

Spring 4-28-2017

# Musical Worship as a Pentecostal Sacrament: Toward a Soteriological Liturgy

Richard I. Griggs

*Southeastern University - Lakeland*

Follow this and additional works at: <http://firescholars.seu.edu/honors>



Part of the [Christianity Commons](#), and the [Music Commons](#)

---

## Recommended Citation

Griggs, Richard I., "Musical Worship as a Pentecostal Sacrament: Toward a Soteriological Liturgy" (2017). *Selected Honors Theses*. 64. <http://firescholars.seu.edu/honors/64>

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by FireScholars. It has been accepted for inclusion in Selected Honors Theses by an authorized administrator of FireScholars. For more information, please contact [firescholars@seu.edu](mailto:firescholars@seu.edu).

MUSICAL WORSHIP AS A PENTECOSTAL SACRAMENT:  
TOWARD A SOTERIOLOGICAL LITURGY

by

Richard Isaac Griggs

Submitted to the Honors Program Committee

in partial fulfillment

of the requirements for University Honors Scholars

Southeastern University

2017

© Copyright by Richard Griggs 2017

All Rights Reserved

### **Dedication**

This thesis is dedicated to the incredible faculty of the College of Christian Ministries and Religion. Without your support and encouragement, I would never have been able to accomplish a work like this. Thank you for challenging me. Thank you for sticking with me through my hard questions, my doubts, and my disappointments. Thank you for seeing the call of God in each of your students and for drawing the best out of us. The world is better because of your determination and dedication to the truth. You have helped me to build and to rebuild. I will never forget the faith you have inspired in the midst of uncertainty, the life you have spoken into situations of hardship, and the patient hospitality you have intentionally preserved and demonstrated in a culture of rushed individualism. You have shown me how to cherish community, how to persevere through difficulty, how to work well and how to rest well. Above all, you have taught me how to admit when I am wrong.

### **Special Acknowledgements**

I would like to specifically thank Drs. Melissa and Kenneth Archer, who I consider to be my spiritual mother and father. Your voices in my life have meant more to me than you will ever know. I would also like to thank Dr. Zachary Tackett and Dr. Peter Althouse, whose feedback and direction have been instrumental for the development and completion of this thesis. Finally, I want to offer special thanks to Dr. Miller; I am deeply grateful for the unmerited patience and grace you have consistently shown me throughout my time at Southeastern. Thank you for making the Honors Program feel like a family.

**Abstract and Key Words**

This paper seeks to articulate a Pentecostal theology of worship within the framework of sacramental spirituality, asserting that music as a form of worship is a Pentecostal sacrament. After offering a literature review on the topic, the paper articulates Pentecostal sacraments as essentially participatory, transformative, and communally unifying physical actions which facilitate meaningful participation in the story of God through kinesthetic catechesis, dialectic temporality, and mutual epiclesis. It then explores the ways in which music aligns with this sacramental nature and function, recognizing music as a Pentecostal sacrament of the felt presence of the divine. Next, support for this assertion is given through historical analysis of the Azusa Street revival. Finally, the paper examines the participatory soteriological nature of music as a sacrament within a Pentecostal liturgy.

Key words: Music, Sacrament, Pentecostalism, Liturgy, Theology, Worship, Epiclesis, Theosis, Soteriology, Narrative-Praxis, Narratology, Participation, Experience.

**Contents**

Contents ..... 6  
Introduction..... 7  
Methodology and Chapter Summary ..... 9  
Chapter 1: A Review of Literature..... 14  
    I. In Search of Pentecostal Theology ..... 14  
    II. Liturgy and Sacramental Experience in Pentecostalism: ..... 21  
    III. Sacraments and the Pentecostal Via Salutis..... 26  
    IV. Music as a Sacrament ..... 40  
Chapter 2: Articulating a Pentecostal Sacramentality ..... 45  
Chapter 3: Musical Worship as A Pentecostal Sacrament..... 51  
Chapter 4: At Azusa: A Historical Analysis ..... 56  
Chapter 5: Music as Sacramental Narrative Participation ..... 62  
Conclusion ..... 68  
Bibliography.....71

## Introduction

At the age of fourteen, Harvey Cox was given a C-melody saxophone. The young Baptist boy soon grew into a soul-ripping jazz artist, playing classics in clubs and developing a deep love for music. With nimble fingers and fervent emotion, he longed to play his instrument on Sunday mornings alongside the admissible organ and choir. When this hope was consistently denied, the boy noticed a widening gap between his identity as a musician and his identity as a Christian. This schizophrenic existence dragged on for years, until everything changed one July evening in the late 1970s. After playing a set together for a local Greek restaurant, Harvey's friend Walter, a black jazz bassist, invited him to play at his church for worship the next day. He was taken back by the invitation. A saxophone, playing during worship? "Wouldn't we have to tone down the major seventh chords, sustained fourths, and gut-bucket endings a bit?"

"Absolutely not," Walter replied. That Sunday evening, Harvey arrived at Fellowship Pentecostal Temple in Oak Bluffs, Massachusetts, and for the first time in his life, played *his* instrument for the Lord.<sup>1</sup>

Harvey Cox is a professor of religion at Harvard University, and the author of more than ten books. He is one of the foremost scholars on Pentecostalism and is a devout Christian. In his book on Pentecostal spirituality, Cox recounts this story of his first experience with Pentecostalism, an experience that marked him, transformed him, and gave him a voice. "Music brought me to Jesus," he says. This baptism in identity, welcoming into community, and shared communion of passion seems reminiscent of the

---

<sup>1</sup> Harvey Cox, *Fire From Heaven: The Rise of Pentecostal Spirituality and the Reshaping of Religion in the Twenty-First Century*. (Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley Publishing Co., 1995), 139-142.

saving work some traditions attribute to sacraments—means of grace in a graceless world. The music of a Pentecostal community was an extension of open arms, bringing to life the passion and joy of a boy on the cusp of cessation. For him, music was a vehicle of grace, saving and sanctioning his life for love and learning.

Constituting a significant portion of Pentecostal liturgy and practice, musical worship deserves substantial theological inquiry. In this paper, I will seek to articulate a Pentecostal theology of worship within the framework of sacramental spirituality, asserting that music as a form of worship is a Pentecostal sacrament.<sup>2</sup> I will begin by articulating Pentecostal sacraments as participatory, transformative, and communally unifying physical actions which facilitate meaningful participation in the story of God through kinesthetic catechesis, dialectic temporality, and mutual epiclesis. I will then explore the ways in which music aligns with this sacramental nature and function, recognizing music as a Pentecostal sacrament of the felt presence of the divine. Next, I will support and appropriate this understanding through a historical analysis of the Azusa Street revival. Finally, I will examine the expressional and participatory nature of sacramental music within Pentecostalism’s liturgical narrative-praxis. My hope is to

---

<sup>2</sup> It is important to note that my use of the term *sacrament* is not limited to the conventional Protestant usage describing only baptism and the Eucharist, nor the Roman Catholic and Orthodox usage describing the sacraments of baptism, confirmation, eucharist, penance, anointing of the sick, ordination, and matrimony. The distinctiveness of the Pentecostal movement warrants its own sacramental theology which validates those actions within its liturgy that function in such a manner. I will follow the precedents set by Kenneth Archer, John Christopher Thomas, and Frank Macchia (among others), who recognize five sacramental ordinances within Pentecostalism’s narrative-praxis spirituality. Also, the term “sacrament” and “sacramental” will be used interchangeably in reference to these actions when discussing Pentecostal theology. Traditionally, *sacraments* and *sacramentals* are distinct from one another. I am using the latter solely as an adjective, not as a noun to describe sacramental rites. See Archer, *The Gospel Revisited*, 43-64, 76-88; Cf. John Christopher Thomas, *Footwashing in John 13 and the Johannine Community*, (Edinburgh: CPT Press, 2014); Daniella C. Augustine, “the Empowered Church: Ecclesiological Dimensions of the Event of Pentecost,” ed. John Christopher Thomas, *Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology: The Church and the Fivefold Gospel*, (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2010), 157-180; and Frank Macchia, “Tongues as a Sign,” *Pneuma* 15, No. 1, Spring 1993.

inspire discussion of the purpose and place of a sacramental focus within Pentecostalism's dynamically Christocentric liturgy. *It is my argument that Pentecostalism's theology of worship holds soteriological significance; thus, recognizing music as a Pentecostal sacrament will give credence to its purpose and place within Pentecostalism's dynamic spirituality, igniting a passion for intimacy with God and with one another.*

In order to explore the Pentecostal sacrament of musical worship, I will ask the following questions: (1) How do sacramental rites implicitly function in Pentecostal spirituality, serving as traditioning tools for Pentecostal communities and participation in the Divine life? (2) How does music function as a soteriological means of grace for worshiping participants in Pentecostal communities? (3) How has music historically functioned within Pentecostal liturgies? (4) How does understanding musical worship as inherently sacramental in turn influence a Pentecostal theology of the sacraments?

### **Methodology and Chapter Summary**

In this paper, I will argue that music is a sacrament for Pentecostals. In order to do this, I will articulate a Pentecostal theology of the sacraments, addressing their use (and lack of use) within Pentecostal liturgy. In order to articulate this definition, I will first offer a review of literature analyzing scholarly perspectives on Pentecostal theology, worshipful experience, sacramentality, history, and music. In synthesizing a Pentecostal sacramentality, I will engage sources heavily centered in Pentecostal thought and action alongside definitions from theologians among mainline denominations.

In order to articulate a theology of Pentecostal Sacraments, I will address the most central theological roles of sacraments for the Pentecostal community. To do this, I will

provide an integrative synthesis of literature, analyzing the perspectives of both Pentecostal and non-Pentecostal scholars about the function of sacraments. I will seek to understand not just *that* sacraments are “means” of grace, but *how* they mediate that grace to us. Before doing this, I will analyze the social impulses among some Pentecostals contributing to infrequent practice of the sacraments, and the theological motivations behind such hesitations. I will address the tangibility of sacraments by describing the practices themselves, engaging in cognitive-linguistic analyses of the symbolism inherent in sacraments. I will then discern the theological function of these actions through ecumenical dialogue, engaging voices both within and outside Pentecostalism. This methodology allows my argument to participate in ecumenical dialogue, expanding Pentecostal perspectives and highlighting what Pentecostalism has to offer other traditions. The scholarship outside of Pentecostalism has a rich theological understanding of sacraments which I believe will expand the Pentecostal perspective, and as shown in my review of literature, this integration is a current trend in Pentecostal scholarship. One drawback of this methodology might be the danger of losing touch with historic Pentecostal convictions and distinctives, which I hope to ameliorate with an assessment of the historical origins and practice of Pentecostal sacraments in America during the Azusa Street Revival.

After showing that sacraments are physical, embodied experiences by reflecting on the nature of each sacrament, I will reflect on the theological implications of embodiment portrayed by these sacraments. I will explore the ways in which embodiment allows sacramental participants to kinesthetically participate in God’s redemption narrative. Secondly, I will show that sacraments blur the lines of temporality, providing

contexts for Spirit-empowered transformation. This discussion will center upon *anamnesis* and *prolepsis* as affective, storying, and healing actions. Thirdly, I will discuss the process of epiclesis in Pentecostal theology. This eucharistic prayer for the infilling of the Spirit is an orthodox concept, harmonious with Pentecostalism's pneumatologically vibrant theology and implicitly present in its liturgy.

