Jesus, revealing some frustration, has just interpreted another parable for the disciples because they don’t get it. He lets them know that defilement comes from within. “For it is from within, out of a person’s heart, that evil thoughts come—sexual immorality, theft, murder, adultery, greed, malice, deceit, lewdness, envy, slander, arrogance and folly. All these evils come from inside and defile a person” (Mk 7:21-23 NIV). Waltke stated, “This direction or bent of the heart [wise, pure or perverse] determines its decisions and thus a person’s actions…. Since the heart is the center of all of a person’s emotional-intellectual-religious-moral activity, it must be safeguarded above all things.”

The contrast is clear and the differences succinct. Jesus was driving the point home about a godly transformation that begins within and results in new outward behavior. Issler is in agreement that, “Jesus teaching about the centrality of the inner heart formation is really not new information. It is an amplification of what was already taught in the Old Testament…”

In the Old Testament, heart לֵבָב lebab in its most consistent usage refers to the “richest biblical term for the totality of man’s inner nature or immaterial self.” For the Old Testament man, it can include that place of deep thought and understanding about the

---

relationship with God. In the New Testament, *heart* καρδία translates to the innermost man and is very similar to its Hebrew counterpart. The heart is the seat of rational functions and an understanding given by God.\textsuperscript{101} It is in the heart where the transformation begins when Jesus refers to being born again. It is from here that the ministry leader disciples her volunteer.

**Old to New Covenant Transition**

The ministry leader’s work of discipling people in their area of responsibility is more than presenting four spiritual laws, a pondering question about one’s eternal standing, or an assignment of tasks with a quick prayer for the day. The impetus for this project initially began as a search for a new leadership model. Instead, it was determined from the intensive interview research that the spiritual maturity of the volunteers and coaches was the significant concern. The obvious question is why the volunteers and coaches do not display the maturity expected. If this is the case, why are the ministry leaders ill-prepared to grow their staff? Coleman revealed the same concern in saying that “objective and relevance—these are the crucial issues of our work…. Merely because we are busy, or even skilled, doing something does not mean necessarily that we are getting anything accomplished. The question must always be asked: Is it worth doing? And does it get the job done?”\textsuperscript{102} Consequently, the consensus is that disciple making is crucial to the larger Church, but recognizing a critical transition will also influence the instructional design.


Murray captured the transition sought for this research. It is a transition developed that provides a profound theological shift. He succinctly addressed the new perspective.

The central demand of the Old Covenant, “Obey my voice, and I will be your God” (Jer. 7:23), has now been met. With the law written on the heart, He can be our God, and we will be his people. Perfect harmony with God’s will and holiness in heart and life is the only thing that can satisfy God’s heart or ours. This is what the New Covenant gives in divine power. “I will give them a heart to know me…and they shall be my people, and I will be their God: for they shall return unto me with their whole heart.” (Jer. 24:7)

The new covenant life hinges on the state of the new heart given by God.¹⁰³

This investigation is specifically focused on the teaching and instruction methodology employed by ministry leaders in the process of pouring into their volunteers and potential coaches. An instructional approach must focus on the biblical basis in its design. The critical prerequisite issue identified by Murray is the new heart given to the disciple. Murray goes on to say that God has planted a new heart, a love of God’s law, a readiness to obey, and to do His will even if you don’t know it yet, as being your heart’s desire.¹⁰⁴ Also, the apostle Paul reveals a new heart and understanding in these passages:

²¹ Now it is God who makes us to stand firm in Christ. He anointed us,
²² set his seal of ownership on us, and put his Spirit in our hearts as a deposit, guaranteeing what is to come. (2 Cor. 1:21-22 NIV)

You show that you are a letter from Christ, the result of our ministry, written not with ink but with the Spirit of the living God, not on tablets of stone but on tablets of human hearts. (2 Cor. 3:3 NIV)

⁹ For this reason, since the day we heard about you, we have not stopped praying for you. We continually ask God to fill you with the knowledge of his will through all the wisdom and understanding that the Spirit gives, (Col. 1:9 NIV)

² My goal is that they may be encouraged in heart and united in love,

¹⁰³ Andrew Murray, Covenants and Blessings (New Kensington, PA: Whitaker House, 1984), 35
¹⁰⁴ Ibid., 150.
so that they may have the full riches of complete understanding, in order that they may know the mystery of God, namely, Christ, in whom are hidden all the treasures of wisdom and knowledge. (Col. 2:2-3 NIV)

In these selections, the word wisdom is translated as the deepest comprehension of knowing σύνεσις (syνεσις) from a mental putting together or intelligence. It is another stage of intelligence, the ability to figure out what it means to evaluate knowledge. It is with a heart cut for God in the covenant that this understanding results in a deepened wisdom.

There is a critical motif that is obvious as we move from the old covenant to the new covenant. The new covenant is driving home the necessity for Christ-followers to be transformed. It is equally important that, as the people of God, we share that relationship with others. Bloesch captured this transition; “The striking contrast between religion and faith is brought to light by comparing the tower of Babel and the cross of Christ. The first epitomizes humanity’s search for God, the second God’s search for a lost humanity.”

It is vital that the project curriculum includes this critical point, and, more importantly, for the ministry leader to convey this relationship building thought.

Christian Thinking

A critical consideration in learning to become a Christ-like people is to present a people of God as a Christian culture. Many in higher learning are making strides in defining how biblical thinking should look for Christians. Dockery stated “we need more

than just new ideas and enhanced programs for our churches and our institutions; we need distinctively Christian thinking, the kind of tough-minded thinking that results in culture-engaging living.”106 Dockery’s work in higher education is motivated by the need for Christians to be driven by a knowledge that understands the necessity for Christian leadership to reflect distinctive Christian thinking, with the goal “to meditate on the unity of knowledge as a seamless whole…a single universe of knowledge.”107 The suggestion here is the value of a mind being under the guidance of holistic truth to live and lead others. Dockery’s goal is to ensure that Christian education, whether delivered through discipleship or higher learning, should teach and instruct. Christian thinking and behavior will lead the next generation. It should also be the local church’s goal.

Development of a leadership curriculum to accomplish this must be the highest priority. The instructional approach proposed in this study is from Scripture and is seamless and whole—a holistic methodology. Therefore, the instruction will be a Bible-encompassing thematic instruction anchored in God’s Scripture. It must be a taught curriculum that prepares a learner to be a leader, and then, in turn, the leader to teach other learners. Unlike secular education that is in bondage to empirical interaction in its impersonal world, the imago Christi must reach beyond the natural to understand and rely on the supernatural. Palmer wrote that a real education “prepares us to see beyond appearances into the hidden realities of life—beyond facts into truth, beyond self-interest into compassion, beyond our flagging energies and nagging despairs into the love required to renew the community of creation.”108

107. Ibid., 5.
Jesus was the master teacher. Understanding the importance Jesus placed on teaching his listeners is essential. He gathered twelve young men and added to their required Hebrew training in their youth. Each disciple, save one, accepted that Jesus was the fulfillment of the Prophets. His first teaching was the Sermon on the Mount. He followed that teaching with several examples of the application as to how we are to understand God’s Word. It was no longer a law but a way to worship God in one’s daily walk with him.

After Jesus was done with this teaching, it was heard in the crowd that he taught with authority. However, this isn’t considered a type of governmental or law enforcement authority. Authority in Greek is *exousia*, meaning one with right or permission given by God.\(^{109}\) In this usage, the word authority means giving rights over to something. In this case, that something is a clarification of God’s Word and the fulfillment is at hand. Jesus has the right to reveal the legal nature of God’s Word and make it a message that dramatically influences the hearts of men and women. Philo, a first-century Jewish philosopher, maintained that Jesus had permission and freedom given by God.\(^{110}\) His teaching powerfully altered what they had learned or knew, Hebrew and Gentile alike.

The objective of this instruction will be to impart the same sense of holistic understanding to participants of their God-initiated relationship, with the goal of ministry leaders pouring into volunteers.

---

110. Ibid., 564.
Attributes of Spiritual Formation

It is important to have a quick summary of the previous section so as to set the stage for the discussion regarding deepening one’s spiritual formation. Ministry leaders must understand their identity in the *imago Dei*. As an image bearer, the ministry leader must have a deepened relationship with God and be able to describe their heart transformation through Him. It is crucial for the ministry leaders to be able to share the God story in its movement from old to new covenants. All of these areas are integral to the ministry leader’s ability to develop an equipping relationship with volunteers. This discussion now seeks biblical insight as to how a person grows personally in his or her relationship with God as well as how to pour into others to encourage them to deepen their relationship with God. Consequently, the discussion must now consider the ministry leader teaching the volunteer steps to grow closer in relationship to God as well as the transformation, and what prompts the transformation, notwithstanding the work of the Holy Spirit.

Koch and McNaughton have identified seven attributes that a follower should seek. Moreover, there is a biblical reference to the elements of each attribute. The authors maintained these attributes facilitated spiritual formation within each follower, leading to transformation of the heart. Prior to the examination of each attribute, the authors maintain there is a prerequisite step. The decision is to be reborn through receiving and believing that Christ is first priority.111

Making the choice to believe more poignant are the next three verses. “And without faith, it is impossible to please God because anyone who comes to him must believe that he exists and that he rewards those who earnestly seek him” (Heb. 11:6 NIV). The Greek for “earnestly seeking Him” is ἐκζητέω (ekzētēō), which translates to “crave, demand or to search.”112 The second verse comes from Hebrews as well: “Let us draw near to God with a sincere heart and with the full assurance that faith brings, having our hearts sprinkled to cleanse us from a guilty conscience…”113 (Heb. 10:22 NIV). To draw near to God with a sincere heart ἀληθινός (alēthinós) means a true nature and not one that is not a counterfeit or concealed heart. The emphasis here is clear. Entering a relationship with God through Jesus comes at the expense of your pride and arrogance. It requires a heart that is fervently and firmly engaged in submission and humility because Jesus is the one who made it possible to be restored to an intimate and personal relationship with God.

The third verse is a concise statement of what is absolutely necessary to draw near to God: “Jesus answered, ‘I am the way and the truth and the life. No one comes to the Father except through me’ (John 14:6 NIV). These verses are instructions regarding the necessity of individually drawing near to God. The Scriptures provide clearly the reason for Jesus’ presence. Matthew reveals the mission of Jesus. He was here to restore all who will believe in a relationship with the Father.

18 As Jesus was walking beside the Sea of Galilee, he saw two brothers, Simon called Peter and his brother Andrew. They were casting a net into the lake, for they were fishermen.19 “Come, follow me,” Jesus said, “and I will send you out to fish for people.”20 At once, they left their nets and followed him.21 Going on from there,
he saw two other brothers, James son of Zebedee and his brother John. They were in a boat with their father Zebedee, preparing their nets. Jesus called them, and immediately they left the boat and their father, and followed him. (Matt. 4:18-22 NIV)

Koch and McNaughton have provided not only the attributes that a Christ-follower should have, but they also outline the steps necessary to facilitate the development of those attributes for intimacy with Jesus. Each of these attributes are presented in Scripture. In addition, their work provides a step-by-step process that will be included in the project curriculum. All seven attributes possess five or six instructions designed to strengthen the attribute. The following attributes are considered by the authors to be the habits one learns in a successful walk with Jesus. In addition, each habit or attribute of a follower will learn to deepen his or her relationship with God.

The first attribute of a follower is learning to be with Jesus. Being in Jesus will require the following steps: learning to remain in Him, learning to recognize the developing fruit of the Spirit within the heart, learning to be with Him when reading Scriptures, learning to pray with Christ when praying, and learning how being in Christ affects other people. This attribute is found in John: “Remain in me, as I also remain in you. No branch can bear fruit by itself; it must remain in the vine. Neither can you bear fruit unless you remain in me” (John 15:4 NIV).

Leading people to God takes teaching and instruction, but they must allow God to penetrate the heart. It is a God-man relational activity. This process begins with the ministry leaders. While teaching and instructing disciples is essential for ministry leaders, a first issue includes the leader reflecting on the behavior of Christ. Yount suggests that

114. Koch and McNaughton, 40.
ministry leaders or teachers create an openness of trust and vulnerability by modeling personal openness toward students.”¹¹⁵ Openness and sharing provides the interaction necessary to deepen the relationship between the ministry leader and volunteer. The Christ-follower will model the instructions of Paul, “so whether you eat or drink or whatever you do, do it all for the glory of God” (1 Cor. 10:31 NIV). The biblical objective to instruction and teaching will reveal those character attributes best modeled through *imago Christi* behaviors.

The second attribute, learning to listen is found in Matthew: “Therefore everyone who hears these words of mine and puts them into practice is like a wise man who built his house on the rock” (Matthew 7:24 NIV). The instructions are to learn to be happy, learn to go to the source, learn to see Jesus in Scripture, learn to overcome temptation, and learn to be productive.¹¹⁶

The third attribute is learning to heal as evidenced by the work of Jesus. It is difficult to learn when one is sick, diseased, etc. Jesus took care of that first:

> 23 Jesus went throughout Galilee, teaching in their synagogues, proclaiming the good news of the kingdom, and healing every disease and sickness among the people. ²⁴ News about him spread all over Syria, and people brought to him all who were ill with various diseases, those suffering severe pain, the demon-possessed, those having seizures, and the paralyzed; and he healed them. (Matt. 7:23-24 NIV)

The factors important to this attribute are learning: the importance of touch, to recognize Jesus’ authority, that healing is God’s idea, to ask in faith, and to give it away.¹¹⁷ Healing can be for others but the ministry leader must seek God’s healing first.

---

¹¹⁵. Yount, 17.
¹¹⁶. Koch and McNaughton, 58-76.
¹¹⁷. Ibid., 92-103.
The fourth attribute, learning to influence, is found in Matthew:

14 You are the light of the world. A town built on a hill cannot be hidden. 15 Neither do people light a lamp and put it under a bowl. Instead, they put it on its stand, and it gives light to everyone in the house. 16 In the same way, let your light shine before others, that they may see your good deeds and glorify your Father in heaven. (Matt. 5:14-16 NIV)

As followers, ministry leaders are to instruct and model for volunteers what it means to be shining examples. The characteristics important for influencing people are learning to invite people in, learning to share a personal story and listening to theirs, learning to be a genuine friend, learning to speak directly, learning to serve people, and learning to make sense. 118 The basis for these characteristics can be found in Matthew: “19 Therefore go and make disciples of all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit, 20 and teaching them to obey everything I have commanded you. And surely I am with you always, to the very end of the age” (Matt. 28:19-20 NIV). This is the instruction for all ministry leaders to invite people to Jesus.

The fifth attribute is learning to love. Its biblical basis is located in a verse that Jesus referred to as the most important commandment: “37 Jesus replied: ‘Love the Lord your God with all your heart and with all your soul and with all your mind. 38 This is the first and greatest commandment. 39 And the second is like it: Love your neighbor as yourself’ (Matt. 22:37-39 NIV). The second commandment is designed for self-reflection because humans will love no one as much as they love themselves. Jesus’ statement can be said another way: “As much as you love yourself, love others.” The key learned

118. Ibid., 106-130.
principles are to learn to trust God, learn to seek God’s approval, learn to enjoy God’s acceptance, learn to partner with God to change you, and learn to enjoy God’s peace.\textsuperscript{119}

The sixth attribute is learning to pray. Its biblical basis is found in Matthew and is Jesus’ model prayer:

\begin{quote}
This, then, is how you should pray: Our Father in heaven, hallowed be your name, \textsuperscript{10} your kingdom come, your will be done, on earth as it is in heaven. \textsuperscript{11} Give us today our daily bread. \textsuperscript{12} And forgive us our debts, as we also have forgiven our debtors. \textsuperscript{13} And lead us not into temptation, but deliver us from the evil one. (Matt. 6:9-13 NIV)
\end{quote}

Jesus also provided a caution, \textsuperscript{14} For if you forgive other people when they sin against you, your heavenly Father will also forgive you. \textsuperscript{15} But if you do not forgive others their sins, your Father will not forgive your sins” (Matt. 6:14-15). The characteristics of learning to love are not to pray a bad prayer. Learn the disciples’ prayer, learn to pray through pain, and learn to do spiritual warfare.\textsuperscript{120}

The last attribute demonstrates that a Christ-follower should learn to manage everything about their lives, starting with their minds. The biblical basis for this attribute is found in Philippians: “\textsuperscript{7} And the peace of God, which transcends all understanding, will guard your hearts and your minds in Christ Jesus.” (Phil. 4:7 NIV) The learned principles include managing the mind, money, body, words, time, and gifts.\textsuperscript{121}

\begin{footnotes}
\textsuperscript{119}. Ibid., 136-157.  
\textsuperscript{120}. Ibid., 160-182.  
\textsuperscript{121}. Ibid., 186-213.
\end{footnotes}
Sociological Dimension

The research revealed how critically important the spiritual formation of God’s people is. The crucial piece should be teaching the process of conforming to the *imago Christi* identity. The challenge in building a curriculum is utilizing the best practices found in educational research. The Church has generally not invested its ministries in current educational methodologies. Most have continued to use traditional direct-instruction techniques. The Sunday message and educational ministries are doing basically the same thing that has always been done. Discipleship programs are either homegrown by a non-educational staff or are purchased with little reference to the audience needs. Ministry leaders are the products of these programs.

What was discovered were general approaches to teaching discipleship. Approaches to teaching discipleship are generally in two categories. Most approaches were instructional in nature and followed a linear or chronological delivery method highlighting specific steps. The work of Ortlund and Kennedy followed this approach. The other approach focused on the individual’s internal transformation through personal intimacy with God. These authors include Nouwen, Willard, and Parker. The work of these two groups is within the boundaries of this research and is not mutually exclusive. What lies between these two groups is a subset leading to a holistic approach in thematic instruction.

Thematic instruction as an instructional approach is generally defined as the synthesis of an across-the-disciplines approach that pulls into a set of lessons the inclusion of pertinent themes that support each learning objective. As a result, deepening
the relationship with God through the spiritual disciplines is equally as important as the faith-steps of a seeker through the early steps of the born-again experience. The epistemological goal is the integration of the themes into the ministry leader’s life. Imparting spiritual depth to another ensures longevity of the faith. Murray said, “What a man believes moves and rules his whole being.” This indicates that an integration of faith within one’s being will influence the whole person.

Citing work from the Kuyers Institute for Christian Teaching and Instruction, editors Smith and Smith learned that less than five percent of the scholarly research work focuses on teaching and learning. This shortcoming leaves the project leader with the daunting task of implementing a new instructional approach, the assessment of same, and the reporting of the results in this work. In light of this review, research will be focused on the knowledge available and will provide supporting documentation for developing a thematic curriculum. The lesson writing will include hermeneutics as well as the measurement of the presentation, leaving one question in mind: Did the ministry leader grow from the thematic instruction?