In the third portion of my paper, I will present a theological argument which parallels Pentecostal/Charismatic musical worship with sacraments. I will engage musicological and theological discussions in order to assess the role of music within contemporary Pentecostal worship. How participants describe rituals of musical worship, the ways in which scientists and musicologists understand music to be inherently physical, and the various theologies of worship among Pentecostal scholarship will all be compared with the sacramentality previously articulated. Furthermore, I will analyze the practices surrounding the event of musical worship in the Pentecostal liturgy, comparing them to the practices found in traditional non-Pentecostal liturgies surrounding the Eucharist. Due to the variety of tradition, lack of sound methodology, and difficulty of connoting "distinctly Pentecostal" songs, I will not offer analyses of songs or hymns in this section. Rather than a textual-critical assessment, this is primarily a socio-theological comparison.

In the fourth section, I will situate this understanding in a historical analysis of early Pentecostalism, using the Azusa Street revival as a case study of this period. According to Walter Hollenweger, the first ten years of Pentecostalism was not the movement's infancy, but its heart. Thus, much can be learned of Pentecostal spirituality by studying this period. This historical analysis will demonstrate my understanding of

sacramental music within Pentecostal worship as consistent from the beginning, strengthening my argument. In researching the past, I will utilize both primary and secondary sources. However, here I am not seeking to assess anything fundamentally new about the early Pentecostals, but rather to compare my articulation of sacramentality with the assessments of early Pentecostalism by those such as Donald Dayton, Walter Hollenweger, and Grant Wacker. I am sure that this comparison will yield desirable enlightenments on both fronts, helping to both strengthen a contemporary appreciation for the sacraments in Pentecostalism and to reveal the ways in which early Pentecostal spirituality reflects a sacramental nature. A look at early Pentecostal history and hymnody reveals a sacramental use of music which facilitated spiritual awakening in kinesthetic participation, breaking down traditional social barriers and cultivating communal unity in the context of eschatologically mindful worship. To assess this, I will look at the dominantly kinesthetic worship styles of the movement, the transformative healing of social wounds in the context of worship, and the epicletic and eschatologically mindful theology revealed by Pentecostal hymns.

In the final chapter of my thesis, I will link sacramental music to a narratological Pentecostal *via salutis*, showing as Kenneth Archer describes, that it is “nourishment” along our salvific journey.<sup>3</sup> In keeping with current trends in Pentecostal scholarship, I will assume a liturgical and narratological perspective in this demonstration. I will first explain the Pentecostal *via salutis* and its destination in *theosis*. The narrative soteriology is reflected in a Pentecostal hermeneutic, social perspective, and theology. As a sacramentally capable means of worshipful participation in God’s story, music is a

---

<sup>3</sup> Kenneth J. Archer, *The Gospel Revisited: Toward a Pentecostal Theology of Worship and Witness*. Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 65-82.

narrative-praxis of learning, healing, and redeeming. It is uniquely capable of integrating and expressing individual and communal identity. To show this, I will offer a brief exegesis of music in scripture. I will also examine the communally unifying power of music in Pentecostal congregations. This section includes some quotes from non-scholarly sources to explicate the heart and soul of music's narrative prowess and relevance for Pentecostal spirituality.

## Chapter 1

### *A Review of Literature*

Before delving into my argument, it is appropriate to review trends in current scholarship pertaining to my area of research. In depth, I will engage voices which have articulated Pentecostal theology, soteriology, sacramentality, the appeal to experience, music, worship, and the history of the movement. This review of literature will be structured under the following subheadings: (1) *In Search of Pentecostal Theology* seeks an approach to constructing a Pentecostal theology which honors its breadth and complexity; (2) *Liturgy and Sacramental Experience in Pentecostal Worship* explores the liturgical nature of Pentecostal worship and articulations of Pentecostal experience; (3) *Sacraments and the Pentecostal Via Salutis* assesses the value of a narratological articulation of Pentecostal soteriology as a framework for constructing a Pentecostal theology of the sacraments which both honors its central convictions and affirms its value for ecumenical dialogue; (4) *Music as a Sacrament* discusses theological articulations which have hinted at the sacramental nature of music.

#### ***I. In Search of Pentecostal Theology***

Constructing a contemporary Pentecostal theology is no easy task, given vast globalization and the sheer diversity of practice even among North American Pentecostals and Charismatics. Emerging from the social chaos and revivalistic fervor of America at the turn of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, Pentecostalism's theology and spiritual practice

has direct roots to the holiness movement,<sup>4</sup> restorationist revivalism,<sup>5</sup> and African slave spirituality.<sup>6</sup> Among the rich distinctives of Pentecostalism are its narrative hermeneutic,<sup>7</sup> experiential soteriology, and dynamic pneumatology. Thus, Pentecostalism should not merely be seen as a subset of North American Evangelicalism, but as its own tradition.<sup>8</sup> I will begin the literature review by addressing the varying approaches to Pentecostal theology given these concerns.

Kenneth Archer is concerned with the emerging theological articulation of Pentecostalism's distinct spirituality and hermeneutic. In an effort to maintain Pentecostal identity, he articulates a way of doing theology that is pneumatologically grounded and organized around the Fivefold Gospel (Jesus as Savior, Sanctifier, Spirit Baptizer, Healer, and Soon Coming King).<sup>9</sup> With an integrative method and a narrative manner, Archer attempts to combat the notion that "Pentecostalism at most may help other Christian communities appreciate the importance of emotive experiential worship services but it really does not offer a distinct theology."<sup>10</sup> Archer challenges this reductionism, showing that Pentecostalism is in fact distinct from Evangelicalism, the theological and cultural categories of which are often at odds with the implicit theology found in Pentecostal

---

<sup>4</sup> Influences from both Wesleyan and Keswickian. Kenneth J. Archer, *A Pentecostal Hermeneutic: Spirit, Word, and Community*, (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2009), 99;

<sup>5</sup> For an extensive review of the social and theological influences of restorationist revivalism and the holiness movements upon early Pentecostalism, see Kenneth J. Archer, *A Pentecostal Hermeneutic: Spirit, Word, and Community*, (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2009), 15-29; Also,

<sup>6</sup> Wolfgang Vondey, "The Making of a Black Liturgy: Pentecostal Worship and Spirituality from African Slave Narratives to American Cityscapes." *Black Theology: An International Journal* (July 1, 2012): 147-68.

<sup>7</sup> Archer argues that the hermeneutical strategy present from the beginnings of the movement was different from both modernistic Fundamentalism and liberalism.

<sup>8</sup> Archer, *The Gospel Revisited*, 1-11; cf. Wolfgang Vondey, *Beyond Pentecostalism: The Crisis of Global Christianity and the Renewal of the Theological Agenda*. (Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2010), 16-46; Steven J. Land, *Pentecostal Spirituality: A Passion for the Kingdom*, (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2010), 1-48.

<sup>9</sup> Archer, *The Gospel Revisited*, 1-17.

<sup>10</sup> *Ibid.*, 2

spirituality. In his monograph, *A Pentecostal Hermeneutic: Spirit, Word, and Community*, Archer offers an extensive investigation into the unique method and manner of Pentecostal hermeneutical strategies. For Archer, “The Pentecostal community is a part of the larger Christian community and yet exists as a distinct coherent narrative tradition within Christianity.”<sup>11</sup> Furthermore, the construal that a Pentecostal hermeneutic is an extension of the Protestant evangelical tradition undermines the nature of the movement as a protest to modernity and to mainline Protestantism.<sup>12</sup>

Steven Land also argues that Pentecostalism should not be seen as a “rationalist or scholastic” subset of evangelicalism, but is instead a distinct Christian tradition.<sup>13</sup> In *Pentecostal Spirituality: A Passion for the Kingdom*, Steven Land explicates the Pentecostal experience of God’s presence as the “inbreaking” of the Spirit, Pentecostal narrative participation in the story of God, and Pentecostal practices of worship and witness.<sup>14</sup> Land categorizes these practices as fusion-fission tensions, oral-narrative formation, spirit-body correspondence, and crisis-development dialectic. An apocalyptic vision and understanding of living in the last days gave Pentecostals urgency and focus in what Land calls orthodoxy, orthopathy, and orthopraxis. Land’s work is seminal in Pentecostal scholarship. He interacts with primary sources, historical analyses, and biblical exposition. Although his work is unabashedly Pentecostal, focused on the centrality of Spirit Baptism, it is useful for ecumenical discussion as it also addresses key Christian themes of affectivity, narratology, and community. Land does not shy away

---

<sup>11</sup> Archer, *A Pentecostal Hermeneutic*, 133.

<sup>12</sup> Kenneth J. Archer, *A Pentecostal Hermeneutic: Spirit, Word, and Community*, (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2009), 2.

<sup>13</sup> Steven J. Land, *Pentecostal Spirituality: A Passion for the Kingdom*. (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press), 18.

<sup>14</sup> *Ibid.*, 49-114.

from the tensions implicit in his explanation of orthodoxy, orthopathy, and orthopraxis, but balances them.

Addressing the complexity of the Pentecostal temperament, Grant Wacker interprets historical events, decisions, and his own conclusions in light of tensions between primitivist and pragmatic impulses in Pentecostalism.<sup>15</sup> Early Pentecostals subordinated earthly desires in a relentless, pietistic heaven-mindedness and a prevailing belief in the power of prayer, alongside an irreversible certitude and absolutism (the propensity to see life in moral extremes). Surveying a wide array of primary sources and anecdotal evidence, including close readings of the *Apostolic Faith* (the publication of the Azusa mission), newspapers, autobiographies, and eulogies, Wacker explicates the ways in which these Pentecostal views affected communal relationships within the Pentecostal community and with the surrounding community of outsiders. While Wacker's assessment tends to be irreverent and skeptical, it is instrumental for understanding the context of Pentecostal thought out of which their theology and practice flowed. Wacker speaks of a "stormy independence," contributing to a complex of assumptions which emphasized "the autonomy of individual choice in all affairs of life. . . Conversion, sanctification, and Holy Spirit baptism started with the individual, skirted the institutional church, downplayed the ordinances, and ended with the individual...everything centered, they imagined, in a sovereign, rational decision of the unfettered self."<sup>16</sup>

---

<sup>15</sup> Grant Wacker, *Heaven Below: Early Pentecostals and American Culture*. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2003), 18-34. These impulses were first observed by Walter J. Hollenweger in *The Pentecostals*.

<sup>16</sup> *Ibid.*, 29.

For Land, Pentecostalism is a movement of restoration, revival, awakening and renewal accommodating the tension between the “already” and the “not yet.” Land believes Pentecostal spirituality to be a reflection of the divine life, stating,

The righteousness, holiness and power of God are correlated with distinctive apocalyptic affections which are the integrating core of Pentecostal spirituality. This spirituality is Christocentric because it is pneumatic; its ‘fivefold’ Gospel is focused on Christ because of its starting point in the Holy Spirit. Underlying this correlation is a soteriology which emphasizes salvation as participation in the divine life more than the removal of guilt.<sup>17</sup>

Land emphasizes affections as the heart of Pentecostal spirituality, overcoming the dichotomy between power and holiness. These affections are apocalyptically oriented and informed. The Pentecostal concern is to “emphasize the lived reality of the faith.”<sup>18</sup>

Overall, Land’s Trinitarian assessment of Pentecostal spirituality is useful for orienting a discussion of Pentecostal theology which is historically consistent with the roots of the movement and for ecumenical considerations.

After outlining what he calls the “crisis of the imagination,”<sup>19</sup> Wolfgang Vondey believes the fundamental tension between play and performance in Pentecostalism to be a vital contribution toward the revival of imagination in global Christian theology.

According to Vondey, Pentecostalism presents a playful imagination of “expectations and affections, improvisation and transformation, self-determination, and mission.”<sup>20</sup> Yet this imagination must be intentionally preserved.

---

<sup>17</sup> Land, *Pentecostal Spirituality*, 23.

<sup>18</sup> *Ibid.*, 17.

<sup>19</sup> Wolfgang Vondey, *Beyond Pentecostalism: The Crisis of Global Christianity and the Renewal of the Theological Agenda*. (Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2010), 16-46. Vondey gives a historical-philosophical account of Platonic subordination of, Patristic elevation of, Medieval discrimination toward, German idealism of, and Postmodern deconstruction of the imagination.

<sup>20</sup> Cox, *Fire from Heaven*, 42.

For Harvey Cox, “Pentecostal theology is found in the viscera of Pentecostal spirituality. It is emotional, communal, narrational, hopeful, and radically embodied.”<sup>21</sup> Cox understands the true changes in Pentecostal theology not to come from academic journals, but from the ground up, “in the ways that these little outposts of the Kingdom *live* in a world that is both hostile and hungry.”<sup>22</sup> Cox addresses the ambiguity of Pentecostal appeals to “experience” and to the “Spirit” that they experience. Though Pentecostals are not alone in this ambiguity, Cox calls for Pentecostals to refine their language. He maintains that experience alone is meaningless. Even in the most experiential religious traditions, the spirituality is gleaned from an experience of *something*. For Pentecostals, this something is the Spirit, whom Cox regards as a characteristically subversive and working toward liberation.

Jean-Jacque Suurmond argues that the real contribution of Pentecostalism is its charismatic celebration—definitively playful and imaginative. Suurmond critiques the tendency toward detachment and separation between the material and spiritual; because of its blended roots in Africa and holiness movement, he argues that Pentecostal spirituality is at its fullest when operating from a “third world” spirituality.<sup>23</sup> Thus, Pentecostal theology expressed through feelings and the body is better developed than conceptualizations. Suurmond offers five characteristics of charismatic celebration: Oral liturgy, leaving room for spontaneous contributions and improvisations; Narrative theology and testimonies, fed by a highly participatory hermeneutic; Maximum participation and personal contribution to the celebration and freedom of response in the

---

<sup>21</sup> Ibid., 319.

<sup>22</sup> Ibid., 320.

<sup>23</sup> Jean-Jacques Suurmond, *Word and Spirit at Play: Towards a Charismatic Theology*. (Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1995), 3-19.

laity; Intuitive communication in the form of dreams and visions, which liberate the power of the imagination and can lead to liberation in the social sphere; and the experience of body and spirit as one whole.

While the conviction of Archer, Land, and others is that Pentecostalism is distinct from other traditions, this is not always so in practice. Suurmond argues that the interiorization (the tendency toward individualism) of the Pentecostal experience leads to the passive acceptance of the *status quo*; he advocates for a strong theology of liberation to be at the heart of Pentecostalism. At the start of the movement, Suurmond identifies glossolalia as a unifying sign for people which “transcended the barriers of language”<sup>24</sup> and broke down the walls between races, sexes, and nationalities. Because of this, the character of the revival was distinctly interracial. Yet contemporary Pentecostalism has since been influenced by Evangelical fundamentalism, and the tendency toward middle-class respectability has banished the third-world spirituality that was once the heart and life of Pentecostalism. This has left many Pentecostal communities looking no different than the typical white, Protestant community, causing a definitive split between Pentecostals into a black branch and a white branch.<sup>25</sup>

Cox too notes a discrepancy between historical Pentecostal eschatological expectations, which served as the central hope empowering their worship and witness, and the modern Pentecostal churches he visited in which this eschatological fire seemed “dampened.”<sup>26</sup> It seems that clear differences exist between early Pentecostalism and

---

<sup>24</sup> Ibid., 6.

<sup>25</sup> Ibid., 3-19.

<sup>26</sup> Cox, *Fire from Heaven*, 317.

contemporary Pentecostalism. Thus, it is imperative to assess both historical and contemporary concerns to faithfully craft a Pentecostal theology.

It is clear that Pentecostalism must be seen as distinct from other traditions, but what makes it distinct is still debated. It seems unwise to elevate one aspect of Pentecostal thought and practice as *the* distinctive. Instead, Pentecostalism's rich and diverse spirituality—especially its soteriology and worship—has much to offer in ecumenical discussion. For the benefit of such discussion, this review will now assess the articulations of a Pentecostal theology of worship.

## ***II. Liturgy and Sacramental Experience in Pentecostalism***

Historically, Pentecostals have been ambivalent towards the language of ritual within their spirituality, but their worship is far more ritualized and liturgical than they recognize.<sup>27</sup> In fact, ritual is an indispensable component of Pentecostal spirituality.<sup>28</sup> Contemporary Pentecostal theologians have grown substantially more comfortable with understanding Pentecostalism as having a form of liturgy, or at least the use of such language to discuss congregational practice. Furthermore, it is important to This portion of the review will assess the benefits of using a liturgical framework to articulate a Pentecostal theology of worship and the sacraments.

---

<sup>27</sup> Frank D. Macchia, *Baptized in the Spirit: A Global Pentecostal Theology*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2006), 247.

<sup>28</sup> Daniel E. Albrecht, *Rites in the Spirit: A Ritual Approach to Pentecostal/charismatic Spirituality (Journal of Pentecostal Theology Supplement)* (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1999), 21, 23; See also, James K. A. Smith, *Desiring the Kingdom: Worship, Worldview, and Cultural Formation* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2009), 152; Wolfgang Vondey, *Beyond Pentecostalism: the Crisis of Global Christianity and the Renewal of the Theological Agenda* (Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2010), 109-131; and Dale M. Coulter "The Whole Gospel for the Whole Person: Ontology, Affectivity, and Sacramentality." *Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies* 35, no. 2 (Brill Publishers, September 2013): 157-161.

In an effort to describe, critically analyze, and constructively interpret Pentecostal spirituality and experience, Daniel Albrecht conducted a socio-scientific study in ritology. Since Pentecostal worship rites are “manifestations of a lived faith,” and “reflect the inherent spirituality of Pentecostal worshippers,” Albrecht sought to sociologically engage and theologically interpret these actions in the midst of Pentecostal worship rituals, focusing on the symbolic-expressive behavior of three Pentecostal/Charismatic communities.<sup>29</sup> Albrecht’s theological interpretation draws from data collected over two years from three Northern California congregations. Although Albrecht’s summation is only a case study amidst a vast and globalized tradition of Christianity, his study provides useful tools and insights for interpreting Pentecostal worship. He explains Pentecostal rituals as “embodied affections...characterized by a playful, expressive, spontaneous and free sensibility.” These rituals are a “dynamic phenomenon” with a sensibility of improvisation cultivating openness to the work of the Holy Spirit.<sup>30</sup> For Albrecht, these rites function both as offering and as dramatization of the Pentecostal experience of God. Albrecht identifies four qualities of Pentecostal spirituality under the category of “experience of God,” and provides a useful theological framework for understanding Pentecostal spirituality through worship and praxis.<sup>31</sup>

Wolfgang Vondey asserts that the notion that Pentecostalism possesses no liturgy at all is “a judgment uncritically accepted by many Pentecostals.”<sup>32</sup> Vondey believes the crisis of Global Christianity to be a crisis of liturgy, and he sees the implicit liturgy of

---

<sup>29</sup> Daniel Albrecht, *Rites in the Spirit: A Ritual Approach to Pentecostal/Charismatic Spirituality*, Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1999), 21-26.

<sup>30</sup> *Ibid.*, 189-199.

<sup>31</sup> *Ibid.*, 237-251.

<sup>32</sup> *Ibid.*, 129.

playful imagination in Pentecostalism as salvific for this crisis.<sup>33</sup> He argues that a liturgical articulation of Pentecostal spirituality is foundational to global theological reorientation precisely because of the liturgy's unconventional qualities, which point “beyond the structural notions of the Christian praxis that resist improvisation, imagination, and creativity.”<sup>34</sup> According to Vondey, the first step in confronting the liturgical crisis has already been taken: acknowledging the liturgical framework of Pentecostalism, but contrasting it to the structural environment of the established traditions. Over against a “conceptually fixed, written, priest-centered, and performance-oriented framework of sacramental celebration,” Pentecostal liturgy emerged as a “destructuralizing, flexible, oral, participation-centered, and pneumatologically oriented ‘open arrangement’ of worship, prayer, and praise.”<sup>35</sup> The causes of such a liturgy were multifaceted. The early Pentecostal liturgy was shaped in part by African roots in a sociocultural context of slavery in North America, expressing the religious impulses of the camp meetings of the Holiness movement, and transformed by migration and urbanization.<sup>36</sup> Born out of slavery, the eschatological expectation and pneumatological reality in the worship of the early Pentecostals provided a safe place for congregants from the outside world. These services employed an array of kinesthetic responses born out of a sense of spiritual liberty. “For the African slaves, ritual action was not a ‘work’ of the people but the freedom from compulsion, exploitation, duty, and performance... Worship meant enthusiasm, life, and freedom – liturgy as play.”<sup>37</sup> Vondey sees the liturgy as the

---

<sup>33</sup> Wolfgang Vondey, *Beyond Pentecostalism: The Crisis of Global Christianity and the Renewal of the Theological Agenda* (Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2010), 109-140.

<sup>34</sup> *Ibid.*, 109.

<sup>35</sup> *Ibid.*, 128.

<sup>36</sup> *Ibid.*, 128. See also Hollenweger, *The Pentecostals*.

<sup>37</sup> *Ibid.*, 121.

structure for sacred play. For Vondey, “The liturgy is not the *product* of the church; on the contrary, as a vehicle of the imagination, the liturgy creates the life of faith.”<sup>38</sup>

In “Worship in the Spirit: Pentecostal Perspectives on Liturgical Theology and Praxis,” Johnathan Alvarado<sup>39</sup> addresses Pentecostal spirit-filled worship. He advocates a blended format of free form and sacred ritual. He begins with a treatment on Christocentric ecclesiology. The narrative centrality of the people of God is crucial to a Pentecostal theology of worship. Alvarado hints at a sacramental understanding of the church when he discusses “how the church expresses the purposes of God in the earth and becomes the answer to the questions of humanity.”<sup>40</sup> The church is empowered by the Spirit in its expression of Jesus. Spirit-led worship includes the concept of play and free worship. As a “vibrant and moving encounter with the divine,”<sup>41</sup> Pentecostal worship is transformational and spiritually formative as a catechizing event into the central tenets of the faith. Thus, Alvarado presents spirit-filled worship as a didactic learning process and the congregation as a learning community. In agreement with Vondey’s critique of worshipful performance, Alvarado contends that the approach of seeing worship as “an audience of one” impoverishes the worshipping community from an active, loving God who participates in the service and facilitates true communion between the worshipers and God. Thus, he calls for the imaginative use of liturgical elements in the worship service which reflect the activity of the Spirit of God.