Maintaining a unified perspective for preparing ministry leaders is critical to the church as the body of Christ. Church growth is only as strong as its Christian education that ultimately becomes the program for Christlikeness. Teaching and instructing in spiritual unity with God will always be the foundation of what ministry leaders do. Christ-likers possess an identity with an eternity worldview that is grounded in theological understanding. Mekkreeel said,

“a worldview attempts to provide not only a cognitive picture of the

122. Murray, 12.
world but also an estimate of what in life is valuable and worth striving for. Worldviews have been developed in literary, religious, and philosophical works. Philosophers have produced metaphysical formulations of worldviews that attempt to give them a universal conceptual determinacy.**124

The ultimate goal here for the ministry leader is teaching the volunteers and coaches that a Christian faith is more about a life of worship. It is a life of worship that finds its foundation in a Christian identity.

Chapter 3

Literature Review

The literature review considers this question: What are the current approaches in discipleship programs designed to grow church members? Several discipleship and leadership development programs blur in attempting to answer the question. Despite the confusion, the goal of this paper is to wade through this uncertainty to provide insight into disciple making and what leads to authentic leadership development.

Church leaders are often perplexed when considering the impetus for developing discipleship programs, due to an end game of objectives, conflicting theological footings, and misunderstood pedagogical processes. Many church leaders search for an educational practice that will result in an equipped leader only to realize through a discouraging trial-and-error methodology that the strategy did not produce the desired results. This is echoed by Hewitt, who wrote, “This multi-faceted and complex process brings together competing interests with different agendas that, in some contexts, have resulted in mis-evangelization.”¹²⁵ Identifying a variety of processes as well as goals, to include a wide variety of business leadership models, is not producing the desired results.

These endeavors are rooted in both humanistic and theological foundations. The efforts, as well intentioned as they are, have missed the mark. This reaction is due in large part, to the lack of positive results being reported in journals. The successful gurus of leadership would certainly herald any successes of discipleship preparation programs.

An important consideration is found in the great commission (Matt. 28:16-20 NIV). Jesus is talking to his newly trained disciples. He instructs them to wait on the Holy Spirit. Interestingly, in the second part of verse 19, Jesus provides some definitive instruction, “baptizing them in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit.” Certainly, this action of baptism indicates that a relationship will exist between the baptized disciple and God. Then the goal of discipleship is to develop leaders that will lead with, live with, learn with, and share with their local church community.

Additionally, and despite the confusion in discipleship program development, some local churches like Bayside Community Church (BCC) have forged ahead with innovative approaches. A homegrown developmental program (Appendix 3) maintains that life change happens in the context of relationships, citing the God-man relationship as a model.126 Such a vision for developing discipleship is an aspiration within the local church, whether homegrown or a replication of other popular strategies coupled with instruction and teaching. Consequently, the church leaders, having delegated the task to discipleship directors, hold hope that the leadership-training program will provide disciples with evangelistic leadership.

126. Bayside Community Church Coaches Training, a training manual developed by the leadership of Bayside Community Church for developing its ministry leaders and coaches.
To that end, the local discipleship ministry leaders must continue to search for more qualitative data to create curriculum that will respond to the spiritual measure of the church community. What works in Bradenton, Florida may not work in Cambridge, Massachusetts. Unfortunately, within these strategies, the development of spiritually mature leaders is still lacking. Hewitt suggested a combination of theological education and an experiential option, “an appropriate model of theological education is needed to equip leaders for effective witness to the gospel.”\textsuperscript{127} However, rather than being optional for BCC laity, it must be a requirement.

First, this literature review will address a couple of issues that require some fundamental explanation before moving forward. The first fundamental issue, leadership, both in the church and in corporate settings, is expected to grow and lead their respective organizations but in all likelihood will have very different goals. Organizational leadership for the corporate structure has a primary goal that focuses on minimizing cost and maximizing profit. In a church setting, leadership is expected to save souls and grow leaders. Hewitt concluded that Christ-following laity in the local church is necessary to develop spiritually mature leaders and calls for new recruiting and training programs that will result in more powerful leadership development.\textsuperscript{128} Consequently, the focus of leadership development in the church is dramatically different. In corporate environments, leadership development is through a series of academic courses or an in-house training program with a focus on behavioral techniques.

With the end in mind, the central focus of leadership is markedly different for a church leader. Educating the church leader may parallel some academic curriculum or

\textsuperscript{127} Hewitt, 205.
\textsuperscript{128} Hewitt, 208.
organizational leadership preparation, but it focused on satisfying a central biblical directive "to make disciples" (Matt. 28:19 NIV).

The second fundamental concern inherent to leadership development is the approach. First, biblical leadership finds its basis within scriptural authority in developing discipleship programs. Second, it will be to build effective discipleship training on these biblical principles as opposed to humanistic or economic objectives. As stated, goals are vastly different, making disciples that draw people to the church as compared to earning a profit for investors.

The third fundamental issue is terminology. First, it is critical that the reader understand the terms leadership and discipleship are used interchangeably. Historically, churches have referred to leadership development in biblical terms as discipleship. However, since the 1990s, the term leadership has been more widely used within churches but doesn’t imply a humanistic leadership model. The terms are used interchangeably because of the outcomes. It makes no difference whether it is an administrative function or filling a role as an evangelist. The outcome is the same: saving the lost.

Secondly, the main objective is to present a biblical model of leadership. As stated, most churches have presented leadership paradigms from the business world. Clearly, those approaches are not bad. The challenge is the implementation and effectiveness of a business model in a church setting. The focal point here is a church leadership model that includes Godly intervention. All of these issues are found in the literature review to follow.
In the literature review, the discussion centers on the spiritual qualities that the ministry leader must develop in growing the disciple. Geoffrion discovered through years of leadership experiences that maintaining a balance between the results-oriented strategies for success and providing a life-giving atmosphere to enhance productivity is the challenge.\textsuperscript{129} The real surprise was the realization that individual actions and behaviors were not always demonstrated in the office. His concern revolved around this, the idea that being a biblical leader requires transformation. It isn't about changing the outward behavior, as so often is the case in leadership training. It is about an authentic change from within. Geoffrion stated, “Inner transformation means a fundamental change in our mind-set, so that we truly think differently, and perceive God, others, our work, and ourselves in healthier and more contrastive ways.”\textsuperscript{130} His work correlates with the disciple-making paradigm.

According to Geoffrion, this transformation is a result of a disciple’s connection with God. The connection is necessary for a transformation that "involves many cognitive (mind), emotional, and behavioral (will) changes."\textsuperscript{131} Only the heart is missing here. Some might say the heart is represented by emotions; in this case the author does make that assumption. The challenge in this discussion is empirically validating his premises that are not collected in this book.

Geoffrion identifies the ordinary overarching purposes of an organization throughout his work. What he adds to this discussion are connections to biblical principles. He states clearly that “leadership is flowing out of deep spiritual life” and the

\textsuperscript{130} Ibid., 8.
\textsuperscript{131} Ibid., 14.
“…fruitfulness in leadership requires the work of God in and through us.”\textsuperscript{132} Unlike most work in leadership that highlights quantitative research, some researchers suggested that engaging in spiritual practices impacts a leader's success.

Geoffrion’s perspective on the inside-out transformation focuses on the leader's relationship with God and the leader must "actively cultivate your own spiritual life" and adds the principle that "spiritual vitality flows from a real change of heart and mind toward God."\textsuperscript{133} Scripture supports Geoffrion’s perspective because it teaches that from the heart “flows the springs of life” (Pro. 4:23 ESV).

Geoffrion states that a Spirit-led leader is recognizable “because they are devoted to serving God’s purposes, they are seeking to be good stewards of their spiritual gifts, they are called to leadership, they are being transformed inwardly, and they are empowered by God to serve differently.”\textsuperscript{134} Geoffrion admits that his leadership ideas are validated through 20 years of leadership as an ordained pastor, which provides a level of confidence in his observations.\textsuperscript{135} As an aside, the author does make many confirming connections to the work of other writers. Nonetheless, the book's premises present a significant perspective worthy of further research. The goal of this review is to provide more profound thought that reveals the drivers of the heart and mind for discipleship.

In other efforts toward researching spiritual transformation, Pettit edited a compilation of articles and essays written by several notable writers. This work focused on an exploration of spiritual transformation for the individual in the context of

\textsuperscript{132} Ibid., 23.
\textsuperscript{133} Ibid., 41.
\textsuperscript{134} Ibid., 27.
\textsuperscript{135} Ibid., xix.
community. The description of this process includes interchangeable terms of spiritual and character formation. Hendricks provided the foreword. He emphasizes three qualities that make up the community necessary for spiritual formation. Hendricks maintained that each group must take ownership for individual character development, hold to a standard of personal responsibility for one another, and possess a commitment to spiritual growth; all needed for leaders to grow and prosper.136

The areas of accountability are support and godly desires, all provided within a small group. It is in the small group where the interactions take place that future leaders will need.137 He goes on to say that these groups “help future believers to appreciate the body of Christ in its giftedness.”138 Hendricks’ work assures us that character formation grows in the context of relationships.

Pettit provided the primary setting of spiritual formation for character and leadership. He begins by stating that his review of the research has led him to two principles about spiritual formation. First, spiritual formation is the work of God in a believer’s life in which “the individual continually [moves] closer to the image and actions of Jesus Christ. Second, the change or transformation that occurs is in the context of authentic, Christian community.”139

Another contributor to Pettit’s compilation is Andrew Seidel’s work on leadership. He begins with this poignant statement that “leadership and spiritual

138. Ibid., 12.
139. Ibid., 19.
formation have a symbiotic relationship.” Surprisingly, Seidel notes that there is little consensus on the definition of leadership. Consequently, he qualifies it as servant leadership but has a different take on the commonly held characterization. He defines servant leadership in two ways. First, servant leadership is the fulfillment of God's mission, and second, the leader’s realization of God's work in the lives of His people. Only in part does this definition explain what the Old Testament godly kings demonstrate in their leadership. It doesn’t speak to the internal transformation that is so powerfully observed as a characteristic of the kings’ instincts. Several of the Old Testament kings are wise and powerful in their understanding of the relationship with their God.

Seidel believes that identity has a significant influence on one’s leadership because of the character of leadership and what leaders do. In addition to leadership actions, a leader’s identity influences the way in which they relate to others. Seidel's definition focuses on identity, while Keith states that “leadership becomes meaningful when it is a way of helping others.” Seidel suggests the image is a sense of self-image while identity is who one is to God. Keith’s perspective is a calling; Seidel’s perspective is a Spirit-led person driven by Godly purpose. Blackaby is consistent in this position: “Spiritual leadership is moving people on to God’s agenda.”

In a compilation by editor Dockery, *Christian Leadership Essentials: A Handbook for Managing Christian Organization*, guides the reader deeper into the multi-
faceted church leadership structure and its definitions. One of the contributors, Sloan, said leadership was given to mankind because of dominion covenant and that “we are in charge of that which He has created; and we are to tend it, and shape it in ways that reflect and honor His original purposes for creation”. Like Geoffrion, Sloan develops the idea of an image, but with a twist. The picture is of Christ and carries with it the understanding that the image bearer resembles *imago Dei*. Moreover, conformity to the likeness of God also exhibits behavior through Christ that teaches discipleship.

The critical point of Sloan’s work is the conviction of Jesus. Jesus’ work revolved around the new emphasis, helping others understand God’s profound love in the Word. Sloan stated that “the profundity of Jesus’ understanding of the Scriptures and with it His knowledge of the character of God, the mission and role of Israel’s law, and the mission and the work of the people of God” emanates from the love He experiences through his Father’s Word. The untapped detail in most discipleship programs or leadership training seminars is the union of heart and Word that brings them to submission. It is the convictions of the kings that results in their success; popularity is NOT their goal. It is their deeper and personal understanding of the character of God, and the mission and work of the people of God as His representatives in building the kingdom.

It is much more about the Spirit within Jesus than what He does. The love from His heart motivates the actions. Jesus knew what the Father wanted and committed his life to it! Leadership is more about what is within the leader that obtains the results, not

147. Sloan, 21-22.
148. Sloan, 22.
only what he does. The disciples, post-resurrection, stand for what is right and are martyred. They were earthly men filled with the Spirit of God, embracing their purpose in the things of God. In global terms, they are close approximations to godly men, but in specific observable behavior, both overt and covert, only Sloan appears to have captured the true essence of convictions found in the kings' leadership.

Barton holds a perspective that supports the work found here. She believes that the growing attention on spiritual formation conceals a desire for a deeper understanding of humankind’s relationship with God. It is about an intimacy, but one that permeates the heart. Through the demands of life and living, people often lose a sense of the here and now, their connection with others, the simple things in life, and the softness of emotional connection. This can include allowing the affectionate warmth of a relationship with God. 149 It is a relationship that has a deep soul satisfaction that soothes and diminishes the striving.

Leaders must understand and experience this for themselves and be able to share the struggles if they are to be successful in leading others through tough times. It is impossible to lead others through spiritual formation if you're not sure of the transformational process. Pastors need to understand the process as well as discern where the individual members are in the transformational journey. More importantly, leaders must engage in the spiritual practices. 150 “Pain is a powerful teacher and a fantastic informer of our decision-making process.” 151 Without a doubt, the spiritual disciplines are the practices necessary to deepen one’s relationship with God. Ultimately, it is the

150. Barton, 32.
individual who is called to "draw near to God" and experience that "God will draw near to you"\(^\text{152}\) (James 4:8 NIV).

Barton is examining the nature of the intrapersonal dynamic as she dives deeper into the heart of men and women in leadership. This willingness to be vulnerable goes to the heart of the matter. The vulnerability isn’t only to God, but to others. Scazzero claims, “The sad reality is that too many people in our churches are fixated at a stage of spiritual immaturity that current models of discipleship have not addressed.”\(^\text{153}\) He adds that “the link between emotional health and spiritual maturity is a large, unexplored area of discipleship.”\(^\text{154}\) Dodd shares the same thinking: “When we cross over from self-willed existence to yieldedness to the Lord, we now put ourselves in a continual position of readiness to do what God wants us to do.”\(^\text{155}\) The Christ-follower’s secret to a joy-filled life is seeking after God’s will for your life. There is agreement here between Scazzero and Dodd.

This research has provided far-reaching insight for growing leaders that the local church calls to oversee discipleship. A point of consensus is the characteristics the church leadership expects to find leading its discipleship program. Ayer contends, “Yet general research in the discipline of leadership has not thoroughly considered the inner phenomena of leadership nor investigated ontological aspects of leaders that affect behavior.”\(^\text{156}\)

\(^{152}\) Ibid., 35.
\(^{154}\) Ibid., 19.
\(^{155}\) Brian J. Dodd, Empowered Church Leadership (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2003), 48.
\(^{156}\) Michale Ayers, “Toward a Theology of Leadership,” Journal of Biblical Perspectives in Leadership, 1, no. 1 (Fall 2006), 11.
Researchers maintain that discipleship leaders require a high degree of spiritual maturity. What isn't so clear is how to develop the requisite spiritual maturity within the discipleship leaders. According to Barton, possessing the spiritual maturity is contingent upon a transformational experience. Barton’s observations are accurate, but transformation requires biblical knowledge at some point. However, there is little said about the delivery of that knowledge. Sanders preceded Barton by several years; however, there remains a striking consensus between the two. Sanders states, “Maturity is shown in a magnanimous spirit and broad vision. Paul’s encounter with Christ transformed him from a narrow-minded bigot into a full-hearted leader. The indwelling Christ enlarged his passion for others, broadened his view of the world, and deepened his convictions.”

Conclusion

This literature review captured the salient issues in leadership training and the development of the heart and mind of Christ of discipleship leaders. The authors’ focus was on conviction that the heat and mind influenced behavior. It is the burden of a spiritually astute church leadership team to determine the course of its developmental leadership training. Unfortunately, it is the experience of this researcher that church leaders often lack the insight and wherewithal to select the correct instructional strategy.

to improve the depth of spiritual formation. Moreover, it is the intrinsic dynamic that must be explored more closely.

Scores of research has developed in secular leadership journals on the talents-based hiring process. To some it is referred to as strengths-based hiring. The goal here is that the organization will recruit, hire, and train potential employees that exhibit through an assessment the talents desired for the position and organization. In research commissioned by the Gallup Organization, business leaders attempted to evaluate the driving internal strengths that lead to their success as managers. Interestingly, this aligns with the focus of this dissertation in determining the dynamics embedded in a leader that results in their success as a discipleship leader within the local church.

Despite the barrage of leadership research, there are some that maintain a New Testament approach. It is the “follow me” approach. Sweet presents the so-called “other side of the coin.” He takes a dim view of all the leadership training and says, "We have come to believe that we have a leadership crisis while all along we have been in a drought of discipleship.” More problematic for Sweet is the fact that those who would follow are not available. According to Sweet, there is a negative connotation to being a follower. In addition, the notable leadership schools are not producing the right kind of leaders. If they were, the local church would be full Sunday after Sunday and the Spirit-

---

160. Ibid., 22.
led business leader would experience success. The simple solution is to find a pastor and become the student.

This literature review provided an overview of the effort being placed on the development of discipleship leaders. Most research focused on establishing conviction through heart and mind. It is the burden of spiritually mature church leadership to determine the direction of its developmental leadership training. Simply put, many church leaders lack the insight and academic background to select the correct instructional strategy.

The hope is that all lead pastors are men and women “after God's own heart” (Acts 13:22 NIV). Transformation is within the souls of men and women, where the soil of the heart exists. The focus of discipleship training must be the ministry leader’s conviction. Specifically, it is from the transformed center of the disciples with their convictions that the heart of a leader arises.

The challenge for all churches, whether small or large, is having the experienced personnel on staff to teach and instruct, and model discipleship for others. Matthew 28:19 instructs “therefore go and make disciples of all nations” which means, without doubt, this earthly work is to be done no matter what the cost to the local church or level of capacity. It would follow that making disciples is going to take place.

In addition to the literature review, a constructed intensive interview in chapter five furnishes current critical data not found in the literature review. The discussions will focus on the initial questions raised in this review as well as provide evidence for a relationally instructional approach to growing disciples. The guiding question will be whether the leaders who have completed leadership training are modeling the expected
discipleship behaviors and producing expected discipleship growth results. Finally, local curriculum development requires intentional instruction that steers coaches to be soul-deep listeners and thoughtful leaders, and most importantly, to exhibit a Holy Spirit dependent relationship.

Chapter 4

Project Narrative and Field Work

While certainly important, the business office in any church holds the resources necessary for its programs, but the work in the discipleship office must always be the focus of the church. The reality of discipleship for the church is found in the Great Commission. The church is not alone in this work. The Holy Spirit plays the primary role. The interaction between the individual and the Holy Spirit is a God-man relational activity. Specifically, the real business of the church is developing Christ-like ministry leaders who will disciple volunteers, coaches, and ultimately the newcomers. The objective here will be to determine the effectiveness of the ministry leader’s discipleship as well as developing a program to enhance the ministry leaders’ skills.