---

<sup>38</sup> Ibid., 110.

<sup>39</sup> Alvarado, Johnathan E. “Worship in the Spirit: Pentecostal Perspectives on Liturgical Theology and Praxis.” *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 21, no. 1 (April 2012): 135-151.

<sup>40</sup> Ibid., 137.

<sup>41</sup> Ibid., 139.

Daniela C. Augustine sees this Pentecostal liturgy as fundamentally doxological and eucharistic.<sup>42</sup> As the means of communion between God and creation, the church unveils the liturgical and sacramental nature of the world. At Pentecost, the church became the body of Christ, empowered by the Holy Spirit to do the Father's will. Augustine understands worship to be "the liturgical anamnesis of the Church's transformational/transfiguring encounter with the divine presence, and as such is witness to, as well as proclamation and depiction of God's ongoing redemptive and renewing action upon and on behalf of his people and the rest of creation."<sup>43</sup> In this way, worship allows us to reenact the story of God. Augustine sees the church as a sacrament, and the whole liturgy as reflective of sacramental participation in anamnesis. For Augustine,

Liturgical anamnesis is not just a mental recollection of past events, but both their enacted likeness as well as the re-experiencing anew of what is being remembered... Through the Holy Spirit, the living memory of the faith community becomes a mystical, trans-generational, pneumatic participation in the remembered events.<sup>44</sup>

The language of ritual and liturgy has proven to be helpful for articulating a Pentecostal theology of worship. Perspectives of the components and processes of this liturgy vary; some have advocated for a fundamental understanding of Pentecostal liturgy as play, while others see it as performative dramatization of the biblical narrative. However, consensus rests in the liturgy's spontaneous and destabilizing nature, openness to the liberation and direction of the Holy Spirit, and ultimate goal of experiencing the divine in a real way.

---

<sup>42</sup> Daniela C. Augustine "Liturgy, Theosis, and the Renewal of the Word" in *Toward a Theology of Pentecostal Worship*, Ed. Lee Roy Marten, (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2016), 165-185.

<sup>43</sup> Ibid., 165-166.

<sup>44</sup> Ibid., 166.

As Cox has readily observed, the language of experiencing God among Pentecostals is ubiquitous, but often ambiguously defined. This is common in other Christian traditions as well. In his dissertation entitled “Encountering the Spirit: Mediated Experience of God in Theological Context,” Peter D. Neumann examines the cultural-linguistic character of experience, noting a growing consensus among contemporary (non-Pentecostal) theologians that experience must be acknowledged as mediated through “the horizons of specific linguistic, cultural and historical situations in which humans find themselves.”<sup>45</sup> Neumann employs George P. Schner’s continuum to locate the various appeals to experience as they function in contemporary theology. He is concerned with a Christian theology of experience which values a pneumatological “mediated immediacy” of God’s presence, in which “God is being experienced directly, but not uninterpretatively.” For Neumann, “Experience is an authoritative means by which God is known and the divine will revealed; it thus holds epistemological value, and at times holds primacy over theology and doctrine.”<sup>46</sup> Given the ecumenical dimensions of current Pentecostal theology, a discussion of the sacraments within the Pentecostal experience has much to offer. But attempts at constructing a Pentecostal theology of the sacraments must first understand how Pentecostals interpret their experiences.

### ***III. Sacraments and the Pentecostal Via Salutis***

While Pentecostals have a strong sense of personal responsibility in their faith, Pentecostal spirituality is heavily communal and grounded in a shared sense of identity.

---

<sup>45</sup> Peter D. Neumann, “Encountering the Spirit: Pentecostal Mediated Experience of God in Theological Context.” (PhD diss., University of St. Michael’s College, 2010), 32.

<sup>46</sup> *Ibid.*, 109.

A common thread for Pentecostals is a distinct soteriology made robust by their understanding of Spirit Baptism and Christology.<sup>47</sup> For Pentecostals, this soteriology is about a path, rather than a formulaic order; redemption, sanctification, and spirit baptism are “sources of continuing direction,”—a *via salutis*, rather than an *ordo salutis*.<sup>48</sup> In this section of the review, I will assess varying frameworks for understanding the significance of sacraments within Pentecostal soteriology.

In light of studies by Amos Yong, Frank Macchia, and Simon Chan, Monte Lee Rice advocates a multi-dimensional, experiential soteriology as the theological center of Pentecostalism, represented by a contemporary model that he calls the “Pentecostal Triple Way (PTW).”<sup>49</sup> It employs a narratological and constructivist methodology to identify the Pentecostal *via salutis* as a “lifelong spiraling rhythm” of redeeming, sanctifying, and missionally empowering processes along a journey toward *theosis*. Rice offers a synthesis of previous scholarship, retrieving their observations while challenging their conclusions. His integration of constructivist psychotherapy and narrative theology into a synthesis of Pentecostal scholarship is sharply evaluative and historically grounded. Furthermore, his model logically synthesizes Pentecostal soteriology and provides a Trinitarian framework for understanding the Pentecostal experience, paving the way for further narratological integration. Rice then translates his model to describe congregational experiences of worship. The PTW presents a useful framework for discussing Pentecostal soteriology.

---

<sup>47</sup> Narratology is an important consideration when discussing Pentecostal hermeneutical strategies, soteriology, spirituality, and communal dialogues. See Archer, *A Pentecostal Hermeneutic*, 128-135.

<sup>48</sup> Monte Lee Rice, “The Pentecostal Triple Way: An Ecumenical Model of the Pentecostal *Via Salutis* and Soteriological Experience,” in *A Future for Holiness: Pentecostal Explorations*, Edited by Lee Roy Martin. (Cleveland: CPT Press, 2013), 145-150.

<sup>49</sup> *Ibid.*, 145-170.

Historically, Pentecostals have understood their soteriology through personal and communal testimony, expressed most commonly with three-stepped salvation narratives. In *Heaven Below*, Grant Wacker examines these early Pentecostal testimonies, noting that the vast majority reflected a dramatic “before-and-after” narrative in which the believers transitioned from “darkness unto light.”<sup>50</sup> The multifaceted nature of these salvific processes (salvation, sanctification, spirit baptism) was, however, often blurred together. According to Wacker, Pentecostal stories were “chest-thumping declarations” which revealed assurance of salvation and evidence of spiritual power. The Pentecostal experience allegedly brought mundane and extra-mundane benefits to believers’ lives, serving practical functions and strengthening personal and collective identity. Testimonies reported physical invigoration and betterment of daily life, divine healings (testimonies which, according to Wacker, tallied in the thousands), and deliverance from addictions and racism. Of course, participants still faced many problems following their transformational experiences, and Wacker warns against “sentimentalizing” these testimonies. However, he is quick to note the powerful communal and narrative coping methods they revival provided for worshipful participants.

In order to understand the mediated experience of God in Pentecostalism, Neumann views pneumatic encounter through the lens of Pentecostal worship.<sup>51</sup> Employing Daniel Albrecht’s socio-theological framework in *Rites in the Spirit*, Neumann sees the Pentecostal experience of God as mystical and supernatural, as communal, as empowerment for mission, and as creativity. He then examines three major players within Pentecostal scholarship that are revisioning Pentecostal appeals to

---

<sup>50</sup> Wacker, *Heaven Below*, 58-69.

<sup>51</sup> *Ibid.*, 107-165.

experience, appropriated in the mediated experience of scripture, tradition, and reason. According to Neumann, the work of Frank Macchia, Simon Chan, and Amos Yong shows a “growing openness to a mediated concept of experience of the Spirit,” evidencing Pentecostalism’s theological maturation. When it comes to the specific actions which mediate experience of God, Neumann is quick to avoid reductionism to the two traditional experiences, conversion and subsequent spirit baptism. Neumann holds that truly “Pentecostal” experience must involve immediacy, the sense of direct encounter with God, thus “A mature Pentecostal theology, then, needs to acknowledge the ways in which experience of God is mediated, while simultaneously upholding the belief in the immediacy (or directness) of encounter with God.”<sup>52</sup> This enforces the need for an acute theology of the sacraments, which by definition are mediating actions for experiencing God’s grace.

Dale Coulter also advocates for such a mediated experience in Pentecostal sacramentality. In a paper for the 2013 annual meeting of the Society for Pentecostal Studies, Coulter reminds Pentecostals of the importance of sacraments both as vehicles of grace and as deeper transformation in the conscientization of the spirit’s movement in the heart.<sup>53</sup> Coulter explains the importance of the reciprocity and interconnectedness of ontology, affectivity, and sacramentality within Pentecostalism. Coulter is concerned with habituating the ontological reshaping of orthopathy, referring to this as “affective transformation.”<sup>54</sup> For Coulter, passion, belief, and action are interconnected. Human

---

<sup>52</sup> Ibid., 166.

<sup>53</sup> Dale M. Coulter, "The Whole Gospel for the Whole Person: Ontology, Affectivity, and Sacramentality," *Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies* 35, no. 2 (September 2013): 157-161.

<sup>54</sup> Ibid., 159-160.

nature is fundamentally developmental, and since affections are linked to objects, we need actions which help to habituate affective movement. Coulter understands sacramental action to shape emergent conscientization in the life of a believer. For Coulter, ongoing moments of crisis in the Christian faith are fundamentally sacramental, and thus shape our affections and, in turn, transform our cognition. Since humans are socially embedded creatures, this transformation occurs both within individuals and the community of faith. Coulter's article is a pertinent synthesis of philosophical, theological, and psychological research. He succeeds in holding to the pneumatic mystery of sacramental transformation while beginning to identify the phenomenological process of that transformation as a reshaping of the affections.

For Archer, the "theological grid" which gives focus to the Pentecostal story is the Five-fold Gospel: Jesus Christ as Savior, Sanctifier, Healer, Spirit Baptizer, and Soon Coming King. This shared language and understanding of Christ "provides a firm interpretive lens for the fluid Pentecostal community and their reading of scripture."<sup>55</sup> Archer argues that these narrative convictions, rooted in the community, are crucial to Pentecostal hermeneutical strategies, because "the making and explaining of meaning is inherently communal."<sup>56</sup> Testimony is not the only significant narratological practice in Pentecostal spirituality. Archer has argued for an integration of sacraments into Pentecostalism's dynamically pneumatic narrative-praxis soteriology.<sup>57</sup> By linking sacraments with "ordinances," he identifies five Christocentric and Spirit-infused actions (water baptism, footwashing, *glossolalia*, anointing of oil, and the Lord's Supper) which

---

<sup>55</sup> Ibid., 137.

<sup>56</sup> Archer, *A Pentecostal Hermeneutic*, 131.

<sup>57</sup> See Archer's discussion of the Pentecostal *via salutis* and sacramental ordinances in *The Gospel Revisited*, 65-82.

engage and reflect the Fivefold Gospel (Jesus as Savior, Sanctifier, Spirit Baptizer, Healer, and Soon Coming King), explaining the ways in which they “nourish” a journey along the Pentecostal *via salutis*. Confronting disagreements and fears among some Pentecostals as to the grace-mediating power of these actions, Archer maintains that sacraments initiate redemptive participation in the divine life for the worshipping community.<sup>58</sup> Archer acts cohesively within the theological constraints he advises, demonstrating sacramental narrative-praxis that is both rooted in and enriched by the Fivefold Gospel, boasting sufficient Christocentricity and Pneumatological appreciation. Archer argues that a coherent and cohesive integration of the sacraments into Pentecostal theology must be grounded in the story of Jesus and narrative theology.<sup>59</sup>

Before delving into his own assertions toward a Pentecostal theology of the Lord’s Supper, Chris Green offers an extensive review of literature analyzing the chronological progression of thought pertaining to the subject, ranging from 1932 to 2012. His conclusions are concise, offering cohesive construction of the subject. Green concludes that in the last decade there has been a “turn” to the sacraments in Pentecostal theology.<sup>60</sup> Some are concerned with integrating ecumenical perspectives, some primarily with developing a uniquely Pentecostal perspective. Some (Bond, Horton, Slay) insist that the rites are mere ordinances, while others (Chan, Yong, Biddy, Tomberlin) have put forward a sacramental view. All have eschewed a “magical” view of the sacraments, and most are careful to warn against the dangers of liturgical formalism and clericalism. All the reviewed theologians appeal to scripture for support of their positions. According to

---

<sup>58</sup> Ibid., 70.

<sup>59</sup> Ibid., 68.

<sup>60</sup> Chris E. W. Green, *Toward a Pentecostal Theology of the Lord’s Supper: Foretasting the Kingdom*, (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2012).

Green, “differences in theological method seem to determine differences in opinion among Pentecostals on the purpose and meaning of sacraments.”<sup>61</sup> Those who argue for non-sacramentalism do so on presumed biblical and pastoral grounds, while those who advocate a robust sacramental view do so by looking at church history and historical Christian practice as well as from scriptures.

Unlike Green’s assessment, Vondey rejects sacramental language because it is not expansive enough for Pentecostal theology. For Vondey, the transition into a semiotic role of tongues as a “sign” of Spirit baptism was not an expression of the creative Pentecostal imagination, but a product of the limited conceptual-linguistic framework of the established theological traditions.<sup>62</sup> Vondey notes that early Pentecostals understood Spirit baptism as an image rather than a theological concept, created from biblical imagery in order to articulate the significance of tongues and the charismata and to contain the Pentecostal story, reflecting personal experience and their understanding of divine self-disclosure. There was little need to explain Spirit baptism because it was experienced in terms of power, joy, and glory that transcended the bonds of conceptualization, formalization, and rationalization.<sup>63</sup> Thus Vondey sees a sacramental articulation of tongues as limiting the Pentecostal story and imagination. Vondey’s concerns are not unmerited, but they fail to recognize the semiotic capacity of sacramental language, particularly regarding its pneumatology.

Noting the discomfort most Pentecostals have with the term “sacrament,” Frank Macchia sets out to redeem the term for Pentecostal use, overcoming critiques of

---

<sup>61</sup> Green, *Toward a Pentecostal Theology of the Lord’s Supper*, 73.

<sup>62</sup> Vondey, *Beyond Pentecostalism*, 16-46.

<sup>63</sup> *Ibid.*, 33.

Reformed theology and aged wariness of Catholicism.<sup>64</sup> Macchia analyzes recent trends within Catholic theologian's sacramental definitions—more agreeable with Pentecostal spirituality because of their incorporation of the dynamic and personal experience of God's presence. Adopting much of his sacramental understanding from Paul Tillich and Karl Rahner, Macchia understands sacraments to facilitate meaningful participation with the divine in an almost "theophanic" way, beyond the capacity of human thought or language. For Macchia, glossolalia mirrors this sacramental definition in a distinctly Pentecostal way, not only because of its invocation of the experienced eschatological presence of God, but also because of its destabilizing effect on institutional and formalized liturgical practices, accenting the freedom and unpredictability of God's Spirit and the movement's pneumatological heart. His discussion of sacramentality is not limited to tongues alone, but also the sacramentality of the church and its other charismatic expressions. Macchia's argument is beneficial for both Pentecostal ecclesiology and ecumenical dialogue. He perceptively surveys theologians beyond his own tradition and synthesizes their arguments and definitions with his dynamic understanding of Pentecostal spirituality. He speaks to the need for holistically integrated liturgy in Pentecostalism without degrading Pentecostals for their historic discomfort of structured practices, giving credence to Pentecostal identity even while he challenges the status quo of its practice and theology. However, Macchia's argument here remains uncontextualized, lacking in historical appropriation.

Early Pentecostals may not have actively practiced the sacraments, but their spirituality reflected a deeply rooted sacramentality. Grant Wacker's assessment of

---

<sup>64</sup> Frank D. Macchia, "Tongues as a Sign: Towards a Sacramental Understanding of Pentecostal Experience." *Pneuma* 15, no. 1 (1993): 61-76.

cosmology in *Heaven Below: Early Pentecostals and American Culture* shows that Pentecostal spirituality was as Smith has identified, highly material, incorporating the body into worshipful routines.<sup>65</sup> Wacker explores the ways in which early Pentecostal cosmology blurred the lines of visible and invisible worlds, mingling together the physical and the spiritual in their Christology, Pneumatology, and perceptions of humanity. Wacker shows how deeply ingrained and central Christology was in their worship—worship which early Pentecostals understood to have one goal: “to make Jesus’ presence real.”<sup>66</sup> Pneumatological lines blurred between the Holy Spirit being a person and an impersonal power. Wacker’s strong language relays the full force of passion with which Pentecostals experienced their lives, and his incorporation and analysis of early hymns in his assessment as evidence of that passion demonstrates the convictions of early Pentecostals. Furthermore, Wacker’s assessment helps to lay the foundation for a sacramentality that mingles the physical and spiritual, the semiotic and true mediation, and the tensions between the already and the not yet.

Sacramentality plays a vital role in Frank Macchia’s pneumatologically informed ecclesiology. For Macchia, Spirit baptism is both the foundation and the goal of sacramental expectation. But unlike water baptism, the church does not administer Spirit baptism; Spirit baptism administers the church.<sup>67</sup> According to Macchia, any discussion of the central role of Spirit baptism in global Pentecostalism necessitates a discussion of the church. Macchia sees the church as the integral outcome of Spirit baptism, and sees its empowered witness as a sacrament for the world. “As a relational dynamic, Spirit

---

<sup>65</sup> Wacker, *Heaven Below*, 87-98.

<sup>66</sup> *Ibid.*, 8.

<sup>67</sup> *Ibid.*, 251.

baptism not only empowers and renews the people of God, it has birthed the people of God as the sign of grace in an increasingly graceless world.”<sup>68</sup> Macchia views the Pentecostal fivefold gospel as an elaboration of the marks of the church, and sees preaching, sacraments, and Charismatic fullness as ways of modeling the Trinitarian *koinonia* (fellowship). These actions are highly relational and interactive. For Macchia, the gifts are extensions of grace which sacramentally “proliferate and diversify Christ’s presence through the church in the world.”<sup>69</sup> Thus, Macchia advocates for the charismatically interactive experience of Spiritual infilling while partaking the Lord’s Supper. For Macchia, this *epiclesis* is at the heart of sacramental participation, because liturgical form and function mean nothing without the Spirit.<sup>70</sup>

Johnathan Alvarado sees Pentecostals as sacramental and “epicletic people.”<sup>71</sup> In order to construct an understanding of contemporary Pentecostal epicletic practice, Alvarado surveys the theological backdrop of Eucharist and epiclesis from the Wesleyan, Orthodox, and Reformed traditions, noting the primary influence of Wesleyan theology of sanctification. For Alvarado, the presence of the spirit is vital for the efficacy of the sacramental elements as means of grace, sanctifying both the bread and wine *and* those partaking them. Alvarado sees sacraments as “sign-acts,” consisting of “performative speech and constitutive actions that both symbolize and catalyze spiritual effusion into the lives of the gathered worshiping community.”<sup>72</sup> He understands both baptism and foot washing to employ prayers of epiclesis, which are conduits for the transformative process

---

<sup>68</sup> Frank D. Macchia, *Baptized in the Spirit: A Global Pentecostal Theology*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2006), 156.

<sup>69</sup> *Ibid.*, 243.

<sup>70</sup> *Ibid.*, 252.

<sup>71</sup> Johnathan E. Alvarado, "Pentecostal Epiclesis: A Model for Teaching and Learning." *Pneuma* 35, no. 2 (2013): 180-198.

<sup>72</sup> *Ibid.*, 191.

of reorientation into the story of God. For Kenneth Archer, any coherent and cohesive integration of the sacraments into Pentecostal theology must be grounded in the story of Jesus and narrative theology.<sup>73</sup> Alvarado accomplishes this by not only grounding his understanding of Pentecostal sacramentality and prayers of epiclesis in the historical development of the Pentecostal tradition, but demonstrating that the very transformation of epiclesis is toward the reorientation of worshipers into the metanarrative of God's redemption. Alvarado underlines the connectedness between Christian traditions and believes that a discussion of epiclesis as a formative aspect of worship shows that both Pentecostals and mainline denominations have much to learn from one another.

James K. A. Smith is also interested in the formative nature of sacraments for Pentecostals. Built upon the assumption that human beings are primarily affective, “desiring creatures,” Smith focuses his attention on worshipful actions which shape a Christian social imaginary.<sup>74</sup> For Smith, Christian worship is fundamentally formative precisely because of the wide range of full-bodied expressions like sacraments.<sup>75</sup> Smith is careful to balance on the one hand the extreme of leveling the liturgical sacraments for the sacramentality of the world, and on the other hand the temptation to naturalize the liturgy as just another embodied practice. Smith even brings his sacramental imagination to life by analyzing prose and poetry in the midst of his rational argument. Smith's appreciation for the materiality of the world, and God's meeting us in that materiality, is

---

<sup>73</sup> Kenneth J. Archer, *The Gospel Revisited: Towards a Pentecostal Theology of Worship and Witness* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock Pub, 2011), 67.

<sup>74</sup> The term is adapted from the work of Charles Taylor, *Modern Social Imaginaries* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2004), 23-30. In *Desiring the Kingdom*, 63-71, Smith advocates the use of social imaginary over worldview. His decision to center his discussion on social imaginaries rather than a Christian worldview bypasses arbitrary cognitivism and allows for a discussion of ontic and social transformation, and is a useful framework for further dialogue.

<sup>75</sup> James K. A. Smith, *Desiring the Kingdom: Worship, Worldview, and Cultural Formation*. (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2009), 133-154.

crucial for an understanding of the materiality of sacramental function for Pentecostals experiencing God’s mediated presence. However, his inclination to see everything as sacramental may undermine the significance of traditional sacraments. But Smith is not alone in finding sacraments in unconventional places.