The driver in this objective will be the presentation of several instructional lessons that reveal a cognitive framework for understanding the foundation of spiritual formation. This framework provides the basis for the believer to understand and grow in relationship
with God. The framework will be used to build a firm foundation for establishing one’s Christian identity. Moreover, the instructional approach will demonstrate the differences between the characteristics of a humanistic worldview, the old self, and the spiritual maturity of the Christian identity in the new self.

This research focuses on the building blocks for developing the project curriculum for ministry leaders. Stated another way, the critical concern is building the curriculum that elicits a deepened understanding of the believer’s relationship with God. Prior to introducing a spiritual formation program in churches, leaders and pastors must first understand the process of spiritual transformation. The success of a spiritual formation program rests on the capacity of a leader to lead from the transformational experience. The literature review examined spiritual formation programs as well as the capacity of leadership to present and lead in spiritual transformation. Therefore, the process for evaluating the discipleship program will require three steps. The first is to interview the pastors, the second is to present the project curriculum, and the final step is measuring the impact of the curriculum on the ministry leader.

Initially, the objective of this research will be to provide an alternative approach to the BCC discipleship program. In short, the discipleship training will effectively enhance the ministry leader’s capacity in growing coaches and volunteers. A primary research question is used in framing the content and procedures of this curriculum: Are the ministry leaders leading in a way that is producing the measurable outcomes? Consequently, measuring how the ministry leaders lead their volunteers and coaches is

161. Barton, 26-36.
critical. This examination will lead to the development of an enhanced leadership program.

**Research Narrative**

The research will consist of a combination of interviews regarding discipleship training; and focus groups to determine the effectiveness of the project curriculum. The intensive interviews with pastors will determine what training the pastors may need for their ministry leaders. Interviews with three randomly selected pastors from BCC’s seven satellite campuses will be used to direct the research process. Focus groups from different samples of leadership groups will be presented with the steps to improve leadership effectiveness. This workshop will include a pre-assessment, presenting the curriculum, and a post-assessment following the instruction.

The research will begin with an interview of three campus pastors. This researcher will conduct a thirty- to fifty-five minute intensive interview with each pastor. Each interview will be recorded, transcribed, and evaluated to determine recurring themes and statements. Each pastor will be given the opportunity to review the transcript for accuracy.
The initial effort of this research was focused on the effectiveness of the ministry leaders in developing leaders. The pastors’ concerns were centered on the spiritual character of the ministry leaders. As a consequence of the first interview, the focus of this research shifted from assessing the ministry leaders’ effectiveness in growing their staff to providing an instructional program for developing their spiritual formation. This change in focus will be further discussed in chapter six.

The instructional curriculum will consist of seven to nine lessons that present an overview of God’s covenantal relationship with His people. Each lesson will be twenty-to twenty-five minutes in duration and end with a question-and-answer session. In a workshop approach, each lesson will consist of several biblical themes critical to understanding the nature of humankind's relationship with God: “Anyone who listens to my teaching and follows it is wise, like a person who builds a house on solid rock” (Matt. 7:24 NIV). All lessons are provided in the appendix.

Through a lecture-and-discussion format, the project curriculum will be delivered to several focus groups, each consisting of ten to twenty ministry leader participants. Focus groups will consist of several age and ethnic groups. Dates and locations are as follows: (1) a central Florida church, on October 27, 2018, (2) a small church near Madison, Wisconsin, on January 13, 2019, and (3) a Christian college with student leaders in Bradenton, Florida, on February 9, 2019. Participants will complete a pre-assessment before instruction. A post-instruction assessment will be given to participants twenty to thirty days after attending a focus group.
Intensive Interview Preparation

The intensive interviews will focus on the pastors’ observations of their ministry leaders’ discipleship skills. Specifically, the concern is whether the leaders are rich in discipleship and task completion? To ensure an objective analysis, a specific method of analysis will be utilized. To guide this interview process, this research will rely heavily on the work of Kennedy and Charmaz for developing a grounded research theory approach. The steps for preparing and collecting data from the intensive interviews will reflect the work of Charmaz. Her research approach for collecting data is a marked improvement over a simple, straightforward approach to surveys and interviews in the past. Kennedy’s work will provide the intensive interview techniques, creating a much more in-depth examination of each pastor’s thoughts about his assessment of the leadership team.

Each recorded interview will be transcribed into a written text. The document will then be evaluated in a coding process of the pastors’ responses. The analytic coding will be a two-step process: (1) the results of the initial coding will reveal fragments of data, words, lines, segments, and incidents, and (2) the next step will be a focused coding process used by the researcher to examine the initial coding by reviewing the data in larger chunks.162 The completed coded responses will be included in the appendices. A specific categorization of common responses will be created in the final coding step.

Critical to this evaluation are the procedures this report will use to make any determination regarding the pastors and their staff development. This report will include

an interview guide and constructed interview questions. Also, a copy of the Institutional Review Board (IRB) exemption request, the exemption form, a copy of the researcher’s NIH certificate for protecting human research participants, and the consent form will be in the appendices.

Invitation and Interview Guide

The questionnaire will be sent to each pastor to request an interview as well as to seek some preliminary information from the pastor.\footnote{Charmaz, 48.} A sample letter of invitation and questionnaire will be included in the appendices. The invitational letter to the pastor will assure him that confidentiality is a top priority.

An interview guide will be used to keep the questions and conversation focused on the topic. The interviewer will focus on the following to protect a “qualitative assessment through (1) research questions are not the same as interview questions, (2) people's stated theories differ from their theories-in-use, (3) interviews are social occasions, and (4) testimony by itself is a relatively weak form of evidence.”\footnote{Mary Kennedy, Digital Advisor, “A Guide to Interview Guides,” (2006) accessed March 24, 2018. https://msu.edu/user/mkennedy/digitaladvisor/Research/interviewing.html Kennedy’s interview guide is thorough and extremely helpful for developing a constructed interview.} The pastor will also be required to complete a consent form (Appendix 10) and made aware of
a recording device.\textsuperscript{165} Finally, to be included in the post-interview processes are steps to “review interview responses and observational data for insights and patterns.”\textsuperscript{166}

As suggested in the interview guide, the researcher will focus on a few general questions (see appendices). The responses will be addressed with probing questions regarding the effectiveness of the church's training processes. The following are questions and probes planned for the pastor interviews:

1. How does BCC prepare coaches to lead? Do they meet your expectations? Yes or why not?

   Probe: It sounds as if you do additional training for your coaches on this campus. Explain that to me.

   Probe: It sounds as if there are differences in the skill sets. Elaborate on why you think that is the case.

2. If there needs to be more training, what is it? What do you mean by pouring into the team members?

   Probe: Has your experience fostered another level of discernment?

3. Why doesn’t every leader pour into the team members?

   Probe: What is wrong with the selection process if sub-par coaches have been recruited?

4. You mentioned spiritually healthy team members. Explain how a leader addresses the spiritual needs of the team.

   Probe: Could you describe the aspect of leadership training that would address spiritual formation?

5. Is there something else you think I should understand about leadership training that we have not touched on here?


\textsuperscript{166} Ibid., 1.
These questions will used to initiate the dialogue while providing an opportunity for probes and any additional questioning if necessary.

**Project Curriculum**

There are two pieces to the project curriculum, the anticipatory set and the lessons. The instructional unit begins with an anticipatory set. This session will be a short exploration into the difference between a humanistic worldview and a Christian identity. The two circles below present the critical nature of foundational beliefs. The goal is to reveal to participants the misunderstandings they have about their belief systems. As Paul encouraged the Corinthians “examine yourselves to see if you are of the faith” (2 Cor. 13:5 NIV). This practice exposes the errors in their worldview thinking and ultimately in their relationship with God. This exercise is designed to have students examine their belief system. Besides, it is designed to determine the basis of Christian identity. A sample lesson plan follows the anticipatory set. The exegetical work follows a thematic theology, examining critical biblical themes and using a relational hermeneutic. Each sphere possesses several belief points, which will be examined from each worldview.

In the second part, the curricular lessons begin by drawing a timeline. On the timeline will be plotted the significant theological themes with the discussion. There will be several horizontal levels as opposed to a linear chronology. Each lesson level will have two corresponding points that reflect God's connection between the natural and the supernatural.
Spheres of Examination

The initial goal is to define the difference between a worldview and an identity. In addition, this anticipatory set will reveal the errors between personal beliefs of Self and biblical God/Christ truth. The presenter will ask questions about each of the topic areas on the circle and why each area is possibly the opposite of a Christian perspective. The first circle is the sphere of independent existence. This sphere represents the humanistic worldview that has emerged from existential philosophy and is grounded in naturalism. Students are to answer questions posed about each category that makes up one’s worldview. The description of each topic results from the choices made by those who make self-decisions through independent reasoning (flesh). Each point requires a discussion on how the student defines or describes the topic relative to personal choices.
Figure 4.1. Self-examination - Humanistic Worldview

The second sphere represents the Christian identity and is posed by the apostle Paul as he encourages believers to examine themselves to see if they are of the faith.
The Christian Identity perspective emerged from Christian theology and is based on a biblical theology that supernaturally one can return to relationship with God and conform to the character of Jesus Christ. The spiritual framework includes the sphere of Christian Identity and is not a worldview. This sphere is identifying the biblical principles for each category that makes up an identity with Christ. The descriptions of each category result from the choices made by those who have decided to follow God’s precepts for living a life of worship. A believer is more likely, or should be, to respond to the
categories presented from a Christ-like perspective. The Christian Identity is not referred to as a worldview, or even a biblical worldview, because there is no choice. Becoming a Christian means that one will follow the Word of God in shaping her life.

The purpose of the anticipatory set is to provoke thought regarding one’s life choices and deeper origins than commonly considered. The anticipatory set begins with a self-examination. The discussion starter is a circle drawn on a whiteboard with several topics identified. Each topic below is examined from an existential and naturalistic perspective. The sphere of self-important living illustrates the humanistic worldview. Philosophically, the humanistic perspective believes that mankind is basically good with a tendency toward selfishness and greed that can be controlled by governmental intervention. The humanistic worldview topics are characterized by independent choices with minimal reason.

The second circle is drawn and the same topics identified and examined from a biblical or supernaturalist perspective that reflects a Christian Identity. The sphere of God-centered living is a biblical perspective that believes mankind is basically selfish with a possibility of becoming good through the intervention of God in their lives supernaturally. Supernaturalism holds that there is something, transcendence, beyond the reality science can prove or know. Most important, it must be restated that this is not a worldview in the same sense that a humanistic worldview is identified. The person identifying with the Christian Identity recognizes that life responses originate with Jesus and is His God-given perspective. The humanistic worldview belongs to Self.

In this self-examination, topics such as the following were discussed: atheism, relative ethics (you do you), one must know in order to believe, dualism, scientific
method, non-absolutes, socialism, choice, the self, flesh, distorted believers, absolutes one must believe in order to know, biblical instruction, heart and mind, trust science in cooperation with the Word of God, choice, put on the new self, imago Christi.

Lesson Plans

The second part of the presentation is the instructional plan. In each lesson the presenter will plot two critical events or themes of God’s plan for humanity on a timeline. The first lesson will follow below and the remaining lessons are contained in the Appendix. Most importantly, the lessons are presented in a horizontal progression. Each lesson builds on the previous lesson and is continually noted and described as building the spiritual framework.

The spiritual framework is a scaffolding based on the most important event in humanity’s existence, creation. God creates with the end in mind. Creation is not an arbitrary step-by-step process to bring a universe into existence. Creation is a careful development of a perfect environment in which to introduce His Created and their relationship with Him. It is all about Day 6, His everlasting love, and His desire for a personal and intimate relationship with the Created in a perfect setting. At the base of the lesson timeline

THE TIMELINE

L.6
L.5 Abraham/Covenant JOB Jesus/New Covenant
Intended Learning Outcomes
1) Explain a theological theme (overarching theme – everlasting love)
2) Identify and describe the overarching theme of Revelation
3) Identify the Creation Garden & Revelation Garden
4) Explain the story connections

Review
Humanistic Worldview vs. Christian Identity

Objectives
1. Discuss revelation
2. Understanding themes
3. Compare and contrast Garden to Garden
4. Describe relational boundaries established by an agreement
5. Analyze the human qualities of the Created (Identity/Heart)

Introduction – God’s Story
When it comes to developing your identity, many things come into play. Childhood experiences, education, relationships, church and non-church influence you. Your identity is established in your heart. What you believe and your actions flow from your heart.

Theme Input 1 – Plot on the timeline
Genesis 1:1-2:25
Creation – Days 1-5
Day 6 A & E
Imago Dei [1. God-breathed spirit, 2. soul w/mind (cognition), will, emotions 3. Aesthetic ability 4. Dependence on God 5. Heart (Jer17:9/Pro 4:23]
Dominion Covenant & Choice

Theme Input 2 – Plot on timeline
Revelation 21-22 – read 21:1-8
New heaven
New earth
New Jerusalem
God dwells with us

Overarching Theme – an everlasting love relationship
Check for Understanding
1. What is a worldview vs. identity
2. What is a theme?
3. What does revelation mean?
4. Explain the term covenant.
5. Discuss the qualities of the *imago Dei* for the Created.
6. Let’s discuss how the dominion covenant means its parameters and the value of choice.

Spiritual Assessment

Assessing whether the spiritual framework was learned is the final step.

Specifically, the question is: Has the spiritual framework become a significant and working mental picture for the believer? All participants will be administered a Spiritual Assessment Inventory (Figure 1) developed by Dr. Todd Hall.167 The assessment will be given both pre and post lesson instruction. The goal is to measure learning but more importantly, spiritual growth.

In an effort to compare responses, a second assessment was administered intermittently. Though the SAI provided an opportunity for written responses, another assessment considered is from the work of Dr. Lynn Underwood and referred to as the Daily Spiritual Experience Scale (DSES).168 The SAI was favored over the DSES due to its fundamental question of feeling or experiencing. Items in the SAI sought the sense of knowing or specifically an identified experience while the DSES inquired more about

---

167. Todd Hall, *Spiritual Assessment Inventory*. Dr. Hall is a clinical psychologist and teaches at Biola University in CA. Permission to use was granted. The inventory was accessed through his website [https://www.spiritualtransformation.org/](https://www.spiritualtransformation.org/) July 20, 2018.

feeling. It is not necessarily a dramatic difference, but one that will be further explored in follow-up research. Both instruments provided consistent results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Not At All True</th>
<th>Slightly True</th>
<th>Moderately True</th>
<th>Substantially True</th>
<th>Very True</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I have a sense of God's Presence and how he is working in my life.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I frequently practice spiritual disciplines such as prayer, Bible study, service, etc</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I seek to improve my relationship with God and others through spiritual practices.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes it feels as if God is angry with me and wants to punish me.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes I feel as if God will give up on me.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I have a sense of God's direction for my life.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I have a sense of God's prompting to some tasks.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are times I feel frustrated, angry, or disappointed with God.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despite those feelings (#9 above), I still desire a relationship with God.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My experience of God's responses in my life has a great impact on me.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When I sin, I tend to withdraw from God.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are times when I question circumstances or situations that I am facing.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When/If I question those situations I am facing, I am still confident in God's purpose being worked out in my life.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My spiritual life is positively reflected through the ways I interact with friends, leaders, family, and others I come in contact with.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When I sin, I fear what God will/might do to me.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am aware of God communicating to me in different ways.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4.3.

Daily Spiritual Experience Scale

The observations are not designed to be a critique of the tools. Both provided insight (see Chapter Five) that will require further disaggregation as well as conclusions to whether these assessments were matched to the inquiry. The goal was to assess spiritual growth, but the growth factor may not have been captured due to the curriculum itself. The evaluation will focus on the results of the SAI and the significant changes seen
between the pre- and post-assessments. The DSES will be considered as a possible comparison to reveal any peculiarities.
In the previous chapter, a project curriculum was designed as an instructional approach to teach ministry leaders how to disciple their volunteers and coaches. The goal of the project was to determine whether the curriculum provided a more effective method of discipling and whether the project curriculum was successful. Through the literature review, the determination was made that there would be two parts to this research: first, the intensive interviews with three pastors; and second, the presentation of a project curriculum to three focus groups. The curriculum would be designed to create for the ministry leader a mental representation of spiritual formation. However, rather than identifying the process as spiritual formation it will be identified specifically as a spiritual framework. This chapter also presented the changes in the research plan due to initial interview results.

Pastors’ Interviews

This fieldwork began with individual interviews with three pastors from satellite campuses of Bayside Community Church (BCC). The semi-constructed interviews were thirty to fifty minutes in duration. The focus of each interview was the issue of ministry leaders and their respective leadership approaches to developing the volunteers and coaches under their leadership. The interviews were transcribed and coded. Coding was done in two steps, and, according to Charmaz, this is a critical link between the data collection and developing a working theory.\(^{169}\) Using the transcribed text, two levels of coding were applied. The first step was the initial coding that requires identifying the specific pieces of the interview through a process of summarization.\(^{170}\) Through the

\(^{169}\) Charmaz, 113.

\(^{170}\) Charmaz, 111.
second level of focused coding, the summarizations were further identified and categorized into four groups of common thematic statements.

The interview with the first pastor was almost fifty minutes in duration, which included signing the consent form with an explanation of the confidentiality agreement, as well as the interview and recording process. The interview was conducted in his office. The pastor has a large desk, the room is comfortable, and the introductory conversation was cordial. The interviewer followed the interview guide, asking light questions but becoming more focused as the conversation progressed.

The questions were focused on the discipleship training generally received from the BCC growth track program and whether it was adequate to equip ministry leaders. Pastor 1 was very forthcoming about the training and capacity of his ministry leaders to complete the tasks assigned to each of them. Pastor 1 was happy to report that the ministry leaders were accomplishing the assigned tasks as well as encouraging the volunteers and coaches to do the same. He was informed that a plan was in place to develop a new leadership plan for BCC, but it appeared that everything was headed in the right direction. Interestingly, Pastor 1 was concerned with the character of some of his ministry leaders. The ministry leader’s job performance was great, but character issues were emerging. In addition, if these issues were emerging with leadership, then certainly the understudies would not be developing better character habits. Consequently, Pastor 1 was spending an increasing amount of time on issues of spiritual maturity with the ministry leaders. Through the interview, and in the coding, it became apparent that the ministry leaders were great taskmasters but not good disciple makers. Final coding revealed categories resembling the four consistent themes identified in the initial coding.
The four categories revealed in the interview were the development of coaches, identifying and recruiting coaches, discernment, and spiritual maturity. The category given the most attention in the interview was spiritual maturity. In the two remaining interviews with Pastor 2 and Pastor 3, the same interview process was followed with only minor variations. Each interview was recorded, transcribed, and coded.