In a sweeping cosmological framework of relationality through embodiment, Daniela C. Augustine sets the stage for a sacramental understanding of Pentecostal preaching.<sup>76</sup> She addresses the need for this theology of preaching by acknowledging the symbiotic relationship between theology and praxis. Engaging Orthodox perspectives, Augustine explicates the *kenosis* and *askesis* implicit in the hospitality of a proto-communal Trinity who makes room for the created other and ultimately desires cosmic theosis. This self-limiting relationship with the (both anthropic and non-anthropic) created other is the prerogative of the Trinity, toward the telos (intended outcome, end/fulfillment) of theosis (the fulfilment of one’s created purpose culminating in deification). The paradigmatic act toward theosis is the Incarnation, in which the Word becomes flesh. Augustine explains the ontological necessity of embodiment for relationship between God and creation, and expounds extensively on the process of Christ’s incarnation. For Augustine, sacraments are essentially space in which the gospel is incarnated in the participating church. In turn, the church becomes the sacramental sign for the world’s eschatological healing and redemption—the creational theosis. Addressing the created intention and vocation of humanity and the practical process through which the church allows believers to achieve this theosis, Augustine provides a

---

<sup>76</sup> Daniela C. Augustine, “From Proclamation to Embodiment: The Sacrament of the Word for the Life of the World and Its Destiny in Theosis” in *Toward a Pentecostal Theology of Preaching*, edited by Lee Roy Martin. (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2015), 82-110.

sacramental theology of preaching that embodies the holistic Christian gospel of incarnation. As such, it is a valuable proliferation of liturgical theology and a step toward a foundational articulation of sacramental purpose and function. Though her cosmology seems detached from Pentecostalism, she employs sufficient biblical exegesis in its support. Vast and well-constructed, and Augustine’s perspective provides ecumenical precedent for an integration of orthodox articulation within Pentecostal theology.

However, Chris Green holds that the presence of Jesus and the presence of the Spirit are not the same. He argues that Pentecostal experience is fundamentally Trinitarian, but that early Pentecostalism inherited a “frail” doctrine of the Trinity from Wesleyan-holiness tradition which now has “little to no formative influence on how Pentecostals make sense of their churchly experiences of God.”<sup>77</sup> Green ameliorates this deficit by offering three ways in which we can speak about the “triplicity” of our experience of God. For Green, “To encounter God is to be drawn into contact with the event that is God’s perichoretically-mutual life.”<sup>78</sup> Experiencing the presence of God is thus an identification with the joy that Christ feels as part of the perichoretic-mutuality, and the divine-human encounter is an event of radical hospitality in which the church joins in on the joyful dance of the divine.

Several of the scholars surveyed have linked Pentecostal spirituality with the spirituality of the Eastern Orthodox tradition. Land states, “Pentecostalism is more Eastern than Western in its understanding of spirituality as perfection and participation in

---

<sup>77</sup> Chris E. W. Green “‘In Your Presence is Fullness of Joy’: Experiencing God as Trinity” in *Toward a Pentecostal Theology of Worship*, edited by Lee Roy Martin, (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2016), 192.

<sup>78</sup> *Ibid.*, 195.

the divine life.”<sup>79</sup> Excluding the concerns of Oneness Pentecostals, nearly all of the scholars surveyed seek a Pentecostal theology of experience that reflects the Trinity, much of which is informed by the rich Orthodox understanding of Perichoresis. Because Pentecostal spirituality is seen as a participation in the Divine life, significant discussion surrounds the notion of *theosis* in its soteriology. Some see it as the explicit purpose of Pentecostal spirituality.

Given the perspectives in the review, I will seek in particular to articulate a theology of the sacraments which gives credence to the participation in the story of God. The narratological frameworks for understanding Pentecostal soteriology are many and varied. Perhaps the most consistent is that employed by Archer and Land, which are reflective of the Fivefold Gospel of Jesus. But some, like Monte Lee Rice, Chris Green, and Daniela C. Augustine, have advocated for a triple way reflective of the Trinity. Some scholarship is for the incorporation of sacramental interpretations in Pentecostal spirituality, others give space for it implicitly, but some are careful to warn against anything that can hinder the Pentecostal imagination and playful spontaneity. Alvarado explicitly resists seeing Pentecostalism as “nonsacramental.”<sup>80</sup> Evidenced by the topic of Coulter’s editorial in *Pneuma*,<sup>81</sup> as well as the several assessments in this review, a concern for sacramentality is gaining momentum in Pentecostal scholarship. Furthermore, there is significant support for viewing aspects of Pentecostal worship as sacramental beyond the traditionally afforded ordinances, as Augustine has demonstrated

---

18. <sup>79</sup> Steven J. Land, *Pentecostal Spirituality: A Passion for the Kingdom*. (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press),

<sup>80</sup> Alvarado, “Pentecostal Epiclesis,” 191.

<sup>81</sup> Coulter, “Ontology, Affectivity, and Sacramentality,” 157-161.

with her theology of preaching.<sup>82</sup> This has opened the possibility for new articulations within a Pentecostal theology of worship.

#### ***IV. Music as a Sacrament***

Outside of Pentecostalism, work has been done to hint at a sacramental nature in music, but virtually no theological construction of such sacramental music exists in Pentecostal scholarship. Jeremy Begbie has used classical music to inform an understanding of the Eucharist. Karl Barth and Dietrich Bonhoeffer employed music as meta-sacramental metaphors for the world and for human existence, but the only extensive parallel between sacraments and musical worship has been made by Sarah Koenig. This article is mainly a textual-critical analysis of lyrics and theological concepts. Aside from this, no one has definitively paralleled music's hymnal and worshipful function with the function of sacraments, and certainly not within a Pentecostal context. The closest parallel is Albrecht's understanding of sound as *icon* (a visual concept), which is odd given music's aural nature. Though there are key similarities, this is a different theological concept than sacramentality. Many have interpreted Pentecostal worship as a whole to be sacramental,<sup>83</sup> but no Pentecostal scholars have explicitly named music as a sacramental action.

Based on his socio-scientific study, Albrecht explains the ways in which sound (particularly music) creates sacred space (what he calls "ritual fields") for Pentecostal/Charismatic communities. By looking at how they organize sensory experience in rituals, Albrecht theologically interprets and constructs a

---

<sup>82</sup> Augustine, "From Proclamation to Embodiment," 82-110;

<sup>83</sup> See Johnathan E. Alvarado, "Pentecostal Epiclesis" 180-198; Daniela C. Augustine, "From Proclamation to Embodiment," 82-110; James K. A. Smith, *Desiring the Kingdom*, 133-154, Macchia, *Baptized in the Spirit*, 153-164.

Pentecostal/Charismatic spirituality implicit in their worship. Different sensory elements (sounds, sights, and kinesthetic dimensions) function as “*icons*” for the Pentecostal/Charismatic community in the way visual elements function for Orthodox traditions. According to Albrecht’s study, the goal of Pentecostals is “not only to experience their God within the ritual space of the sanctuary, but is to view the whole world as potentially a sacred space sanctified by the people of God and the spirit of God working through them.”<sup>84</sup> Not only are auditory, visual, and kinesthetic elements identifiable as icons, but other believers themselves become icons amidst the worshipping community. Specifically, Albrecht identifies music as an auditory *icon*,<sup>85</sup> but this assessment is incompatible given the visual nature of *icons*. Thus, a theology of musical worship must be articulated in another way.

The notion of worship as witness is not unique to Pentecostalism. Karl Barth and Dietrich Bonhoeffer have both employed music as a metaphor for the implicit sacramental witness of the church. As part of the book *Resonant Witness: Discussions between Theology and Music*, David J. R. S. Mosely offers a reflection on two musical metaphors by Barth and Bonhoeffer to show how each perceives Christian life as a fully lived “witness to God in Christ.” First, Mosely describes the metaphors: First, Bonhoeffer’s “polyphony” – the centrality of our affection toward God being a kind of *Cantus Firmus* (central root melody) in our contrapuntal lives, which harmonize with each other. – and Barth’s “parables” – the witness of Jesus’ actions. Both deeply loved music (Barth had an obsessive respect for Mozart). Mosely assesses the theology of Bonhoeffer and Barth separately and then integrates them to develop a theology gleaned

---

<sup>84</sup> Albrecht, *Rites in the Spirit*, 136.

<sup>85</sup> *Ibid.*, 142.

from studying music. These include: (1) music’s ability to orient participants toward God and Christ, who are the “center of gravity that anchors all human existence;” (2) the fragmentariness of polyphony (the harmony of music amidst the chaos of multiple voices) inform’s what Bonhoeffer calls “parabolic provisionality,” speaking to a narrative “whole” that music requires of participants; (3) the “invitational” and “participatory” natures of Christian life as witness; and (4) music as informing a theology of play and serving as the context for “the liberated self-giving of perfect play.” The primary purpose of parables, according to Mosely, is “not that we might understand the kingdom of God, but that we might *experience it*, as God invades our time and gifts us the temporality of narrative under the form of parables.”<sup>86</sup> Mosely notes that parables

Reach through the commonplace to its alleged transcendent ground without evacuating the mundane and ordinary of its proper dignity. As such, they cannot be mere examples, but constitute an enlargement of our perception of the world, making new things familiar and familiar things new, enabling us to comprehend things as they truly are. The parabolic event is both informative and representative, disturbing and critiquing our assumptions about piety, bringing together profoundly theological and non-religious dimensions.<sup>87</sup>

Mosely’s articulation of music as “parable and polyphony” discloses its semiotic capability as a form of “witness” for the church. This appears to be particularly sacramental, implicitly undergirding the performative and participatory nature of sacramental rituals as seen by the Pentecostals surveyed above. At the very least, this articulation is helpful for highlighting the sacramentality of music.

---

<sup>86</sup> David J. R. S. Mosely, “‘Parables’ and ‘Polyphony’: The Resonance of Music as Witness in the Theology of Karl Barth and Dietrich Bonhoeffer,” in *Resonant Witness: Conversations Between Music and Theology*, edited by Jeremy s. Begbie and Steven R. Guthrie. (Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2011), 267.

<sup>87</sup> Mosely, “Parables and Provisionality,” 268.

In “Repetitions and Eucharist,” Jeremy Begbie offers what he calls “a musical reading of the Eucharist.”<sup>88</sup> Music depends on repetition to highlight the endless unique expression of the same patterns; thus repetition becomes regeneration rather than reiteration. Begbie parallels this abundant complexity with the opportunity Christians have each time they partake of the Eucharist. Furthermore, he explicates the transformative and temporally dialectic nature of sacraments analogous to musical time. Eucharist can serve to increase tension, but also, concurrently, to effect resolution. Begbie utilizes the semiotic ambiguity of music to highlight the experience of the Eucharist, which transcends cognition and speech. While Begbie’s argument strengthens a theology of the Eucharist, it does not conclude that music itself is a sacrament.

On the other hand, Sarah Koenig does argue that music is a sacrament. In her article for Saint John’s Abbey’s *Worship* publication, Sarah Koenig argues for a sacramental theology of worship in the charismatic evangelical experience.<sup>89</sup> Koenig argues that music is the defining liturgical activity for evangelical churches and plays a role along the soteriological *ordo*. To demonstrate this, Koenig analyzes the lyrics of several popular “Praise and Worship” songs. Drawing parallels between the implicit theology of these songs and the liturgical praxis of the Eucharist, Koenig ties American evangelicalism to rich and historic liturgical traditions of Christianity, deepening the evangelical theology of worship and encouraging ecumenical dialogue. Koenig analyzes the lyrics of popular evangelical praise and worship songs to offer support for her theological and ecclesiological claims, but these tend to be fairly generalized with

---

<sup>88</sup> Jeremy Begbie, “Repetition and Eucharist,” in *Theology, Music, and Time*. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 155-175.

<sup>89</sup> Sarah Koenig, “This is My Daily Bread: Toward a Sacramental Theology of Evangelical Praise and Worship.” *Worship* 82, no. 2 (March 2008): 141-161.

interpretations open to potential criticism. It may be said that the music of a movement bears layers of meaning on par with theological texts, but her argument could benefit from a wider array of theological sources. Despite this simple methodology, Koenig's logical observations both raise and answer several critical questions that help to expand and articulate an evangelical theology of worship. Many of Koenig's observations about the intents and purposes of evangelical worship intersect with those found in Pentecostal circles. Her description of evangelical "Praise and Worship" as Eucharistic is well-articulated, but not well supported, leaving substantial room for further theological inquiry.

Therefore, an articulation of musical worship as a Pentecostal sacrament will not only benefit a Pentecostal theology of worship, but demonstrate the value of such a theology for ecumenical dialogue. In order to accomplish this task, it is first necessary to delineate a theology of the sacraments rooted in the Pentecostal experience and faithful to its soteriology.

## Chapter 2

### *Articulating a Pentecostal Sacramentality*

Historically, Pentecostals have been ambivalent towards the language of ritual within their spirituality, but their worship is far more ritualized and liturgical than they recognize.<sup>90</sup> In fact, ritual is an indispensable component of Pentecostal spirituality.<sup>91</sup> Daniel Albrecht sees Pentecostal worship rites as “manifestations of a lived faith, of a religious or spiritual experience ... which characterize and in some ways define them as a people.”<sup>92</sup> Shaping the affections and facilitating communion with the felt presence of the Divine, Pentecostal rites engage individuals in the story of God’s renewal and transformation.<sup>93</sup> Sacraments are ritual actions which nourish the Pentecostal narrative-praxis spirituality by allowing us to tangibly experience God’s transformational presence and promise.<sup>94</sup> As outward expressions of an inward experience, sacraments bear significant semiotic weight, able to mediate the mysteries of grace in ways that transcend human rationality and speech.<sup>95</sup> Given the ecumenical dimensions of current Pentecostal theology, a discussion of the role of sacraments within Pentecostalism has much to offer.

---

<sup>90</sup> Macchia, *Baptized in the Spirit*, 247.

<sup>91</sup> Daniel E. Albrecht, *Rites in the Spirit: A Ritual Approach to Pentecostal/charismatic Spirituality (Journal of Pentecostal Theology Supplement)* (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1999), 21, 23; See also, James K. A. Smith, *Desiring the Kingdom: Worship, Worldview, and Cultural Formation* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2009), 152; Wolfgang Vondey, *Beyond Pentecostalism: the Crisis of Global Christianity and the Renewal of the Theological Agenda* (Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2010), 109-131; and Dale M. Coulter "The Whole Gospel for the Whole Person: Ontology, Affectivity, and Sacramentality." *Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies* 35, no. 2 (Brill Publishers, September 2013): 157-161.

<sup>92</sup> Daniel E. Albrecht, *Rites in the Spirit: A Ritual Approach to Pentecostal/charismatic Spirituality (Journal of Pentecostal Theology Supplement)* (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1999), 13.

<sup>93</sup> Coulter, Dale M. "The Whole Gospel for the Whole Person: Ontology, Affectivity, and Sacramentality." *Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies* 35, no. 2 (September 2013): 157-161. See also Steven Land’s centrality of participation in God’s story in *Pentecostal Spirituality*, 74-75

<sup>94</sup> Kenneth J. Archer, *The Gospel Revisited: Towards a Pentecostal Theology of Worship and Witness* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock Pub, 2011), 67.

<sup>95</sup> Macchia, *Baptized in the Spirit*, 254.

Thus, in this portion of the paper, I will articulate a Pentecostal theology of the sacraments as actions which enrich the Pentecostal life through physical catechesis and participation in the story of God, dialectic temporal contexts for the inbreaking of eschatological realities, and the mutual epiclesis toward *theosis* and transformational communion with the divine and with the community of faith.<sup>96</sup>

Sacraments are physical, embodied experiences that demonstrate spiritual realities and allow us to participate in God’s redemption narrative. As a sort of kinesthetic catechesis—what James K. A. Smith calls “training-by-doing”—these actions become “opportunities for practicing and rehearsing what it means to be the people of God.”<sup>97</sup> Physically immersing believers into the story of Christ’s death and resurrection, water baptism initiates individuals into the community of faith and symbolizes a rebirth of soteriological identity.<sup>98</sup> Likewise, footwashing demonstrates forgiveness through a physical action of service and humility, in which believers reenact the story of Christ and teach one another about God’s redemptive cleansing and sanctification.<sup>99</sup> According to Smith, “Emphasizing the material conditions of worship, and the formation that is effected by participation in such practices, is not meant to be a naturalization of worship but rather to honor the incarnational nature of God’s dealing with humanity.”<sup>100</sup> The

---

<sup>96</sup> The distinctiveness of Pentecostal thought discussed in the review of literature warrants a theology of the sacraments which include actions not conventionally defined as “sacraments.” I am using Archer’s understanding of the sacramental ordinances which function in Pentecostalism’s narrative-praxis. See *The Gospel Revisited*, 43-64, 76-88; Cf. Daniella C. Augustine, “the Empowered Church: Ecclesiological Dimensions of the Event of Pentecost,” ed. John Christopher Thomas, *Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology: The Church and the Fivefold Gospel*, 157-180; and Frank Macchia, “Tongues as a Sign,” *Pneuma* 15, No. 1, Spring 1993.

<sup>97</sup> James K. A. Smith, *Desiring the Kingdom: Worship, Worldview, and Cultural Formation* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2009), 153.

<sup>98</sup> Archer, *The Gospel Revisited*, 76.

<sup>99</sup> *Ibid.*, 77.

<sup>100</sup> Smith, *Desiring the Kingdom*, 151.

tangibility of the sacramental elements reflects a spiritual formation rooted in the Hebrew word for knowledge, *yada*, which “points beyond the conceptualization of an object to the actualization of a relationship.”<sup>101</sup> Transformation, not mere information, is the goal of this process in coming to know God. Accomplishing such a relational transformation requires the habituated reshaping of one’s affections by being caught up in a larger narrative.<sup>102</sup> Sacraments do this by engaging more than just cognition in their catechesis of relationality. As Dale Coulter explains, “It is also a conscientization that unfolds through the ritual acts of baptism and Eucharist in which the believer encounters Christ afresh amidst his body and enters the drama of redemption.”<sup>103</sup> Thus, sacraments are both contemplation and participation.

As we come to know Christ by kinesthetically participating in his death and resurrection, we also take part in his promised redemption and eschatological healing. Pentecostal sacraments facilitate a temporal dialectic, blending together past, present, and future as we witness the inbreaking power and transformational presence of God in our midst. Jeremy Begbie explains,

The Eucharist is the repeated embodiment of God’s summons, provoking our attention, opening us out to Christ in such a way that what Christ was, suffered and did for us is made ever and again contemporary in its completeness for us who are still ‘on the way’, and, moreover, in such a manner that his past is known not merely as past to us but also as future.<sup>104</sup>

---

<sup>101</sup> Land, *Pentecostal Spirituality*, 75.

<sup>102</sup> More specifically, this process facilitates a transformation of one’s social imaginary, a term developed by Charles Taylor and appropriated by Coulter for his discussion of Pentecostal sacramentality. See Coulter, “Ontology, Affectivity, and Sacramentality,” 158, 160.

<sup>103</sup> *Ibid.*, 160.

<sup>104</sup> Jeremy Begbie, *Cambridge Studies in Christian Doctrine*, vol. 4, *Theology, Music, and Time* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 173.

Re-actualizing the initial overcoming of social, ethnic, and gender barriers in baptism,<sup>105</sup> each opportunity to partake of communion is an opportunity for the reshaping of our created temporal perspective as we simultaneously remember Christ’s suffering and glimpse the eschatological reality of God’s end to death and pain at the marriage supper of the Lamb.<sup>106</sup> This experienced promise of a new future ignites a yearning for its fulfillment,<sup>107</sup> and the sacramental laying on of hands requests and anticipates an inbreaking of God’s healing for the whole person in the present.<sup>108</sup> This addresses not only physical healing, but also the inner healing of emotions, the societal healing for the nations, and the ecological healing for creation.<sup>109</sup> Frank Macchia identifies an emphasis among Pentecostals “on visible/audible signs and wonders that make God’s free, eschatological presence ‘here and now’ to empower, liberate, and heal.”<sup>110</sup> For Augustine, the vision of a healed world is realized in the *theosis* of the church. This “redemptive transfiguring is a transition from being an unaware beneficiary of divine grace...to becoming an active, intentional embodiment of the divine hospitality within the cosmos.”<sup>111</sup> As actions of proleptic anamnesis, sacramental rites blur the lines of temporality, providing contexts for the experience of Spirit-empowered transformation and healing.

---

<sup>105</sup> Matthias Wenk, “The Sanctified Community,” *Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology: The Church and the Fivefold Gospel*, ed. Thomas (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press), 124.

<sup>106</sup> We know that one day, “God will wipe away every tear from their eyes, and death shall be no more, neither shall there be mourning nor crying nor pain any more, for the former things have passed away. And he who sits upon the throne says: Behold, I make all things new.” Rev. 21:4, 5; Isa. 35:10

<sup>107</sup> Begbie, *Theology, Music, and Time*, 167.

<sup>108</sup> Archer, *The Gospel Revisited*, 78-79

<sup>109</sup> Matthew K. Thompson, “Eschatology as Soteriology: The Cosmic Full Gospel,” *Perspectives in Pentecostal Eschatologies: World Without End*, Peter Althouse and Robby Waddell, eds., (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock Pub, 2010), 201-202.

<sup>110</sup> Macchia, “Tongues as a Sign,” 76.

<sup>111</sup> Augustine, “From Proclamation to Embodiment,” 91.