The results with Pastor 2 and Pastor 3 were similar in their focused and final coding. The interviews all identified spiritual maturity of the ministry leaders as a critical issue. While the ministry leaders were good people and great taskmasters, their discipling of the volunteers and coaches was not evident. The focus of the ministry leaders is a job description filled with specific with tasks to be accomplished with excellence. In the interviews, the pastors revealed they had discovered that discipling of the volunteers was not taking place. In the interviews, they began to look more seriously at the evidence. They discovered that ministry leaders were not leading in the development of the spiritual formation of their team members. Discipleship for these ministry leaders meant “hanging out” together. Consequently, it required more time on the part of the pastors to teach their ministry leaders what it means to grow the spiritual development of the team members.

The results of these interviews led the researcher to examine more closely specific discipleship skills. Commitment of this time to discipleship training was challenging since the pastors were not sure what to do with that time. Time was precious and providing the right instruction was the greater issue. Consequently, it became the focus of this research to develop an effective discipleship curriculum.

Focus Groups
The composition of the three focus groups identified as belonging to the church community and having regular church attendance. Focus Group 1 consisted of fifteen members of a church in a working-class area located in central Florida; Focus Group 2 consisted of 17 members who are part of a church community located in a working-class area in south-central Wisconsin; and Focus Group 3 are sophomores and juniors attending a small Christian college located on the west coast of Florida. The students are majoring in church leadership.

Focus groups were ministry leaders that consisted of mature laity as well as emerging young leaders. Overall, the gender composition of the three groups was 40 percent male and 60 percent female. The age range was twenty-one to sixty-five with a median age of thirty-nine. The ethnic distribution was 60% white, 30% Latino, and 10% African American. The spiritual maturity of focus group participants was self-described. Most group participants had several years of experience, three to ten years, in Christian education, and most responded as being somewhat Christ-like. Most of the participants were not happy in their relationship with God but looked forward to deepening their relationship with Him. All ministry leaders were informed that their participation was strictly voluntary and that no names or other identifying information were being kept in reference to their responses.

The presentation of the project curriculum to the focus groups started with an attention-grabbing introduction. Hunter refers to this pre-instruction self-examination as the anticipatory set which prepares them for learning.\footnote{171 Madeline Hunter, \textit{Enhancing Teaching} (New York, NY: Pearson Publishing, 1994).} It is this anticipatory set or
conversation comparing worldviews that sparks conversation and focuses the student. However, this introductory conversation also possesses a provocative spiritual self-examination. The teacher-led discussion explores the deeply held presuppositions regarding the participants’ seldom-discussed responses to the world around them. In the anticipatory set, a circle was drawn and points plotted regarding the multiple facets of a humanistic worldview. Points of examination can include the value of life, gender, cultural significance, music, fashion, morality, existence, as well as other precepts.

The participants discovered the significance of their unexamined perspectives that affect their daily decisions. In this self-examination exercise, they realized the truth about the humanistic worldview as compared to the imago Christi identity illustrated in Chapter Four. The same topics were discussed regarding the Christian identity circle but from a biblical perspective and observing the diagrams recognized such clear distinctions between the two perspectives. The presenter was equally impacted by the lack of understanding of the presuppositions held by the students.

No assessments were developed for the anticipatory set discussion. However, the significance of several positive anecdotal statements provided a level of confidence that the discussion was revealing and impactful. The statements revealed a level of influence that presuppositions had on their reasoning.

**Spiritual Framework**

During the literature review research process, it was determined the project curriculum would be presented as a spiritual framework. More specifically, the spiritual framework would utilize a unique instructional approach through the development of
mental pictures or a conceptual framework. The spiritual framework would be fashioned in a storyboard format, plotted on a timeline, and presented to each focus group through a horizontal instructional approach.

There are several levels to the framework. Each level consists of one or two critical biblical themes with subsequent levels built atop the prior themes. Each theme possessed a chronological and/or thematic importance for its level placement as well as each succeeding level. An example of the first lesson was included in Chapter Four.

The lessons were presented in this order. The first lesson, Genesis, plotted on the timeline as the first level, included critical details behind the creation event including the *imago Dei* description. The second lesson-level of the spiritual framework is the angelic rebellion led by Lucifer resulting in the emergence of evil. The third lesson-level includes the Created’s three-pronged rebellion that separates him from and the Creator, effectively breaking the covenant agreement. Within each level are critical biblical themes that are taught in order of their importance for establishing the spiritual framework.

Assessing the Project Curriculum

Spiritual assessments were given to participants prior to the presentation and twenty days following the presentation. The spiritual assessment results were determined through the research tool of Dr. Todd Hall, called the Spiritual Assessment Inventory
The assessment tool questions are shown in Appendix 2. There are seventeen response items, with each item providing an opportunity for written response. The Likert-type scale ranged from *Not At All True* to *Very True*.

For Focus Group 1 (FG1), the pre-instruction results revealed that the vast majority of the group (15) experienced a sense of God’s presence daily (93%). Most respondents revealed a strong sense (very true) of their relationship with God. Of the respondents, thirteen indicated they frequently practiced regularly or daily the spiritual disciplines (87%). When asked if they had a sense of God’s calling on their life, nine indicated this was moderately true to very true (60%), with six indicating moderately true (40%). Despite the fact there appears to be a fair number of participants sensing God, one-third of them will withdraw in the face of sin. To the question *When I sin, I tend to withdraw from God*, five participants responded either moderately true to very true (33%). However, the confidence the respondents have in their capacity to reflect Christ-like character socially was significant. Eleven of fifteen (73%) responses indicated they were very true or substantially true which revealed a positive spiritual life. If those selecting the moderately true were included in that percentage, then fully 93% of FG1 reflected a positive spiritual life in social settings. Socially, FG1 perceived they were a reflection of Christ, but privately, almost half (46%) of the respondents indicated they felt at least moderately concerned that God would punish them for sin.

The voluntary response dropped markedly in the post-assessments for FG1, only seven participants responded. However, the results did not reflect a drop in participant
enthusiasm. When asked about sensing God’s presence daily, six of seven (86%) responded very true or substantially true. In response to the question regarding sensing God’s involvement in directing their lives, all of them (100%) indicated they were aware of God’s leading. When asked about their withdrawal from God in the face of sin, six of seven (86%) did not have the tendency to withdraw from God following sin as compared to the 33% who did withdraw in the pre-instruction assessment. While it was a smaller sample, there seemed to be a slight improvement in spiritual maturity in the post-assessment.

Interestingly, there were marginal differences between Focus Group 1 and groups 2 and 3 in the pre-instruction assessment. All response items identified revealed percentages within five to seven percentage points. However, both FG2 and FG3 demonstrated the most interest in a dialogue following the presentation than the first group. The anticipatory set discussion elicited a great degree of engagement, leaning in, and spiritual epiphanies. The presentation of the lessons resulted in the connecting the dots of previous biblical training for the many of the participants.

Without a doubt, the voluntary submission of the assessments was extremely low. In FG1, there were fifteen pre-instruction responses and seven post responses (47%). In FG2, there were twelve submitted pre-instruction responses and four post-instruction responses (33%). Finally, of the eleven participants in FG3, only seven completed pre-assessments. Only three returned the post-assessment. There were little to no changes between pre- and post-assessments for FG3.
Chapter 6

Conclusions
The mantra of BCC is that “life change occurs in the context of relationships.” Unfortunately, if the spiritual framework is not built on a firm foundation, then spiritual formation will not take place. Therefore, if the individuals in these relationships have nominal spiritual formation, then their followers will be the same. Ministry leaders possessing a strategy for leading their understudies into deeper relationship with God must also possess a spiritual framework grounded in the Christian identity.

Within this chapter are the final discussions regarding the research steps of this dissertation. The focus is on what the research results mean. The chapter is in three parts: a review, reflections and surprises, and final thoughts.

**Review**

The original intent of this research was to explore the establishment of a new leadership approach that would build capacity in leaders to lead their coaches and volunteers. As a consequence, the first intensive interview was designed to inquire about how a new leadership model would enhance the work of the church. The results of the first interview altered the direction of this study leading the researcher to search for a more effective approach to equip ministry leaders to specifically disciple their understudies. As a consequence, this researcher focused on the process of spiritual formation.

During the spiritual formation research, a closer examination of the dynamics in teaching and learning revealed a step that has been overlooked in the studies of spiritual
formation. Before embarking on this examination of the missing step, a discussion regarding Chapter Two and fundamental issues like human experience, learning and knowing, recognition of the self in relationship to the supernatural, and the presuppositions regarding reality is in order. The literature review in Chapter Three provided a background for navigating the research of spiritual formation to the point that it led to leadership. However, good Christian leadership also means that a leader is a disciple maker or teaching and instructing others in being conformed to image of Christ.

The *imago Christi* transformation requires a foundation in scriptural authority, a thematic theology, and a relational hermeneutic. The research led to a specific focus on the basic structure underlying the development of a mental picture or cognitive framework. In this area of study, the construct will be referred to as a spiritual framework. The research began with a discussion regarding the presuppositions of worldviews and developing a spiritual framework that is grounded in the word of God, which is the Christian identity.

The research found in the previous chapters culminated in the development of the project curriculum. The focus was on a specific but little-understood area of spiritual formation. Spiritual framework was the missing step. The amount of scholarship done in the area of spiritual formation is voluminous. The goal of this scholarship is to deepen the believer’s relationship with God. However, between the believer’s prayer for salvation and a dependent and deepened relationship with God is the spiritual growth journey. At the ends of this journey are the greatest points of theological study and research. Building on a firm foundation is the biblical directive, and the firm foundation is the development of a spiritual framework.
The development of the project curriculum led to an instruction and teaching approach that established the spiritual framework as the firm foundation. The instructional program begins with an exploration of worldviews and then builds on establishing a whole-Bible thematic instruction. The lesson plans used a scaffolding instructional methodology that began with exhibiting the progressive steps that God used to build relationship with the Created. The aim of Chapter Four was the administration of an assessment to measure the effectiveness of the project curriculum.

A critical issue to examine is the transformation of becoming Christ-like and then teaching this process to ministry leaders in order to equip them to be disciple makers. It is the basis of the instructional (project) curriculum for ministry leaders to learn and use in their discipleship responsibilities. As a final note, the literature review revealed the leadership/discipleship challenges in their more descriptive approach to discipleship.

Reflections and Surprises

The following reflections examine several issues leading up to the development of the project curriculum and its presentation. First, understanding current leadership research was critical. As previously stated, the original goal of this dissertation was the development of a leadership model. Through the coursework for this doctorate, the researcher determined that leadership models fell into one of three categories. The largest and most common category is referred to as humans leading humans. One article after another reflected this relationship. The second group is a more recent development:
humans serving humans. This group, commonly referred to as servant leadership, grew out of the work of Robert Greenleaf. Finally, a literature review revealed little research being done in this third group, humans serving God, and until recently has emerged as an alternative leadership model. The most appropriate description of this group is Spirit-empowered leadership or Spirit-led leadership. Interestingly, during the interview with Pastor 1, it was determined that the proposed leadership model required Spirit-led people. Unfortunately, Spirit-empowered ministry leaders are built on the firm foundation of scriptural truth. Consequently, the focus of this dissertation shifted to developing the discipleship skills of ministry leaders. This third group requires leaders to possess a spiritual proclivity within the workplace.

A second issue came from a short personal story that impacted this researcher. Years ago, as a college freshman, I discovered a learning disability. Not surprisingly, the cognitive challenges were not caught in high school because of good phonetic training. I was a good sight-reader, a good speller, and successful in math, all of which created a cover for the disability. In college, the depth of the learning challenge was realized. Fortunately, through developing some consistent strategies for studying and personal research in learning psychology, I discovered the missing cognitive processing steps to learn how to learn. The learning challenges were not the result of any brain injury or neuro-physiological impairment. In short, I did not know how to learn. The discovery was recognizing that the lack of good information processing skills negatively impacted comprehension (garbage in, garbage out). Some professors said it was an information processing issue, while others maintained it was an issue with cognitive constructionism. What became clear was my inability to build effective cognitive pictures, or mental
frameworks. I discovered that every academic discipline or body of knowledge possessed a framework or outline for understanding. I began to realize that, to organize a report, analyze arguments, or synthesize data to create, a methodology for thinking must be developed. The first step to understanding any body of knowledge requires an ability to perceive, interpret, and organize the corresponding framework. A thinking methodology requires an organized framework to build on.

It seemed counterintuitive; I had the ability to build the cognitive structures for processing math functions but not for writing an organized paper in a high school English class. The experiences provided a basis to develop an organized information processing approach to learning. The more critical factor was recognizing that the knower possessed the capacity to direct the operations of the mind.

A third issue pertained to the results of the first interview that changed the course of this research. As previously mentioned, it was during this constructed interview that Pastor 1 revealed he was not in need of a new leadership model. Instead, he needed the ministry leaders to develop a more engaging, relationship-building approach to their leadership. Moreover, intensive interviews with Pastors 2 and 3 uncovered the same concern for developing within ministry leaders a heart to disciple the coaches and volunteers. Consequently, one of the researcher’s goals in the literature review was to find a discipleship program embedded in a leadership approach for ministry leaders.

The review was challenging. The plethora of leadership models did not contain the specific framework desired. Spiritual disciplines and biblical studies were the only choices; discipleship more closely reflected a pastor’s goal. The needs did not change. The ministry leaders were great taskmasters, and the pastors hired for it. The pastors
believed these men and women of God would, in fact, disciple the understudies or, at the very least, desire to learn how to grow their teammates’ spiritually, but they did not.

Making the enigma more challenging was the presumption that, because ministry leaders were successful task managers, possessed adequate biblical knowledge, and enough spirituality to be hired, that they would disciple the coaches and volunteers. The presumption was problematic because the ministry leaders would get the job done with excellence; they were wonderful people, but they were not spiritually prepared to lead their coaches and volunteers in spiritual growth. The ministry leaders understood their own spiritual formation, but not well enough to teach it to others. The discovery by pastors that ministry leaders did not possess enough knowledge, nor did they have the acumen to instruct and teach the disciples, caused the pastors to spend their valuable time coaching the ministry leaders as well as the understudies. This realization exposed the spiritual gap between being a new believer and a Spirit-led believer. More importantly, becoming a Spirit-empowered leader would likely not follow. A ministry leader with a nominal working faith cannot be expected to make disciples. The prerequisite spiritual framework is missing.

The fourth issue pertained to the development of a spiritual framework (Chapter Four). In academe, there have been many discussions regarding frameworks of academic disciplines. Mental frameworks exist within most disciplines or any body of knowledge to trace its development and assist the learner in developing a cognitive mental structure of pertinent information. In short, a mental framework is a description of a person’s thought processes regarding how something works in reality.
Historically, this cognitive biblical structure of God’s Word has followed a systematic or biblical theological approach. Unfortunately, a new believer is often unable to grasp that this body of knowledge. Consequently, the spiritual framework must be parsimonious and provide a more practical and working knowledge of what it means to be a disciple. The spiritual framework must be fundamentally sound theologically and provide a clear understanding of the God narrative. The spiritual framework must be a firm foundation to build upon. Learning how to learn about the God story for all believers is critical to being a disciple.

It was the application of this learning-how-to-learn process that was applied to the development of the project curriculum. The development of a curriculum for spiritual framework must be primarily instructive. The literature review revealed that the vast majority of current spiritual frameworks lack the instructive component and are descriptive in design. Not finding the spiritual framework forced this researcher to consider reviewing instructional strategies in education. That search resulted in a review of the traditional learning strategies.

No one has the opportunity or time, like Jesus’ disciples, to spend every day for three years with a master teacher. Therefore, the project curriculum is designed to be a biblically based instruction for developing the spiritual framework, not only in ministry leaders, but also in the minds of new, young, or ill-trained believers as well. The result of this researcher’s work was the development of a working spiritual framework based on theological themes and a relational hermeneutic that provides a basis for the believer to deepen their relationship with God and become Spirit-led.
The need for a unique approach to developing and implementing a spiritual framework came with a two-fold challenge. First, there was a need to develop a non-traditional theological instruction that works for all levels of learners; second, and most importantly, there was a need to develop a lesson design that would create a spiritual framework that was effective for the most biblically illiterate. The steps taken were the results of deep thinking about the instructional design, accompanied by prayer. Every thoughtful move has been enlightenment from the Holy Spirit. One could call the instructional design a spiritual epiphany, a word of wisdom, or like Peter, a heavenly download. Jesus told Peter that he did not arrive at the “Messiah” understanding by himself, but that it came from above. It must be stated without reservation that this researcher gives God all the glory for the creation of the spiritual framework.

To summarize, this researcher began with a focus on the creation of a new leadership model. However, the research took the study in another direction. It was determined that something was missing prior to leadership because ministry leaders lacked the skill set to disciple the coaches and volunteers. Church leaders are looking for the next generation of leaders. The early findings of this study guided the research direction into a cleft in the rock regarding leadership development exposing a pre-leadership training component that was missing. The missing piece was the development of a spiritual framework, a framework that captures the understanding of one’s relationship with God and His focus. More specifically, the spiritual framework leads and grounds one’s Christian identity. Clearly, the difficulty is in the spiritual growth of the ministry leader. Disciple making will be a challenge until the ministry leader allows the identity in Christ, through a spiritual framework, to permeate the heart to create a life of
worship. The spiritual disciplines will guide the heart into deeper relationship, but the firm foundation is found in the spiritual framework and required for stabling the *imago Christi*. It is the thematic theology that energizes the framework and the relational hermeneutic that binds one another as the body of Christ.

**Final Thoughts**

A couple of key issues exist as to why there has been little development of more innovative discipleship curriculum. First, few ministry leaders or mature Christians possess an understanding of learning. Therefore, relying on educational products or the creation of innovative in-house literature ignores the need for creating a spiritual framework to teach spiritual formation. As a consequence, church leadership has followed the traditional “top down” vertical instructional process. Second, in addition to the lack of good curricular materials for teaching a spiritual framework, the pastors lack an understanding of cognitive development, instructional design, and spiritual formation. Lacking this understanding of the development of a spiritual framework results in an inability to lead the ministry leaders, and ministry leaders to lead the understudies.

The lessons were developed using a horizontal instructional method, which appears to lend itself to better mental coding (learning) over a shorter time span than traditional instructional approaches. Unfortunately, the assessments do not necessarily reflect a change in the participants’ spiritual growth, but neither are the results negative. Therefore, it cannot be stated that the project curriculum produced the desired positive
results. However, upon further evaluation, the surprising number of positive anecdotal responses left this researcher encouraged.

Piaget developed a way of understanding how humans learn. His work understood human experience as the fundamental piece in learning. From experience, he depicted learning as a process of identification and categorizing. As humans learn, even from infancy, they place the new experience with something previously learned, or they build a new mental framework for each of these concrete, lived experiences. He refers to this collection of knowledge as schemes and we use the schema to interpret our reality. It is the same for the unseen realm. The imago Dei provides the capacity for a spiritual framework critical to understanding the unseen and the initiation of a personal faith.

The good news is on two issues. First, the spheres of self-examination revealed a practical approach to the unexamined life for disciples. The anticipatory set is in response to the Pauline directive to self-examine startled and grabbed the attention of all participants. Second, the lessons provided a realistic approach to spiritual formation. The key to positive spiritual formation is the spiritual framework. The lack of a spiritual framework has stunted the spiritual growth of many. The results of this study have given ministry leaders a starting point when guiding the understudies and volunteers in their spiritual formation. Consequently, the implications are crucial to improving discipleship programs. More importantly, a further longitudinal study is necessary and will follow this research. Connecting the dots from the new believer’s commitment to the faith, to become a Spirit-led disciple, to a Spirit-empowered leader requires more critical study, but the implications for the Church are far reaching.
Bibliography


**APPENDIX 1**

**Lesson Plans 1-10**

**Lesson 1 – Genesis A & Revelation O**

The God Story
Intended Learning Outcomes
1) Explain a theological theme (overarching theme – everlasting love)
2) Identify and describe the overarching theme of revelation
3) Identify the Creation Garden & Revelation Garden
4) Explain the story connections

Review
Humanistic Worldview vs. Christian Identity

Objective
1. Discuss revelation
2. Understanding themes
3. Compare and contrast the Garden to Garden
4. Describe relational boundaries established by an agreement
5. Analyze the human qualities of the Created (Identity/Heart)

Introduction – God’s Story
When it comes to developing your identity, many things come into play. Your childhood experiences, your education, relationships, church and non-church influence you. Your identity is established in your heart. What you believe and your actions flow from your heart.

Theme Input 1 – The Human Experience (plot on the timeline)
Gen 1:1-2:25
Creation – days 1-5
Day 6 A & E
Imago Dei [1. God breathed spirit, 2. soul w/mind (cognition), will, emotions
3. Aesthetic ability 4. Dependence on God 5. fruit of the spirit 6. Heart
(Jer17:9/Pro 4:23]
Dominion Covenant
Choice

Theme Input 2 – Plot on timeline
Revel 21-22 – read 21:1-8
New heaven & New earth
New Jerusalem
God dwells with us
Critical Theme - everlasting loving relationship
Check for Understanding
1. A worldview vs. identity
2. What is a theme?
3. What does revelation mean?
4. Explain the term covenant.
5. Discuss the qualities of the imago Dei for the Created.
6. Let’s discuss how the dominion covenant means its parameters and the value of choice.

REVIEW
At the end of the lesson, the presenter will highlight critical issues in the first two thematic events.

He creates them in His image, (Imago Dei) Created with a soul that houses our mind, will, and emotions and responsible for our decision-making process.

- Created with a heart to discern everything. It holds the attitudes, beliefs, and values conditioned by experience, education, and suffering, all provide experience for our minds.
- They are given life with a God-breathed spirit.
- He gives them the cognitive ability to interpret the world around us (mind & thinking). He assigns them the task of naming the animals and care for the garden.
- God gives them the aesthetic ability to discern beauty in the world around them with their five senses (touch, taste, smell, hearing, sight).
- They are totally dependent upon Him.

Lesson 2 – The Emergence of Evil

The Timeline

L.4
L.3 Rebellion Judgment* Obedience
L.2 | Emergence of Evil

L.1 | Alpha - Creation/Eden | Revelation/Eden – Omega

REVIEW – review the worldview/identity discussion
- Creation – days 1-5 (setting the stage)
- Day 6 A & E with God in the Garden
- OT - Imago Dei
  1. God breathed spirit
  2. soul w/mind (cognition), will, emotions
  3. aesthetic ability
  4. dependence on God
  5. fruit of the spirit
  6. heart (Jer17:9/Pro 4:23)
- Dominion Covenant & Choice

Intended Learning Outcomes

Input 1
1) Discuss Lucifer
2) Identify the origin of evil
3) Describe God’s Heavenly Host (angels)
4) Lucifer is now Satan & the angels are now demons

Input 2
1) Understand the choice and the rebellion
2) Knowledge, understanding, wisdom
3) Explain and interpret the two critical conversations
4) OT for spiritual formation (believe, trust, accept the plan)

Objectives
Theme Input 1 – Evil Ez. 28:13-19
1. Lucifer – filled with pride
2. Guardian angel – he knew Eden
3. Lucifer’s heart – Isaiah 14:12-14
4. Lucifer’s mission – John 10:10
5. What kind of battle is it? Eph. 6:12
6. Influence on this age 2 Cor. 4:4

Introduction
 Evil is not of God! Evil came into existence through Lucifer’s rebellion against God. In Ezekiel 28:11-19, we find the story, but we also find passages in Isaiah revealing the heart of Lucifer.

Theme Input – God’s Angels
Let’s consider the place of angels in creation…
1) They are created prior to Creation (Job 38:7, Ps. 148:2-5)
2) They live w/God & can be dispatched to complete for job (Is. 6:1-6, Dan. 7:10, Heb. 2:22)
3) They do God’s will (Num. 22:22, Ps. 103:20-21, Matt. 28:2)
4) They protect God’s people (Ps. 91:11, Acts 12:7-10)
5) They give guidance (Acts 8:26 & 27:23-24)

What do fallen angels do?
1) One third of the angels were successfully called away from God… (2 Peter 2:4)
2) Demons can detain angels (Daniel 10:13)
3) Demons separate believers (Rom. 8:38-39)
4) Demons work through false teachers (2 Thess. 2:9-10)
5) Demons oppose the body of Christ (Rev. 12:3-6 & 13-17)
6) Demons oppose the angels in the unseen (Rev. 12:7-9)

Check for Understanding the O & C Themes
✓ Where does evil come?
✓ Explain Lucifer’s mission?
✓ Discuss the influence on this culture
✓ Describe the two critical events: Emergence of Evil
✓ What are the three critical issues in the broken covenant?
✓ The banishment lays the foundation for the upcoming Passover and sacrificial system.

Lesson 3 – Rebellion and Obedience

The Timeline

L.6 Ecclesiastes, Job, Sermon on the Mount
L.5 Abraham/Covenant Moses/Covenant Jesus/New Covenant
Introduction
Adam and Eve face off with the deceiver (evil). The poor choices made by A&E and its horrific outcome.

Theme Input – Rebellion (*Critical theme – choice)
1) Eden Rebellion Gen. 3.
✓ Did He really say? (Don’t believe God’s Word.)
✓ You will not surely die. (Don’t trust God’s sovereignty.)
✓ You will be like God. (Choose your own destiny.)
✓ Fear coursing through their veins & they hide
✓ Blaming God, man, and Satan

Theme Input – Obedience in the Wilderness
The same three ideas were posed to Jesus.
1) God’s Word – rock to food, words from the mouth of God
2) God’s Sovereignty – no mocking God and toying with His sovereignty
3) God’s Vision – God’s plan for your life is the only plan

Theme Input – Judgment & Preservation
Post-rebellion Judgment
Banished – not to return to tree of life (remain in rebellion = shame & guilt)
Sacrificed Animal (clothes) – (shed blood to cover shame and guilt)

Transition - Adam, Eve, and family were left to work the soil to survive. It was probably 750-1250 years later when God said, “My Spirit will not contend with man forever, for he is mortal; his days will be a hundred and twenty years” Gen. 6:3 (NIV). Unfortunately, humankind grew worse. In Gen. 6:5-6 (NIV) the writer notes that, “the Lord saw how great man’s wickedness on the earth had become and that every inclination of the thoughts of his heart was only evil all the time. The Lord was grieved that he had made man on earth, and his heart was filled with pain.” This is the point that God decided to cleanse the earth and he established a covenant with Noah.

They do not take responsibility for their actions...
- Adam blames God and the woman He gave him
- Eve blames the serpent

Then, Cain and Abel… the word sin is used.

Adam and Eve are created a little lower than the angels, but they are crowned with glory and honor (Ps. 8:5). However, man has a chance for redemption; angels don’t have that
option. Temptation and evil do NOT come from God; it comes from Satan (Matt. 4:3 & 1 Peter 5:8).

Lesson 4 – The Expansion of Evil  
(Cain, Flood, Babel)

The Timeline

L.6  Ecclesiastes, Job, Sermon on the Mount

L.5  Abraham/Covenant  Moses/Covenant  Jesus/New Covenant
L.4 **Flood - Expansion of Evil - Babel**

L.3 Rebellion Judgment* Obedience

L.2 **Emergence of Evil**

L.1 Creation/Eden____________________Revelation/Eden

**REVIEW**

Let’s consider wrong thinking: *Valued by humanistic culture “in the world”*

- They doubt the *Word of God*, the absolute *supremacy of truth* “no absolute truth
- They doubt that God is who He says He is, *absolute sovereignty* “self-rule
- They experience *discontentment* and ponder a new *will* for their lives “self-determination
- They begin to create a *vision* of what it would be, to be like Him “self-reliance
- They experience a sense a *control over their own destiny* “self-autonomy
- They consider *independence* from God to be on their own “self-actualization
- They determine the fruit is *pleasing to the sight, good for food*… “self-gratification
- And the wisdom to be like God. They believe *they are right.* “self-righteousness

**Background – The historical events:** It has been thousands of years since the broken relationship between God and the Created, the shedding of blood, the banishment of Adam and Eve from the Garden, and the conversation between God and Cain.

What God said about his creation…genealogy is provided in Gen. chapters 4 and 5. The history traces the multiplication of humankind on earth and how mankind, ignoring God, became so evil that God said, “My Spirit shall not strive with man forever, because he also is flesh; nevertheless his days shall be one hundred and twenty years” (Gen 6:3 NIV).

**Theme Input 1**

*Cain*

Gen. 4 – v. 6, God speaks to Cain about his anger and lets him know that anger will be vulnerable to sin. The first time sin is found in the Word. Cain slays Abel. Important note: God holds **mankind responsible for individual thoughts and actions**.

Unfortunately, that was not enough direction and mankind grew worse. “Then the Lord saw that the wickedness of man was great on the earth, and that every intent of the thoughts of his heart was only evil continually (Gen. 6:5 NIV).

And became so wicked that God “was sorry that He had made man on the earth, and He was grieved in His Heart” (Gen. 6:6 NIV).

**Theme Input 2**

*Noah – The Earth-cleansing flood*

Now God decided to start over…the need for an earth-cleansing event (Gen. 6:6), the flood. God still holds man accountable for his behavior because man is still in the image of God (Gen. 9:6 NIV). And, man still has stewardship responsibility.
Gen. 6:6-9:9 – And the covenant established with Adam was re-established with Noah and the rainbow covenant. The sons went in different directions on the earth.

**Theme Input 3**

**Babel – A ziggurat of pride**
A ziggurat that reaches to heaven to make a “name” for themselves…pride. God gives them different languages, and they spread out across the lands. However, it still isn’t enough. Instead of contending with mankind’s wickedness and bringing about a separating event (Babel), languages bonded together in different parts of the earth.

**Review - Critical Themes**
The same three ideas were posed to Jesus.
1) God’s Word – rock to food, words from the mouth of God
2) God’s Sovereignty – no mocking God and toying with His sovereignty
3) God’s Vision – God’s plan for your life is the only plan

---

**Lesson 5 – Abraham – Moses—Jesus: The Followers and Covenants**

**The Timeline**

| L.6 | Ecclesiastes, Job, Sermon on the Mount |
| L.5 | Abraham/Covenant   | Moses/Covenant | Jesus/New Covenant |
Important Themes – three critical issues in God’s loving relationship with us

1) Believe God’s Word (Matt. 4:4).
2) Trust God’s Sovereignty (Psalm 104; 147:8-9 & 14-18; 148:1-12).
3) Submit to God’s Will (Plan) for our lives (Proverbs 16:9).

Critical Themes Review – everlasting love relationship, shedding blood, dominion agreement, emergence of evil, AE rebellion (choice), fear and hiding.

BACKGROUND
God called out a righteous man to lead and he did. God led them. God tells Abram – God is his shield and your great reward (Gen, 15:1 NIV). God will make Abraham great and the father of nations (Gen. 12:1-4).
Abraham was called out of his culture, reality, security, and comfort zone. God tells Abraham that…
- he will be the father of a many nation, shield – your great reward is My protection
- he will be blessed (Gen. 12:1-3)
- he will receive land (Gen. 12:7)
- he will build an altar to honor God

A People Follow Abraham – He is blessed by God - Bondage
Leads those WHO WILL BELIEVE! After Abraham comes his son Isaac, grandson Jacob (12 sons), and great-grandson Joseph. Following years of a great relationship with Egypt comes years of hardship in bondage to massive building projects. The Hebrew slaves worked tirelessly for four hundred years as foretold to Abraham.

Covenantal Structure

Theme Input 1 – Abrahamic Covenant
Do not be afraid (Gen. 15:1): This is the first time that fear was addressed since Adam’s confession and hiding in the Garden. It is a significant theme until the Christic covenant.

Covenant Dream (Gen. 15:12-18): The covenant is an overarching theme. The Egyptian bondage foretold. The two covenant partners in the dream are…
Smoking Oven – God
Flaming Torch – Jesus
God walks through the pieces of meat with Jesus to symbolize that restoration of all mankind is in the future and someone will pay the debt.

(Circumcision – seals the everlasting covenant) (Gen. 17:1-11)

**Theme Input 2 – Mosaic Covenant**
Moses is called by God to burning bush, on holy ground, by the great I AM
Moses leads the Hebrews out of Egypt to the edge of the Promised Land
Moses receives the commandments from God
Moses leads them to PL, but the people do NOT believe God will protect them from the giants in the land, so God sends them back to the wilderness
Moses cannot go in the PL because he took God’s glory for himself

(Commandments – accepting them as the seal)

**Theme Input 3 - Christic Covenant**
Jesus is the head of the body, the bridegroom
✓ He leads all those who want to repent, turn from their ways
✓ He is the head of the body
✓ He is the bridegroom, the Church is his bride
✓ He establishes a new covenant for all those that will believe

Blood shed by Jesus – accepting the work of Jesus on the Cross – Communion for believers

**RELATIONSHIP - This is our directive in the New Covenant…Critical Devotion – Spiritual Discipline**

Koch & McNaughton – The Attributes of Jesus and Learning to Follow…
Be with Jesus
➢ Remain in Him
➢ Recognize Fruit
➢ Read Scripture
➢ Be with Christ in Prayer
➢ Manage Life
➢ How remaining in Him affects Others

---

Lesson 6 – Exodus and Resurrection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Timeline</th>
<th>Exodus</th>
<th>Resurrection</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>L.7</td>
<td>Ecclesiastes, Job, Sermon on the Mount</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Important Themes – three critical issues in God’s loving relationship with us

1) Believe God’s Word (Matt. 4:4).
2) Trust God’s Sovereignty (Psalm 104; 147:8-9 & 14-18; 148:1-12).
3) Submit to God’s Will (Plan) for our lives (Proverbs 16:9).

Critical Themes Review – everlasting love relationship, shedding blood, dominion agreement, evil & AE rebellion (choice), fear and hiding, freedom from bondage

Input Theme 1 – Exodus
This critical biblical story has been told over and over again. The most critical details:
1) leaving your comfort zone
2) freed by God and dependent on God when you don’t know where you are headed
3) leaving the confines of bondage and given freedom from earthly powers

Input Theme 2 – Resurrection
Again, another story told for two millennia. Giving His life, He takes our punishment; giving His life is the example of no greater love; His death restores us to relationship with God; this perfect love drives out fear. The most critical details:
1) leaving your comfort zone
2) restored to God and dependent on God when you don’t know where you are headed
3) leaving the confines of spiritual bondage and given freedom through Resurrection

RELATIONSHIP - The Resurrection provides to each one who believes…
Koch & McNaughton – The Attributes of Jesus and Learning to Follow…
- Be Joy-filled
- Go to the Source
- See Jesus in Scripture
- Overcome temptation
- Be Productive

Lesson 7 – Ecclesiastes, Commandments, and Sermon on the Mount

The Timeline

L.8 Good Soil Fruit of the Spirit
Ecclesiastes, Job, Sermon on the Mount
Exodus Resurrection

Abraham/Covenant Moses/Covenant Jesus/New Covenant

Flood - Expansion of Evil - Babel

Rebellion Judgment* Obedience

Emergence of Evil

Creation/Eden________________Revelation/Eden

Review
✓ Reminder: Observation/Interpretation and Worldview/Identity.
✓ Ecclesiastes - Solomon presents a sober, but objective view of life outside God’s plan. This perspective is stoic and in many areas considered existentialist thinking.

Intended Learning Outcomes
1) Believe God’s Word (or things go wrong).
2) Trust the Sovereignty of God (or things go wrong).
3) Submit to God’s purpose (will) for your life.
4) There is only one goal, leading people to God.

Introduction
1. We must learn from God: reason why we live and examine why we act the way we do.
2. We must have a behavioral response that transforms the outward appearance.
3. We must slow down to see God’s interventions in our daily activities.

Theme Input 1 – Ecclesiastes – The Facts of Life & Living: nothing on this earth matters except for our relationship with God! Same conclusion as Job!
The authorship is in question, which in turn, makes the date of authorship in question. However, this writer attributes it to Solomon and written late in his life.

(Wisdom & Philosophy)
Profitless Cycle of Life (Intro 1:3-11)
Search for Meaning (1:12-2:26)
1. Everything is meaningless
2. Wisdom “
3. Pleasures “
4. Toil “
Futility (3:1-6:12)
Wisdom/Proverbs (7:1-8:1)
Life’s Frustration (8:2-17)
Life’s Common Destiny (9:1-12)
More Advice (9:13-11:6)
Advice to the young & old (11:7-12:8)

**Theme Input 2 – Commandments – This is what matters!**
At the foot of Mt. Sinai searching for his meaningfulness and future. When he encounters God in a burning bush.

- Holy ground… a sacred relationship (Ex. 3)
- I Am Who I Am (v. 14)
- He believed His word, sovereignty, will (righteous and humble man)
- He returns to Egypt and leads the Hebrews out of bondage (Red Sea) (4:18)
- Through the desert to Promised Land (40 yrs.)
- God is leading and begins establishing relational boundaries
- The Law presented, Ark and synagogue are built
- Covenant continues…
- Initial arrival at the Promised Land (Numbers 13) Lack trust and rebel
- Return to wandering the desert due to unbelief (40 yrs)
- Moses’ mistake (Num. 20)
- Arrive at Promised Land & Joshua begins the conquest (Joshua 1-3)

**Theme Input 3 – The Sermon on the Mount**
Jesus has been through the wilderness. He knows what it means to long for relationship.
His first teaching as rabbi is the Sermon on the Mount. It begins with the progressive steps leading through spiritual formation. The spiritual framework follows with each parable as He begins to distinguish between the love for the law and the law of love.

1) poor in spirit 
2) mourning 
3) meek 
4) hunger and thirst for righteousness 
5) merciful 
6) pure in spirit 
7) peacemakers

**RELATIONSHIP - Critical Devotion – Spiritual Discipline**
Koch & McNaughton – Attributes – Sermon on the Mount encourages the renovated heart to learn to heal:

- The Importance of Touch
- Recognize Jesus’ Authority
- Understand that Healing is God’s Idea
- Ask in Faith
- Give it Away

**Lesson 8 – Good Soil & Sermon on the Mount Parables**

The Timeline
Review…

We are zooming out… God establishing a people to announce the arrival of a Messiah and a Law His leaders: Judges, Prophets, Kings… resulting in overthrow, exile, silence

The poor choice made by Adam and Eve in the Garden and its horrific outcomes is made right by Jesus in the wilderness experience. In His first message from the Mount, he describes the transformation process.

Theme Input 1- The Good Seed - Matthew 13:1-23

God’s principles of behavior mean nothing unless our hearts receive them…

13 That same day Jesus went out of the house and sat by the lake. 2 Such large crowds gathered around him that he got into a boat and sat in it, while all the people stood on the shore. 3 Then he told them many things in parables, saying: “A farmer went out to sow his seed. 4 As he was scattering the seed, some fell along the path, and the birds came and ate it up. 5 Some fell on rocky places, where it did not have much soil. It sprang up quickly, because the soil was shallow. 6 But when the sun came up, the plants were scorched, and they withered because they had no root. 7 Other seed fell among thorns, which grew up and choked the plants. 8 Still other seed fell on good soil, where it produced a crop—a hundred, sixty or thirty times what was sown.

10 The disciples came to him and asked, “Why do you speak to the people in parables?” 11 He replied, “Because the knowledge of the secrets of the kingdom of heaven has been given to you, but not to them. 12 Whoever has will be given more, and they will have an abundance. Whoever does not have, even what they have will be taken from them. 13 This is why I speak to them in parables: ‘Though seeing, they do not see; though hearing, they do not hear or understand. 14 In them is fulfilled the prophecy of Isaiah: “You will be ever hearing but never understanding; you will be ever seeing but never perceiving. 15 For this people’s heart has become calloused; they hardly hear with their ears, and they have closed their eyes. Otherwise they might see with their eyes, hear with their ears, understand with their hearts and turn, and I would heal them.’” 16 But blessed are your eyes because they see, and your ears because they hear.

17 For truly I tell you, many prophets and righteous people longed to see what you see but did not see it, and to hear what you hear but did not hear it.
Listen then to what the parable of the sower means: When anyone hears the message about the kingdom and does not understand it, the evil one comes and snatches away what was sown in their heart. This is the seed sown along the path. The seed falling on rocky ground refers to someone who hears the word and at once receives it with joy. But since they have no root, they last only a short time. When trouble or persecution comes because of the word, they quickly fall away. The seed falling among the thorns refers to someone who hears the word, but the worries of this life and the deceitfulness of wealth choke the word, making it unfruitful. But the seed falling good soil refers to someone who hears the word and understands it. This is the one who produces a crop, yielding a hundred, sixty or thirty times what was sown.”

We all have these different types of soil in our hearts, and how we tend to our hearts determines the outcome of our journey with Christ. We have to keep and tend the garden of our heart so that our life produces the fruit God created us to produce.

Theme Input 2 – The Message Embedded in the Sermon on the Mount that reveals a renovated heart.
Sermon on the Mount, Matt 5… after Jesus describes the progressive process of developing a spiritual framework. You cannot move through these steps in your own efforts. They are developed in you through a spiritual relationship with God that results in a change of heart. The mind must be renewed, but the heart must be renovated. This is accomplished through a relationship with God. A renovated heart will align with the imago Christi

✓ Salt and light
✓ Fulfillment
✓ Attitude toward murder and anger in the heart
✓ Attitude toward wrong thoughts in the heart – Matt. 5:27-30
✓ Attitude toward marriage and divorce, have the right heart – Matt. 5:31-32
✓ Attitude toward others angry with you, have the right heart – Matt. 5:38-48
✓ Attitude toward giving, have the right heart toward God – Matt. 6:9-13
✓ Attitude toward conversation with God, a heart to talk with Him – Matt. 6:9-13
✓ Attitude toward worry, a heart toward dependence on God – Matt. 6:25-33
✓ Attitude toward judging others, let God have it, have the right heart Matt. 7:1-5
✓ Attitude toward righteousness – Matt. 7:13-14
✓ Attitude toward seeking His will – Matt. 7:7-11
✓ Attitude toward following God’s plan – Matt. 7:15-23
✓ Attitude toward building a strong spiritual framework – Matt. 7:24-27

Tending the Garden of our Hearts
My son, give attention to my words; Incline your ear to my sayings.
21 Do not let them depart from your eyes; Keep them in the midst of your heart; 22 For they are life to those who find them, And health to all their flesh.
23 Keep your heart with all diligence, For out of it spring the issues of life. (Prov. 4:21-23 NKJV)
How can we develop the kind of spirit that produces abundant fruit in the Kingdom of God?

➢ Developing a heart that has ears to hear Jesus
➢ Keeps the Word of God (Obedience)
➢ Gives attention to His Word
Keeps them in the midst of the heart (as opposed to losing them)

In Prov. 4:23, the word “keep” comes from the Hebrew Word ne·tzor, meaning “to watch, guard, keep”.

In Luke 8:15 the word “keep” comes from the Greek Word katechousin meaning ‘to hold fast’.

PAY ATTENTION: What we give attention, imagination to, eventually becomes belief and words in us, and then actions, and actions bring results.

His words had authority… Matt. 7:28-29 The New Covenant is a transformed heart!

7) Blessed are the peacemakers... the peacemaker understands the heart of God’s love. They recognize that spiritual warfare is fought as warriors of love. They recognize the obstacles of the flesh and a lack of surrender. They exhibit all the fruits of the Spirit. A peacemaker’s central concern is the Glory of God...for they will be called sons and daughters of God.

6) Blessed are the pure in heart... a merciful heart leads to one pure in heart. This attitude is one of joyful discipline. The heart is a center of our created being and contains both goodness and trouble. The pure in heart are in a state of goodness and continuous conversation with God. Meaningfulness and the value of all people and things are seen through the eyes of God...for they will see God.

5) Blessed are the merciful... This person has been poor in spirit, mourned, and is in submission. They act in love and now see the lost as slaves to sin. They are merciful to others because God was merciful to them. This believer totally understands the depth and value of God’s mercy. An overflowing heart of mercy...for they will be shown mercy.

4) Blessed are those that hunger and thirst for righteousness... gentleness leads the believer to place great value on righteous and wholesome living. Righteousness is gratefully obedient behavior. It is now a loving communion with the Holy Spirit. A soul deep peace comes through Biblical knowledge in order to be conformed to the image of Christ. No longer is Christ-like behavior considered impossible...for they will be filled.

3) Blessed are the meek... through their mourning they recognize God's love for them. The believer experiences God’s intimate forgiveness. They have submitted their will to God. The Holy Spirit fills them with tenderness toward others. They find peace and the heart breaks for those not experiencing this newfound peace. They discover their only HOPE is in God, and the blessing...for they will inherit the earth.

2) Blessed are those who mourn... from a broken spirit one mourns our past sinful behavior. The downcast will mourn daily for the way in which they have treated others and our God. Mourning and suffering leads one to joy and comfort in the Holy Spirit. Through our self-examination, we are sickened, by our past sin. Then comes healing and a peace beyond our experience...for they will be comforted.

1) Blessed are the poor in spirit... God loves a broken and contrite heart because it is here that we are listening. Daily we face the Holy Spirit and recognize our selfish human nature.
We discover we are totally dependent upon God. God fills us with His Holy Spirit and begins the transformation within us. This is a conscious decision that we daily surrender our desire to live our own lives. It is accomplished daily as we live in His presence ...for theirs is the kingdom of heaven.

RELATIONSHIP - Critical Devotion – Spiritual Discipline
Koch & McNaughton – Attributes – Learning to Love
- Trust God
- Seek God’s Approval
- Enjoys God Acceptance
- Partner with God to Change You
- Enjoy God’s Presence

Lesson 9 – The Fruit of the Spirit and the Armor

The Timeline

L.10 Spiritual Gifts  Spiritual Talents
L.9  Fruit of the Spirit              Armor of God
L.8  Good Soil                      Sermon on Mount Heart
L.7  Ecclesiastes, Job, Sermon on the Mount
L.6  Exodus                         Resurrection
L.5  Abraham/Covenant               Moses/Covenant                Jesus/New Covenant
L.4  Flood - Expansion of Evil - Babel
L.3  Rebellion                      Judgment*                         Obedience
L.2  Emergence of Evil
L.1  Creation/Eden____________________Revelation/Eden

Review
Jesus has brought us to a place where we understand the profound importance of the heart. The mind selects what it will to ponder, but our hearts tells our mind what to select.

In every parable, healing and story, Jesus is seeking a transformation of the heart that is grounded in…
1) believing,
2) trusting,
3) and following the will of the Father

He heals the sick and loves the lost. He creates a new covenant in the Upper Room. He instructs the disciples to remember the blood and that He is the bread of life. Jesus teaches and leads until his last breath. All of this happens because of two critical themes:

1) To teach the people of God about a new heart
2) To restore those seeking a new heart to God

Theme Input 1 – Fruit of the Spirit
Galatians 5:22-23
22 But the fruit of the Spirit is love, joy, peace, forbearance, kindness, goodness, faithfulness,23 gentleness and self-control. Against such things there is no law.
Fruit of the Spirit:
1) Perfect love drives out fear. Love is a choice, not a feeling. Love expresses itself that seeks the welfare of others. Biblical love is teaching young people about character, not emotion.

2) Joy - means an internal gladness and delight situated deep in our hearts. It is NOT happiness, it is a feeling of gladness based on our circumstances.
3) Peace - bring your worries, fears, and concerns to God and fill your mind with God’s truth. Securing peace means you will choose to think about the things of God.

4) Patience – if we the believer is dependent on God s/he will experience patience knowing that God has everything under control.

5) Kindness – is sweetness of behavior that is filled with integrity, but it is also generous in actions toward others

6) Gentleness – a kind of humility, like meekness, it is not weakness, but strength under control.

7) Goodness - goodness is a reflection of God’s mercy toward us and we share that mercy with others through goodness.

8) Faithfulness - is to be reliable or trustworthy. faithfulness is demonstrated toward the One who redeemed us and is a continued and submission and obedience to the same Spirit

9) Self-control - Those possessing God within, the Holy Spirit, have the strength to control our sinful desires and say “no” to our flesh and “yes” to the things of the Spirit.

Theme Input 2 – Armor of God

Eph. 6:10-18

10 Finally, be strong in the Lord and in his mighty power. 11 Put on the full armor of God, so that you can take your stand against the devil’s schemes. 12 For our struggle is not against flesh and blood, but against the rulers, against the authorities, against the powers of this dark world and against the spiritual forces of evil in the heavenly realms. 13 Therefore put on the full armor of God, so that when the day of evil comes, you may be able to stand your ground, and after you have done everything, to stand. 14 Stand firm then, with the belt of truth buckled around your waist, with the breastplate of righteousness in place, 15 and with your feet fitted with the readiness that comes from the gospel of peace. 16 In addition to all this, take up the shield of faith, with which you can extinguish all the flaming arrows of the evil one. 17 Take the helmet of salvation and the sword of the Spirit, which is the word of God. The idea behind the Armor of God is talking about all the spiritual formation that goes along with establishing each piece of armor.

The metaphor is a suit of armor, each representing a significant aspect of our spiritual growth and we need it all to be more than conquerors.

These take time, intentional practice, and authentic friendships to build into our walk with God. We do not just put them on verbally and then magically become better at these spiritual disciplines. Satan waits until we haven’t prayed for a couple of days, done Bible study for two weeks, missed church for a month, AND then we are tired… whamo…

➢ The Belt of Truth around your waist is a metaphor about strength. Truth always wins. Truth, but not merely truth as spoken; truth of idea, reality, sincerity, truth in the moral sphere "reality" as the opposite of illusion, i.e. fact.] Amplified translation defines as personal integrity, James 5:16, taking the ‘church mask’ off and being honest with another Christian soldier or mentor about our weaknesses and failures. It makes us
stronger. The belt held the entire suit of armor together. If we are living a lie, all of the rest of our spiritual defense and offense will unravel eventually.

- **The Breastplate of Righteousness** protects to do battle with right behavior. The NT term is used for righteousness or "God's judicial approval" and refers to what is deemed right by the Lord (after His examination), i.e. what is approved in His eyes. We are not perfect, but we are approved, accepted, and celebrated by the Judge of the Universe-God

Negative self-image and self-talk has sabotaged God’s plan in many, many lives. We need to say out loud every day, I am chosen and approved by God because I have accepted Christ. I am His favored child. Not perfect but in process by His Spirit, heading toward victory

Psalm 139, I am not tolerated, my Father calls me marvelous, He brags about me!

- **The Shod Shoes** keep us balanced and at peace in who we are. Having your feet fitted with the readiness of the gospel of peace is important when we are standing firm, unshakeable, as the King of the Mountain. The enemy wants to rattle us, to shake our peace, so that we: Give up ground and cower in a dark corner and hide our faith in Christ, Give up on His calling on our lives, Run from conflict in leadership

The message of Jesus Christ is not that we will always have peaceful waters to sail in, but that we can have peace in our hearts regardless of what the waves and storms of life. This supernatural stability comes to our feet by through an even balance.

- **The Shield of Faith** protects us from non-truth and to stand firm against fiery arrows. Faith is a belief, trust, confidence; fidelity, faithfulness. It protects against the non-truth or persecution as well as the ‘fiery’ arrows of doubt. In Numbers 14, 10 of the 12 spies ‘caught on fire’ with doubt, and it spread to the whole nation of Israel

Remaining confident in God’s Word and faithfulness, and resting in His promises protects us from this contagious doubt

- **The Helmet of Salvation** the helmet protects the understanding of who we are in Him. We are safe in our saving, bringing salvation. The enemy knows how to get us focused on the trials of this life. Paul told the Romans that the sufferings of this life are not even worthy to be compared with the glory that will be revealed.

- **The Sword of the Spirit** the Word of God is what we trust in conversations with others. The Word of God is the only weapon mentioned, and it is not actually a huge broad-sword as is commonly thought about this verse. It is a short sword or dagger properly, a slaughter-knife; a short sword or dagger mainly used for stabbing; (figuratively) an instrument for exacting retribution, a large knife, used for killing animals and cutting up flesh

The idea is one of close combat, finishing off the enemy by cutting through his lies, discouragements, distractions. For example, a thought hits you that you have served God for a while and you deserve less challenges in this life.

RELATIONSHIP - Critical Devotion – Spiritual Discipline
Koch & McNaughton – Attributes – Learning to Pray
Prayer is conversation with God. Jesus did this all the time!
Lesson 10 – Spiritual Gifts and Spiritual Talents

The Timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Spiritual Gifts</th>
<th>Spiritual Talents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>L.10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.9</td>
<td>Fruit of the Spirit</td>
<td>Armor of God</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Gifts of the Spirit are special abilities provided by the Holy Spirit to Christians for the purpose of building up the body of Christ. The list of spiritual gifts in 1 Corinthians 12:8-10 includes wisdom, knowledge, faith, healing, miracles, prophecy, discerning of spirits, speaking in tongues, and interpretation of tongues. The gifts of the Spirit are simply God enabling believers to do what He has called us to do.

"His divine power has given us everything we need for life and godliness through our knowledge of him who called us by his own glory and goodness." (2 Peter 1:3 NIV) The Holy Spirit provides the tools for accomplishing God’s will on earth.

Theme Input 1 - Gifts of the Spirit
There is some controversy as to the precise nature of each of the gifts of the Spirit, but here is a list of spiritual gifts and their basic definitions. Bottom line, the gifts are given by the Holy Spirit to carry out the work of God for them that are walking in His will.

- **Gift of wisdom** - the ability to make decisions and give guidance that is according to God's will.
- **Gift of knowledge** - the ability to have an in-depth understanding of a spiritual issue or situation.
- **Gift of faith** - being able to trust God and encourage others to trust God, no matter the circumstances.
- **Gift of healing** - the miraculous ability to use God's healing power to restore a person who is sick, injured, or suffering.
- **Gift of miracles** - being able to perform signs and wonders that give authenticity to God's Word and the Gospel message.
- **Gift of prophecy** - being able to proclaim a message from God.
• **Gift of discerning spirits** - the ability to determine whether or not a message, person, or event is truly from God.

• **Gift of tongues** - the ability to speak in a foreign language that you do not have knowledge of, in order to communicate with someone who speaks that language.

• **Gift of interpreting tongues** - the ability to translate the tongues speaking and communicate it back to others in your own language.

**Theme Input 2 - Spiritual Talents** – The talents are what we refer to at BCC as the core motivations. They are designed for the whole body to work together and God built them into us from the womb.

Romans 12:5-8 so in Christ we, though many, form one body, and each member belongs to all the others. We have different gifts, according to the grace given to each of us. If your gift is prophesying, then prophesy in accordance with your faith; if it is serving, then serve; if it is teaching, then teach; if it is to encourage, then give encouragement; if it is giving, then give generously; if it is to lead, do it diligently; if it is to show mercy, do it cheerfully.

Serving – be a server: to be a workhorse that meets the needs of others

Teaching – the ability to teach others about the Word of God

Encourager – one who exhorts other believers when discouraged or to get something done

Giving – someone who is very generous, behind the scenes and big helpers

Mercy – filled with compassion, they are there for others

Prophecy – they see the work of God, they have a vision for the work of His will

Leading – referred to as the gift of administration, they know what needs to get done

**APPENDIX 2**

**Spiritual Assessment Inventory**

*Directions to participants... Please rate each statement on a scale of 1-5 (see below), and then (optional) briefly (2-3) write quality sentences that explain your rating. Only your instructor will see this assessment, and all scores or*
responses will be submitted for quantitative and qualitative assessment purposes. Your response will be kept strictly confidential, and no identifying information will be requested or publicly reported.

1. I have a sense of God’s Presence and how he is working in my life

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

2. I frequently practice spiritual disciplines such as prayer, Bible study, services, etc.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

3. I seek to improve my relationship with God and others through spiritual practices.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

4. Sometimes it feels as if God is angry with me and wants to punish me.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:
5. Sometimes it feels as if God will give up on me.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

6. I have sense of God’s direction in my life.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

7. I have sense of God’s prompting to some tasks.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

8. There are times when I feel frustrated, angry, or disappointed with God.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:
9. In the times when/if I feel frustrated, angry, or disappointed with God, I still desire relationship with Him.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

10. My experiences of God’s responses in my life have a great impact on me.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

11. When I sin, I tend to withdraw from God.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

12. There are times when I question circumstances or situations that I am facing.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:
13. When/if I question circumstances or situations I am facing, I am still confident in God’s purpose being worked out in my life.

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

14. My Spiritual life is positively reflected through the ways I interact with friends, leaders, family members, and others I come in contact with.

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

15. When I sin, I fear what God will/might do to me.

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

16. I am aware God attending to me in times of need.

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
17. I am aware of God communicating to me in different ways.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not at All True</td>
<td>Slightly True</td>
<td>Moderately True</td>
<td>Substantially True</td>
<td>Very True</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please explain your rating in 2-3 quality sentences:

---

APPENDIX 3

BCC Coaches Training Manual

1. Grow Spiritually

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CIT Conversational class</th>
<th>Complete daily online modules.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intro to CIT Conversational class</td>
<td>There are no fill in the blanks with conversational class. Please bring a journal to take notes and your bible.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Takeaways from online videos</td>
<td>Daily video expressing an idea with a devotional scripture. Answer questions to discuss.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scripture</td>
<td>1 Peter 5:1-4; Ephesians 4:11-32, Matthew 6:9-13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q and A</td>
<td>Ministry specific. Practical Applications.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time for class</td>
<td>2 hours. Take attendance. Opening Ice breaker- Self Intros.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supplies needed:</td>
<td>Large sticky chart, Handouts: Coaches Covenant and Leadership Checklist.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open/Close in Prayer</td>
<td>Facilitator/Member of class.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Purpose of Coach in Training:**
To equip potential Coaches with biblical standards and practical applications to be excellent in any ministry.

**Housekeeping:**
The format will be 3 weeks of CIT, culminating in an all-campus Coach Commissioning on the 4th Saturday of month at EBC, where Ministry Leaders pass on the mantle of leadership.
- Must attend all classes.
- Videos and homework must be done.
- Be prepared to engage in conversation and share.
- The CIT content features videos on Trained Up with a daily leadership principle, a devotional scripture, a 2 min video and questions to answer for the weekly scheduled conversational class.

**Tell your Story:**

**Open with Listening Skills**- (What are some listening techniques? S-squarely face the person, O-open posture, L-lean in, E-Eye contact, R-Repeat what you heard)

**Pair up and share your story**- Set the tone of being a friend, carrying the vision of Pastor Randy. Be real, be transparent, have trust. Peer intros of each other (opportunity to listen well). Manage ‘rabbit’ trails when individuals share. Redirect. Give a total of 15 mins for discussion with each other and 3 mins for each of the recap intros.

**Coach in Training:**

**Purpose statement of a Coach**: “A Coach is a Leader of leaders who helps others to grow spiritually, build community and develop leaders”
The content is designed around the 3 elements in the Purpose statement of a Coach:
Week 1 CIT : Grow Spiritually/ what does this new role require of me?
Week 2 CIT : Build Community/ includes training your teams
Week 3 CIT : Develop Leaders/time stewardship

**Group activity:**
1 Peter 5:1-4

- Team list traits on flipchart.
- What does the role of Coach require of me?

Questions to discuss: Self Reflect. Pair up. Share as a group.
1) What is your time with God like?
2) What has God been talking to you about?
3) How do you hear from God?
4) How do you experience the presence of the Holy Spirit?
5) How does the Holy Spirit work in your life?

**Grow Spiritually:**
Is it actually possible to coach someone on how to grow spiritually?

**Spiritual Leadership:**
2) Partner with the Holy Spirit for your personal restoration. Who are you to God? Know your identity.
3) Spiritual Disciplines - What are they? Bible Study, Prayer, Worship, Solitude, Community, Fasting.

**Practical Applications:**
How would you do?
1) Face to face meetings: Model
   How do you encourage others to hear from God?
   How do you talk to your leaders about the Holy Spirit’s work in our life?

2) Prayer:
   Steps on how to pray:
   Leaders need to know how to pray and guide others to pray aloud.
   The Lord’s Prayer review. **Matthew 6:9-13** (NLT)

9 Pray like this: Our Father in heaven, may your name be kept holy. 10 May your Kingdom come soon. May your will be done on earth, as it is in heaven. 11 Give us today the food we need, 12 and forgive us our sins, as we have forgiven those who sin against us. 13 And don’t let us yield to temptation, but rescue us from the evil one.

146
3) Next steps:
   How do you invite someone through the Growth Track?
   How do you practice listening skills?
   What are some Spiritual disciplines? (bible, pray, worship, community, fasting, solitude) How do you help your leaders engage?

4) Crucial life situations:
   If a leader has heavy life circumstances they are facing i.e., sickness in family; child in accident or not following the Lord; complains about leadership, church, message, etc. Has an offence and unforgiveness. How do you communicate on these?

What you want them to:
Be - Self aware and living in Freedom.
Know - Your role as a Coach as in 1 Peter 5:1-4
Do - Practice Spiritual Disciplines.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>At Home Work</th>
<th>Handout: Coaches Covenant.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assignment</td>
<td>What are the qualities you need to work on to prepare your heart for the role of Coach as in 1 Peter 5:1-4. As a Leader of leaders, what are some behaviors to model for those you lead? Write out how you are equipped and prepared for the call as described in Ephesians 4:11-32.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Build Community

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CIT Conversational class</th>
<th>Complete weekly online class. Attendance.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intro to CIT Conversational class</td>
<td>There are no fill in the blanks with conversational class. Please bring a journal to take notes and your bible.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Takeaways from online videos</td>
<td>Daily video expressing an idea with a devotional scripture. Answer questions to discuss.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scripture</td>
<td>Acts 2:42-47, 2 Peter 1:3-1, Hebrews 6:10-11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q and A</td>
<td>Ministry specific. Practical Applications.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time for class</td>
<td>2 hours. Review homework from previous class.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Supplies needed: Large sticky chart, Handouts: Core Motivations and Bayside 5 card for Meals and Meeting

Open/Close in Prayer Facilitator/Member of class.

Purpose of a Coach:
“A Coach is a Leader of leaders who helps others to grow spiritually, build community and develop leaders”

How do we build community? Picture of church:

Read Acts 2:42-47
“They devoted themselves to the apostles’ teaching and to fellowship, to the breaking of bread and to prayer. Everyone was filled with awe at the many wonders and signs performed by the apostles. All the believers were together and had everything in common. They sold property and possessions to give to anyone who had need. Every day they continued to meet together in the temple courts. They broke bread in their homes and ate together with glad and sincere hearts, praising God and enjoying the favor of all the people. And the Lord added to their number daily those who were being saved.” -Acts 2:42-47

The church has been built on 1-on-1 relationships and small gatherings of believers. Can you meet with one other person and build a relationship with them? Can you gather some friends together and tell them about something you’re passionate about?

This is Biblical Community:

● Know each other’s story
● Pray for one another
● Live life together
● Guide to Next steps

Successful coaching begins by earning influence:

Hebrews 6:10-11 “God is not unjust; he will not forget your work and the love you have shown him as you have helped his people and continue to help them.” Earning influence is given based on how well you care for people.

● People don’t care how much you know until they know how much you care.
● Model how to be relational.
● One-on-ones empower a Leader through relationship, the value of giving time to someone.
● Prepare and Pray - that God will guide the conversation, giving you a word for your leaders. Know what you are going to talk about, avoid the urge to wing it because you have relationship.
● Huddles empower a team through vision.
● Celebrate and Dream with your team.
● Equip and train on operational things.
Questions to discuss:

1) What have you done for another to create significance in their life? One alone cannot multiply, need a team.
2) Who are you bringing around you?
3) What are you doing to develop them? "The idea of a ‘self made man’ or ‘one man show’ are fallacies. This does not add value to people. As the challenges escalate, the need for the team and team work elevates.
4) If you know how to accomplish your dream, it is not big enough. You need God to accomplish your dream. What is my dream?
5) What do I want to accomplish? The size of the dream determines the size of your team.
6) Who is on your team?
7) What does your team look like? Dream and Team needs to match to accomplish the vision.
8) What are their gifts? Are they serving in their 10?
9) What is the potential of self and others?
10) How do you expand their gifts? Core Motivations Descriptions handout.

Practical Applications:

1) Awareness of skills you need to learn in each ministry - practice
   Hospitality point, Worship attire, Groups attendance, etc.
2) Personality and gifting differences - Love Languages/Core Motivations.
   What are they? Love languages - gifts, touch, time, affirmation, service.
3) Google hangouts/huddles/face to face - how to have transparency in a digital context? Ask your Leaders: How can I pray for you? What are you going through now? What is God teaching you in this season? How are you letting a trial or difficult season push you closer to Christ? How do we see trials as a catalyst to be used to bring prayer to God?
4) How are you discipling others? How are you helping others see outside of their personal challenge?

What you want them to:

Know: Meetings 5 card handout process. Bayside Meeting card handout Do:
Plan and/or Lead a 1 to 1 or group meeting.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>At Home Work</th>
<th>Plan purposeful 1on1s. Plan purposeful Huddles. Schedule a 1 on 1 this week and share the outcome next class.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

149
### Assignment

To shift from a Leader mindset to a Coaching mindset, understand we are equipped. Highlight how God has equipped us for the call of ministry to carry out a kingdom purpose as outlined in **2 Peter 1:3-11**. Be prepared to share next class.

### 3. Develop Leaders

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CIT Conversational class</th>
<th>Complete weekly online class. Attendance.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intro to CIT Conversational class</td>
<td>There are no fill in the blanks with conversational class. Please bring a journal to take notes and your bible.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Takeaways from online videos</td>
<td>Daily video expressing an idea with a devotional scripture. Answer questions to discuss.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q and A</td>
<td>Ministry specific. Practical Applications.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time for class</td>
<td>2 hours. Review homework from previous class.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supplies needed:</td>
<td>Large sticky chart, Handout: Eisenhower Matrix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open/Close in Prayer</td>
<td>Facilitator/Member of class.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Purpose Statement of a Coach:**

“A Coach is a Leader of leaders who helps others to grow spiritually, build community and develop leaders”.

**How do we choose the right leader?**

1. Listen to two pieces of music: Strings and Violin. What are some characteristics of each piece and how did it make you feel? Have you ever served or worked under a leader like this?
2. What is the definition of a Leader? Paul’s two protégés from Ephesus and Crete were in different seasons and stages of ministry. **Timothy 3:1-13, Titus 1:5-9**
   Write out traits, what are common characteristics throughout? Can you identify your Timothy and Titus leader?
3. What does having a leadership culture mean? **Mark 10:34-45**
Teachable - Learn and honor what they are taught. It is an attribute of the state of the heart.

Called - A divine beckoning into their purpose at Bayside.

Hungry - Glad to do whatever is asked of them. Kingdom Purpose. Passion.

Others Focused - Servant Leadership based on serving versus leadership based on power.

Positive Attitude - Good attitude. A contagious attitude will gather people.

Questions to discuss:

1) How important is influence to Leadership? Where do you find leaders?
2) Life Giving - What does it mean?
3) Motivational Gifts - What are the Core Motivations of your leaders? Do they make the most of their talents and opportunities? Do you know what God expects of you and how he has wired you?
4) Ministry Passion - Do you know what your leaders are passionate about? What does stewardship of people mean to you? What is your personal fulfillment?

Practical Applications:

1) 2 Timothy 2:1-2 Leadership Succession: “You then, my son, be strong in the grace that is in Christ Jesus. And the things you have heard me say in the presence of many witnesses entrust to reliable people who will also be qualified to teach others.” Your leaders are your legacy. Find that person that you can walk through life with, bring alongside you, to step into your role. Who are you giving ministry away to? Who are you leading? Who are you pastoring? Who are you mentoring?
   Gradual release of ministry- Train, they watch, then they do. You work together, then they do, you watch.

2) Practical Time Stewardship - Who has time to coach? Eisenhower matrix.

As believers - We are about changed lives. “Learn to number your days to gain a heart of wisdom.” Psalm 90:12

Know how you spend your time because your time is your life.

What you want them to:

Be: A leader who adds value to others. Elijah 1 Kings 17,18/ Elisha 2 Kings 2-13 Know:
How to leave a legacy of generational leadership. What do they need to do to be ready for the role?

| At Home Work/Assignment | **Life Map** - Do a timeline of peaks and valleys. What did you learn? How did you grow? Did you lean into Jesus? |

**APPENDIX 4**

**IRB Application**
REQUEST FOR IRB REVIEW OF RESEARCH INVOLVING HUMAN SUBJECTS

FORM MUST BE TYPED-HANDWRITTEN DOCUMENTS WILL NOT BE ACCEPTED.

1. Exempt [Status]___

Type of Review Requested: (see RR 101)  D Expedited  D Full Board For details regarding types of review, please see "Levels of Review" under FAQ at https://www.seu.edu/irb/faq/

1. Research Project (This section to be completed for ALL types of reviews requested)

Protocol Title: Campus Pastor's Assessment of Leadership Training Program

Date of Submission: 3/19/18  Research project start date*: 4/5/18

"The project start date cannot be earlier than the protocol's approval date. To start research as soon as the protocol is approved, please note *upon approval" for the project start date.*

Research project end date*: 5/3/2018

*The project end date should be the date after which data collection ceases. This date should not exceed one year from the start date for expedited/full board review and no more than three years for exempt protocols, without an extension approval by the IRB.

2. Principal Investigator (PI) (This section to be completed for ALL types of reviews requested)

a. Faculty/Staff PI (Do not complete this section if you are a student.)
Name: Eric Palmu  Email: ejpalmu@seu.edu

College/Department: Southeastern University - DMin student

iii Class Research Project  □ Independent Research Project course Name and#: PMIN 8023 Contextual Engagement II

Training must be completed before application can be reviewed. Training completed: ■YES □NO

3. Co-Investigators {This section to be completed for ALL types of reviews, (if applicable.)

a. Name: Dr. Peter Althouse
Institution (if not SEU):  Email: pfalthouse@seu.edu

Training must be completed before application can be reviewed. Training completed: ■YES □NO

b. Name:  Institution (if not SEU):  _ Email:

Training must be completed before application can be reviewed. Training completed: □YES D NO
c. Name: Institution (if not SEU):
   Email:
   Training must be completed before application can be reviewed. Training completed: □YES D NO

d. Name: Institution (if not SEU): Email:
   Training must be completed before application can be reviewed. Training completed: □YES D NO

4. Cooperating Institutions (This section to be completed for ALL types of reviews.)
   a. Will the research be conducted on the SEU campus? □YES D □NO
   If "no," please indicate the location(s): Bayside Community Church - East Sarasota Campus

   1. Was permission granted to conduct the research at the off-campus location?
      □ YES D □ NO D □ NIA
      If "yes," please attach a copy of the documentation.

   b. Is this research being done in cooperation with any institutions, individuals, or organizations not affiliated with SEU?
      □ YES D □ NO
      If yes; please list: Bayside Community Church Discipleship Ministry

      1. Has the other institution's IRB/ethics board approved this study? □YES D □NO
         If "yes," please attach a copy of the approval

5. Research Project Description (This section to be completed for ALL types of reviews.)
   a. Rationale: Provide (in lay terms) a concise statement of the project's general aims in relation to the broader field of research.
      Project aim is determining the most effective training method for the development of Spirit-empowered leaders.
      Through an interview with the campus pastor the approach and chosen curriculum will be determined.

   b. Specific Aims: Identify the variables to be manipulated and/or measured, and describe their expected relationships.
      Specific aims: 1) compare and contrast current coaches (identify convictions
      2) determine levels of spiritual convictions in each leaders
      3) determine retraining for more effective leadership

   c. Study Procedures: Describe the activities in which the participants will be engaged. Provide methods, procedures, interventions, and manipulations. Also, include the actual materials (Including Informed consent participants will see and/or specific questions that will be asked, if possible. If this level of detail is not possible, provide an idea of the types of questions and the reason that greater specificity would not be possible at the point of submission. When using a methodology that might put the participants at risk, please reference previous research that used the same or similar methodology (use a separate page if more space is needed).

      1) Complete literature review (compare & contrast leadership effectiveness)
      2) Study critical aspects of grounded theory
      3) Conduct intensive interview of a campus pastor (audio recorded) (see addendum)
      4) Transcribe and code interview results.
      5) Assess results

   d. Use of Deception: Describe in detail any deception used and explain why deception is critical to the research. When using a methodology that might put participants at risk, be sure to reference previous research that might use the same methodology.
      n/a
e. Training: Describe any supervision or training that will occur for research personnel involved in this study, including CITI training and any additional training. For student investigators, please include relevant research experience and/or coursework.

Completed online NIH web-based training course – “Protecting Human Research Participants” 10/26/16 Certificate no. 2211931 (copy included)

f. What type(s) of instruments/activities will be used (Check all that apply.)
   i. Test/Survey/Questionnaire
      Type: □ D published/standardized  iii researcher-created □ other (please explain)
      Short questionnaire regarding staff/member ratios
      Format: □ paper □ telephone □ online □ other (please explain)

D published/standardized li researcher-created □ other (please explain)
Intensive interview guided by Constructing Grounded Theory
   iii face-to-face □ telephone □ online □ other (please explain)

Please attach a copy of any tests/surveys/questionnaires and/or interviews, etc.

For protocols involving tests, surveys, questionnaires, or interviews: □ N/A

g. Will the subjects encounter the possibility of stress or psychological, social, physical, and/or legal risks that are greater than those ordinarily encountered in daily life or during performance of routine physical or psychological examinations and/or tests?
   □ YES ■ NO
If YES, please justify:
Participants may be uncomfortable with questions. However, the concern is mostly dealing with confidentiality.

h. Will information be requested that subjects might consider personal and/or sensitive?
   □ YES ■ NO
If YES, please explain:

i. Will the subjects be presented with materials that might be considered offensive, threatening and/or degrading?
   □ YES ■ NO
If YES, please explain (include measures planned for intervention if problems occur):

6. PARTICIPANTS

a. Participant Population
Research involving study participants who are likely to be vulnerable to coercion or undue influence (such as minors under the age of 18 (45 CFR 45 Subpart D), prisoners (45 CFR 47 Subpart CJ), pregnant woman, human fetuses, neonates (45 CFR 45 Subpart B), persons with mental disabilities, or persons whose economic status would leave them susceptible to coercion) is not eligible for exempt status.

1. How many participants are needed for the study? __

2. Target Populations Include:
   □ Athletes
   □ Children 0-6 (Parental consent required)
   □ Children 7-17 (Parental consent & child assent required)
   □ Developmentally disabled (Guardian consent & Participant assent required)
   □ Elderly
D Mentally ill
Military personnel
□ Persons convicted of a crime or on parole
□ Persons over the age of 18 ONLY
□ Persons with English as a second language
□ Physically impaired
□ Pregnant women

D Teachers
□ SEU staff
□ SEU students lli Non-SEU college students
□ Victims of crime

b. Describe the subjects of this study:

1. Describe the sampling population: Subject is a campus pastor between the age of 35-40
2. Describe the subject selection methodology: Subject was asked because I have little to no contact with him or his campus. He has several staff members leading others.
3. Describe the procedures used to recruit subjects. Include copies of scripts, flyers, advertisements, posters, web based solicitations and/or emails: I asked him face-to-face and he agreed.
4. What is the expected duration of participation for each segment (e.g., gender, ethnicity) of the sampling population? one questionnaire and one interview- 45 minutes (addendum)

a. If there is more than one session, please specify the duration of each session:

c. Participant Compensation and Costs
1. Participants will receive: D Compensation □ Required Course Credit D Extra Credit ii N/A
   a. If compensation/course credit/extra credit is offered, please complete the following:
      Type (e.g., gift card, cash, extra credit): ______________________ Amount: _______________ Source: ______________
   b. If required course credit is offered for participation, please describe what alternative assignment(s) students may complete to get an equal amount of credit should they choose not to participate in the study:
      n/a
   c. Are other inducements planned to recruit participants? D YES ■ NO
      If yes, please describe:


d. Participant Risks and Benefits
1. What are the benefits to participants in this study?
   Participant will receive a copy of the research and will participate in development of a new leadership-training program as determined by this study.

2. What are the risks (physical, social, psychological, legal, economic) to participants in this study?
   It "could be" stressful to compare and contrast leadership levels while being audio recorded. However, confidentiality is the highest priority. Risk is minimal. Pseudonyms and code numbers will be used.

   a. Indicate the degree of risk (physical, social, psychological, legal, economic) the research poses to human subjects (select the one which applies).

   MINIMAL RISK: a risk is minimal where the probability and magnitude of harm or discomfort anticipated in the proposed research are not greater, in and of themselves, than those ordinarily encountered in daily life or during the performance of routine physical or psychological examinations or tests.

   GREATER THAN MINIMAL RISK: Greater than minimal risk is where the probability and magnitude of harm or discomfort anticipated in the proposed research are greater than those ordinarily encountered in daily life, or during the performance of routine physical or psychological examinations or tests.
7. **Confidentiality and Data Security** (This section to be completed for ALL types of reviews.)

a. Will personal identifiers be collected? □ YES □ NO
b. Will identifiers be translated to a code? □ YES □ NO O N/A

c. Will recordings be made (audio, video)? □ YES □ NO
   a. If YES: please describe: Pseudonyms will be used and code numbers established to distinguish the pastor's identified leaders. This will be discussed with pastor prior to the beginning of interview.
   b. If any type of audio or video recordings will be made of participants (including photographs), please describe how the participants' consent for this recording will be obtained. An adult consent form has been created using IRB template (copy included).

d. Who will have access to data (survey questionnaires, recordings, interview records, etc.)?
   t-numeric ana co-investigators UNLY

---

e. Describe how participant confidentiality will be protected and research records secured. Pseudonyms and number codes will be used. All recordings will be on primary investigators password-protected laptop. Paper transcripts will be secure in office file cabinet and behind two locks.

f. How long will the records be retained? □ 5 ya, □ ea, □ rs

g. How will the records be destroyed after this time? □ shredded

8. **Consent**

a. Informed consent
   1. Will consent forms be utilized? □ YES □ NO
      
      If "no," Section Bb must be completed.
      
      a. Will the consent form be presented on or online? □ Paper
      b. If the participants are minors, will consent forms be used? □ YES □ Online □ NO □ N/A

      If "no," please explain._______

---

de. Waiver of written informed consent (only to be completed if the answer to Ba1 is "no")
   1. Will the only record linking the participant to the research be the consent document and will the principal risk to the participant be a breach of confidentiality? □ YES □ NO
   2. Is this a minimal risk study that involves procedures for which written consent is not normally required?
      □ YES □ NO
   3. Explain how consent will be obtained. Signed consent form at time of interview.

---

**Please attach the consent and/or assent form(s) that the participants and/or parent/guardian will be required to sign.**

9. The Principal Investigator should Initial all items below:

I confirm that I have reviewed the protocol and any attachments, and I approve them.

I confirm that all items required by the IRB checklist (below) are submitted with this protocol. (If applicable)

I confirm that the proposed consent form is, in my judgment, appropriate for this research.

I understand that as Principal Investigator, I have ultimate responsibility for the conduct of IRB-approved studies, the ethical performance of protocols, the protection of the rights and welfare of human participants, and strict adherence to the study's protocol and any stipulations imposed by the Southeastern University Institutional Review Board.
I understand that it is my responsibility to ensure that the human participants' involvement as described in the funding proposal(s) is consistent in principle, to that contained in the Request for IRB Review. I will submit modifications to the IRB as necessary.

I agree to comply with all Southeastern University policies and procedures, as well as with all applicable federal, state, and local laws, regarding the protection of human participants in research.

4/8/2018
Principal Investigator Signature      Date

Questions? Please contact the IRB (irb@seu.edu)

APPENDIX 5

IRB Approval
Southeastern University
IRB Reviewer’s Review Sheet

Principal Investigator’s Name: Althouse
Co-Investigators: Palmu

Project Title: Campus Pastor Assessment of Leadership Program

1. Does the research place subjects at more than minimal risk? Yes ☐ No ☑
   Minimal risk is defined as the probability and magnitude of harm or discomfort is no greater than that ordinarily encountered in daily life or during routine physical or psychological examination or tests)

   Notes:

2. If more than minimal risk, does the merit of the project outweigh the risks and are the benefits maximized and risks minimized? N/A ☑ Yes ☐ No ☐

   Notes:

3. Are there any ethical issues regarding the study’s design and conduct? Yes ☐ No ☑
   Ethical issues may include but are not limited to the Belmont Report principles: respect for persons (voluntary, fully informed consent); beneficence (obligation to protect subjects from harm and secure their well-being); and, justice (benefits and burdens of research are fairly distributed)

   Notes:

4. Is subject selection equitable? Yes ☑ No ☐
   If special populations are included the IRB should ensure that subjects can understand the research, give full consent, and voluntarily agree to participate, and they should consider any other possible special problems. Are vulnerable or special populations included in the research?

   ☐ Pregnant women
   ☐ Fetus/fetal tissue
   ☐ Prisoners
   ☐ Minors Under Age 18
   ☐ Elderly subjects
   ☐ Minority groups and non-English speakers
   ☐ Patients
   ☐ Mentally/Emotionally/Developmentally Disabled persons
   ☐ Behavior Abnormalities, psychological or disease condition
   ☐ None of the above, Normal Healthy Volunteers

   Notes:
5. Is the recruitment and consent process (including telephone scripts, ads, brochures, letters, compensation) fully described, appropriate, and non-coercive?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Notes:

6. Are risks (physical, emotional, financial, legal) to subjects minimized?  
   Yes ☑  No ☐  
   Notes:

7. Confidentiality of Data:  
   Are there procedures for protecting privacy and confidentiality?  
   Yes ☑  No ☐  
   Notes:

8. Is Informed Consent Included in the Application?  
   Yes ☑  No ☐  
   Stipulate Missing Elements:  
   Is affiliation with SEU clearly noted?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Is the Faculty PI identified?  
   N/A ☐  Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Is the study faculty sponsor identified (if appropriate)?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Does the consent state the study purpose accurately?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Is it clear what the subject(s) will be asked to do?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Are risks or discomforts clearly and fully stated?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Are benefits clearly and fully stated?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Are alternatives listed (if appropriate)?  
   N/A ☐  Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Are confidentiality or anonymity issues addressed?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Is the PI's contact information included?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Is the IRB's contact information included?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Is it stated that the subject can withdraw at anytime?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Is the consent understandable at an 8th grade reading level?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  

   Assent Form  
   Not Required ☐
   Is one needed (can the child really refuse to participate)?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Is it one page or less?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  
   Is the language simple and sentences short?  
   Yes ☐  No ☐  

   Notes:

Additional Comments/Requirements by IRB:

Study is exempt based on the confirmation that research participant is not a subordinate of the researcher.

RECOMMENDATION:

☐ Approved as submitted  
☐ Approval Deferred; additional information required  
☐ Approved with stipulations as noted  
☐ Not Approved

Signature: IRB Officer-AF  
Date: 4/19/2018
APPENDIX 6

IRB Modification Request

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SOUTHEASTERN UNIVERSITY INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APPROVED PROTOCOL MODIFICATION REQUEST FORM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Title of Project:** Developing Spiritual Maturity in Ministry Leaders through Whole-Bible Thematic Instruction

**Principal Investigator:** I acknowledge that this represents an accurate and complete description of the proposed changes to the research.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of PI (typed)*</th>
<th>Signature of PI</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eric Palmu</td>
<td></td>
<td>9-12-2018</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SEU Doctor of Ministry Program** | **Barnett School of Ministry & Theology** |

**Department** | **College** |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**4206 14th Ave E, Bradenton, FL 34208** | **727-386-3208** | **ejpalmu@seu.edu** |

**PI's Address (Street, City, State, Zip)** | **Phone** | **E-Mail** |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Faculty Sponsor (complete if PI is a student): I agree to provide the proper surveillance of this project to ensure that the rights and welfare of the human subjects are properly protected.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Advisor (typed)</th>
<th>Signature of Advisor</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Jim Vigil</td>
<td></td>
<td>9-12-2018</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SEU DMin Program Supervisor** | **Barnett School of Ministry & Theology** |

**Department** | **College** |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**1000 Longfellow Blvd, Lakeland, FL 33801** | **716-430-4983** | **jovigil@seu.edu** |

**Advisor's Address** | **Phone** | **E-Mail** |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* The signature of the Primary (lead) PI for the research is required. If PI is a student, the advisor must also sign. All PIs and advisor will receive notification of modification approval.
1. **Changes to be made to: (check all that apply)**

   - [ ] Project Title
   - [ ] Principal Investigators (include resumes)
   - [ ] Sponsor
   - [ ] Estimated # of Subjects
   - [ ] Subject Population
   - [ ] Vulnerable Subject Population
     - [ ] Decisionally Impaired
     - [ ] Children age 17 or less
     - [ ] Pregnant Women
     - [ ] Prisoners
     - [ ] Other Vulnerable Populations
   - [ ] Advisor recruitment
   - [ ] Inclusion/Exclusion criteria
   - [ ] Research Site(s)
   - [ ] Research Procedures
   - [ ] Consent form
   - [ ] Assent form

2. **Describe in detail the proposed changes indicated above.**

   1) The research will now include two (2) additional interviews with campus pastors. I play no role in their work, nor is there any organizational authority connection. I will continue with all protocols previously established.

   2) In addition, the research will now include 4-6 focus groups. Each group is made up of adults, ages 25-45, representing equal numbers of males and females. The groups will be presented with 5-7 lessons, approximately 35 minutes in length, discussing critical theological themes. Pre and post assessments will be administered to determine learning. The assessments will have NO grade value or name attached, strictly for learning assessment.

3. **Explain the reason (s) for the requested changes.**

   The reason for the modifications is first to determine if other pastors are experiencing the same lack of spiritual maturity and whether this negatively influences ministry area disciple-making.

   The second reason is for creating focus groups to determine whether the curriculum design developed in fact does equip participants with a level of Biblical knowledge for confident disciple-making.

4. **Do these requested changes pose additional risks to subjects?**  
   - [x] Yes  
   - [ ] No

   If Yes, please describe the risks and any procedures proposed to address them:

5. **Submit all materials that are being revised with changes highlighted.**

   see attached...

Submission Address: IRB@seu.edu  
For assistance, please contact the SEU IRB at IRB@seu.edu

Updated: November, 2016
APPENDIX 7

Addendum to Research

SOUTHEASTERN UNIVERSITY OF THE ASSEMBLIES OF GOD

Addendum to MT 02 Research

Submitted to IRB for,
Dr. James Vigil
Dr. James Anderson
Dr. Sam Hemby
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the completion of
Doctorate of Ministry

By

Eric J. Palmu
September 12, 2018
This addendum is a request for continuation of a previously approved research. The MT 012 Exemption was approved o/a April 13, 2018. All pertinent research project details remain the same with the following exceptions.

1) The research will include two (2) additional intensive interviews of campus pastors. I play no role in their work, nor is there any organizational authoritative connection. I have included all prior research protocols.

2) This research piece provides steps to support the campus pastor in resolving leadership issues through the inclusion of biblical instruction. Consequently, it now includes 3-5 focus groups. An innovative thematic instructional methodology will be employed to teach whole-Bible instruction. The instruction will cover critical biblical themes. Measurement of the focus group will be a pre- and post-assessment to determine the acquisition of the taught subject matter. The assessment will ONLY be used to determine the acquisition of the thematic teaching, and not serve as a “grade”.

The research objective is to determine if a thematic teaching approach will facilitate an expeditious acquisition of key thematic biblical concepts, facilitating the development of a mental framework and leading to an *imago Dei* identity.

There is no risk to subjects. Six or seven 45-minute lessons are taught followed by a fifteen-minute break. Each lesson will contain 3-5 biblical themes that connect with the previous lesson. Focus groups will be conducted over a period of three months, August-October. Results will be collected and presented in the report.

Respectfully,

Eric Palmu
APPENDIX 8

Topic Approval

APPENDIX B: TOPIC APPROVAL FORM

Instructions: After consultation with the Doctor of Ministry Director to confirm the members of the student's Doctoral Project Committee and the successful completion of PMIN 7043 – Research & Ministry Development, the student will complete and submit this Topic Approval Form to the DMin Office for evaluation and approval. If necessary, the student may utilize additional pages to complete the form. Each answer should not be more than one paragraph. Students should be prepared to make changes to their topic approval request. It is uncommon for a topic to be approved without required revisions.

STUDENT NAME: Eric Palmu STUDENT ID: 770300

DATE SUBMITTED: 6/20/19 ANTICIPATED GRADUATION DATE: 4/26/19

DOCTORAL RESEARCH PROJECT TITLE: An Instructional Approach to Developing Leaders with an Imago Dei

Utilizing a Whole-Bible Thematic Instructional Methodology

Write a summary description of your applied research project, including its rationale (Why you want to do this project).

The focus of this project is to improve the effectiveness of discipleship through improving biblical understanding of leadership. The project design is to utilize a whole-Bible thematic instruction focused on critical biblical themes. Instruction will be given to focus groups comprised of ministry leaders and coaches on five different campuses. Through an online assessment participants will respond to thirty items to determine understanding of the themes presented.

Briefly state the significance of this topic for your ministry context (church, mission field, organization, etc.) and its significance for others in similar ministries.

Discipleship leaders spend an inordinate amount of time pouring into new young leaders. Presenting a thematic instruction will provide a basis for leading others.

Briefly state the relationship of the topic to your DMIN goals and post-graduation goals.

Campus pastors of this mega church organization have noted the lack of working biblical knowledge. The goal of this project is to improve the understanding of key biblical themes that will result in greater understanding of the God narrative. A deepened understanding will lead to owning the Imago Dei inheritance and will provide a greater spiritual maturity.
List five major books and five journal articles and/or other sources with which you can begin your literary research.
1) OT Theology: A Thematic Approach by F. Routledge
3) Zondervan's NIV Bible Commentaries OT & NT 2 vols.
4) A Biblical Theology of the OT & NT - Roy Zuck editor
5) Learning as a Way of Being by Peter B. Vaill

Describe the compatibility of this topic with your capabilities, the availability of information, your limits of time and limits of resources (Is this project "doable?")
Both my BS and MA are in education. I am very interested in learning theory as it applies to spiritual formation. This research falls within the parameters of educational pedagogy.

Provide one sentence for each of the following items, as you currently understand them:

Problem to be addressed:
The foundational biblical literacy required in discipleship programs must be improved.

Research question:
Can the biblical literacy of ministry leaders be improved through a whole-Bible thematic instruction?

Research method (program, survey, case studies, etc.):
Use of focus groups with pre- and post assessment of biblical themes to measure improvement. In addition, planned interviews with 3-4 members of the focus groups as a one-month follow-up.

Hypothesis(es):
Will a focused thematic instructional approach positively influence spiritual maturity?

ADMINISTRATIVE USE ONLY

TOPIC APPROVED:  
J. Vigil D.Min.  
__________________________  ____________
DMIN Director  
Date

P. Althouse Ph. D.  
__________________________  ____________
Mentor/First Reader  
Date

J. Anderson Ph. D  
__________________________  ____________
Second Reader  
Date
APPENDIX 9

ADULT CONSENT FORM

SOUTHEASTERN UNIVERSITY

PROJECT TITLE:
Examination of the Effectiveness of Leadership Training

INVESTIGATORS:
Eric Palmu, Doctor of Ministry candidate – Southeastern University – Bayside Campus and Member of Bayside Community Church

Dr. Jim Vigil (co-investigator)
Professor – SEU
jpvigil@seu.edu

PURPOSE:
This study will examine specific issues leading to effective discipleship training. Interview will provide critical data regarding current leadership capacity.

PROCEDURES:
It is a two-step process in this study.

1) You will complete a short questionnaire regarding your current coach to number of members participating.

2) You will participate in an audio-recorded interview regarding your current coaches’ preparation for leadership. This interview will include 5-6 questions and is designed to last approximately 45 minutes.

RISKS OF PARTICIPATION:
There are no known risks associated with this project greater than those ordinarily encountered in daily life.

BENEFITS OF PARTICIPATION:
You may elect, if you are interested, we will send you a copy of the results of the study when completed. This study will provide information leading to new leadership training curriculum.
CONFIDENTIALITY:
Confidentiality will be maintained through a system of pseudonyms and/or number codes designed to protect your identity and that of the discussed leaders. Data gathered will be used expressly for this study. Information gathered will remain sealed through a two-lock system. The records of this study will be kept private. Any written results will use appropriate pseudonyms and will not include information that will identify you. Research records will be stored on a password-protected computer in a locked office and only researchers and individuals responsible for research oversight will have access to the records.

The law requires data to be destroyed after five years following completion of the study. Audiotapes will be transcribed and destroyed within 5 days of the interview.

PARTICIPANT RIGHTS:
You understand that your participation is voluntary, there is no penalty for refusal to participate, and that you are free to withdraw your consent and participation in this project at any time, without penalty.

CONSENT DOCUMENTATION

I have been fully informed about the procedures listed here. I am aware of what I will be asked to do and of the benefits of my participation. I also understand the following statements: I affirm that I am 18 years of age or older. I have read and fully understand this consent form. I sign it freely and voluntarily. A copy of this form will be given to me. I hereby give permission for my participation in this study.

_________________________________________________________________________  ____________
Signature of Participant                                                  Date

I certify that I have personally explained this document before requesting that the participant sign it.

_________________________________________________________________________  ____________
Signature of Researcher                                                  Date
Eric Palmu
DMin Candidate