Toward this restoration, sacraments mediate a mutual epiclesis of communion with the divine and communion with one another. Epiclesis is the Eucharistic prayer of invocation, calling the Spirit to infill and sanctify both the sacramental elements and the participating community.<sup>112</sup> As Alvarado explains, “This sanctifying presence of the Holy Spirit makes the bread and wine efficacious for the transmission of grace into the lives of the worshipers and opens the worshipers up to the life of God, through the church.”<sup>113</sup> Alvarado sees Pentecostals as an “epicletic people,” extending the practice of epiclesis to the ways in which other sacraments create space for meaningful encounter with the divine. Through sacramental epiclesis, not only do Pentecostals invoke the presence of God in their midst, but the Spirit also calls for the church’s awareness and presence with one another. According to Tom Driver, sacraments are acts which “generate intense presence: Worshipers make themselves present to each other and to God, receiving in return the shock of God’s presence among them.”<sup>114</sup> Macchia adds that they facilitate “Christ’s participation through the Spirit in the communal act and our communion with him and one another by means of the same Spirit.”<sup>115</sup> A special unity occurs when an entire congregation participates in this sacramental communion, invoking a “mutual presence, a *koinonia* in the Spirit in which Christ fills us with the Spirit and we give of ourselves in the Spirit to him.”<sup>116</sup> Thus, sacramental participation cultivates communal unity.

---

<sup>112</sup> Johnathan E. Alvarado. "Pentecostal Epiclesis: A Model for Teaching and Learning." *Pneuma* 35, no. 2 (2013), 184.

<sup>113</sup> *Ibid.*, 190.

<sup>114</sup> Tom F. Driver, *The Magic of Ritual: Our Need for Liberating Rites That Transform Our Lives and Our Communities* (Harper, San Francisco, 1992), 211.

<sup>115</sup> Macchia, *Baptized in the Spirit*, 255.

<sup>116</sup> *Ibid.*

In summary, sacraments are physical rites which function within Pentecostal spirituality as both contemplation and participation. As actions of kinesthetic catechesis, tastes of the eschatological, and epiclesis towards sanctified communion, sacraments are essentially participatory, transformative, and communally unifying means of grace. Not only does sacramental participation habituate and re-story personal and communal identity through concrete signs of concurrence, but it facilitates holistic communion with God and with the community of faith. While the sacraments are highly formative actions embedded within a larger liturgical praxis, Smith admonishes, “We do well to remember that, in a sense, even this [formation] is a by-product of the fundamental aim of worship, which is praise and adoration of the triune God.”<sup>117</sup> As vehicles of grace expanding perspectives and shaping affections, sacraments bring us into the life of God and engage us in holistic worship.

---

<sup>117</sup> Smith, *Desiring the Kingdom*, 150.

### Chapter 3:

#### *Musical Worship as A Pentecostal Sacrament*

If Pentecostal sacraments allow worshipers to personally and communally participate in the story of God through kinesthetic catechesis, dialectic temporality, and mediated epiclesis, then music can be seen as a Pentecostal sacrament. Music's dynamic and artistic tensions parallel the tensions and dynamics of life. A sacramental theology of worship deepens this narrative-praxis approach, engaging a dialectic between orthodoxy, orthopathy, and orthopraxis. Thus, in this section, I will parallel my definition of Pentecostal sacramentality with an analysis of musical worship. Music's semiotic physicality, transformative concurrence, and epicletic connectivity facilitates meaningful encounter with the divine as a sacramental sign of God's presence and means of sanctifying grace.

Just as sacraments are participations in Christ through tangible demonstrations of spiritual realities, music functions as a physical sign of God's presence within us. Albrecht observes, "Many Pentecostal ritualists report that during the worship they sense the proximity of the Holy Spirit and the reality of close communion with the divine heightened during the singing, listening and participating in the music and the other sounds of worship."<sup>118</sup> Laying the foundation for a sacramental understanding of music, a study by John Shepherd and Peter Wicke in *Music and Cultural Theory* explains its inherent physicality:

Sound...is the only major medium of communication that can vibrate perceptibly within the body. The sound of the human voice could not be amplified and projected were it not for chambers and resonators of air inside the human body (the lungs, the sinus passages, the mouth) that vibrate in sympathy with the frequencies of the vocal cords . . . the human experience of sound involves, in

---

<sup>118</sup> Albrecht, *Rites in the Spirit*, 143.

addition to the sympathetic vibration of the eardrums, the sympathetic vibration of the resonators of the body. Sound, shaped and resonating with the properties of the internal and external configurations, textures and movements of the objects of the external world, can thus be felt in addition to being heard.<sup>119</sup>

Just as sound “enters the body and is in the body,”<sup>120</sup> the presence of God reverberates through the worshiper’s inner being. In this way, music acts as a sacramental sign in which the felt reverberations of sound awaken Pentecostals to the reality of God’s presence in their midst.

In the same way that sacraments facilitate a dialectic temporality, musical worship transpires in a trans-local reality which expresses eschatological expectancy and provides a context for transformation. Alongside Steven Land, who contends for the “inbreaking” of the kingdom of God, Alvarado associates this inbreaking with the trans-local reality of worship, stating that “worship in the earth joins the perpetual worship in heaven and is informed by its reality,” and, conversely, “Worship in heaven is augmented and incarnated by the worship of the church.”<sup>121</sup> The outcome of this locationally bifurcated worship reality is “the invocation of the presence and dominion of God everywhere the Church gathers for worship.”<sup>122</sup> Mosely furthers this point, stating that “music is a participatory experience that links worldly existence with its transcendent ground in God’s loving, reconciling self-revelation in Christ,” but does so in an indirect way to “not confuse the otherness of divine existence with the integrity of human creativity and experience.”<sup>123</sup>

---

<sup>119</sup> John Shepherd and Peter Wicke, *Music and Cultural Theory* (Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1997), 127.

<sup>120</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>121</sup> Johnathan E. Alvarado, “Worship in the Spirit: Pentecostal Perspectives On Liturgical Theology and Praxis.” *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 21 (2012), 144.

<sup>122</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>123</sup> Mosely, “‘Parables’ and ‘Polyphony,’” 269-270.

This inspires a confidence in the midst of suffering and seems to bridge the gap between the worship in heaven and the worship on earth. Biblical Scholar Thomas Long states that “When the people of God enter the place of worship and sing confidently of the victory of God and when the people of God live ethically in the present crisis as those who are confident that God’s triumph is sure, ‘today’ becomes a ‘sabbath rest.’”<sup>124</sup> This glimpse of the eschatological reality facilitates transformation, and Pentecostals refuse to leave their contexts of worship without being changed. Albrecht describes a “spill over” from worship to witness: “Pentecostals encourage re-entering their daily world, accompanied by their altered understanding of reality and with the experience of the ritual, in order to better interact with and affect their world.”<sup>125</sup> Music unites worshipers together in a shared reformation of their social imaginary, challenging cultural norms and allowing individuals to see themselves as part of a larger whole.<sup>126</sup> As a way of addressing the mistreated and misrepresented world and its need for healing, our praises become prayers yearning for the return of Christ.

These yearnings for Christ in our midst become a kind of mutual epiclesis, sacramentally invoking God’s sanctifying presence. Common practice among worship leaders is to gather the musicians together before a service and pray for God’s presence and unity in the service. But for the congregation, the music itself becomes a cry of maranatha, and it is the expectation of the worshiping community that begins to make that presence a reality. As Steven J. Land articulates, worship establishes a “connectional

---

<sup>124</sup> Thomas G. Long, *Hebrews* (Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 1997), 55.

<sup>125</sup> Albrecht, *Rites in the Spirit*, 135.

<sup>126</sup> A social imaginary is “usually expressed in and through stories, songs, and symbols,” and “convey sets of expectations (norms) about life.” Coulter, “Ontology, Affectivity, and Sacramentality,” 159-160.

reality of the presence of the Holy Spirit in the life of the Church and the power of the Spirit's influence upon people's hearts and minds."<sup>127</sup> As we call for the Spirit to sanctify our worship, we too are called by the Spirit—what Smith sees as “an invitation to be human.”<sup>128</sup> This mutual epiclesis reveals that worshipful communion is God's prerogative; as Mark J. Cartledge explains, “Songs associated with charismatic spirituality display a conviction that God Himself is the primary agent in worship and that through them He is establishing and sustaining a personal relationship with the worshippers.”<sup>129</sup> Pentecostal sacramentality interprets music as a restorative and connective practice promoting communal unity.

Alvarado claims that it is through spirit-filled worship that “humanity is connected most significantly in communion with the divine, and...with each other.”<sup>130</sup> Therefore, perhaps associating musical worship with sacramentality can mitigate some of the undue skepticism among Pentecostals toward sacramental theology and practice.

Kenneth J. Archer laments,

Unfortunately, for various reasons, some Pentecostals deny any real grace being mediated through [sacramental ordinances], thus reducing these mysteries to mere memorial rites, occasions solely for cognitive reflection devoid of the Spirit's presence and power. Yet the expectation of the worshipping community is that they will encounter the presence of Christ through the Spirit in these celebrative activities.<sup>131</sup>

The interplay of sacramentality and musical worship shows that beyond cognitive and symbolic representation, these practices allow Pentecostals to abide with Jesus in a

---

<sup>127</sup> Land, *Pentecostal Spirituality* 147.

<sup>128</sup> Smith, *Desiring the Kingdom*, 159-166.

<sup>129</sup> Mark J. Cartledge, *Encountering the Spirit: The Charismatic Tradition* (New York: Orbis Books, 2007), 67.

<sup>130</sup> Alvarado, “Worship in the Spirit.” 140-141.

<sup>131</sup> Archer, *The Gospel Revisited*, 70.

tangible, perceived reality. Both functionally and semiotically capable of fulfilling a sacramental role in Pentecostal spirituality, music is a sign of God's presence within us, a dynamic context for transformation, and a vehicle of Spirit-empowered unification.

## Chapter 4:

### *At Azusa: A Historical Analysis*

In the midst of what Pentecostal historian Grant Wacker calls the “uninhibited expression of raw religious emotion,”<sup>132</sup> which some have perceived as chaotic and disorderly, the worship services at Azusa were an amalgam of the transformational effects demonstrated in each of the sacramental ordinances.<sup>133</sup> There is much to learn about the theological intentions of the Azusa Street revival by examining its worship practices. Central to the movement’s liturgical structure, music provided a consistent base of emotional and spiritual expression for attendees and leaders. A look at early Pentecostal history and hymnody reveals a sacramental use of music which facilitated spiritual awakening in kinesthetic participation, breaking down traditional social barriers and cultivating communal unity in the context of eschatologically mindful worship.

Early Pentecostal worship services were an interplay between primitivist and pragmatic aims—a kind of “planned spontaneity.”<sup>134</sup> Wacker admits that early Pentecostals explicitly said little about their theology of worship, as “worship was something one did, not something one theorized about.”<sup>135</sup> However, testimonials from

---

<sup>132</sup> Wacker, *Heaven Below*, 99-100.

<sup>133</sup> Archer holds that Pentecostals recognize and practice five “sacramental ordinances” rooted in the fivefold gospel. Water baptism (Jesus as Savior) is a declaration of soteriological identity, which initiates individuals into the community of salvation and faith. Footwashing (Jesus as Sanctifier) demonstrates forgiveness through humility, allowing the experience of God’s redemptive cleansing and healing. Glossolalia (Jesus as Spirit Baptizer) signifies the presence of the living God upon us and among us, empowering the community for worship and witness. The laying on of hands (Jesus as healer) is faith-filled request for the healing of the whole person, allowing God to break into the present with the reality of the future; and the Eucharist (Jesus as Soon-Coming King) is proleptic anamnesis, invoking the awareness of God’s transformational presence and igniting a yearning for his return. *The Gospel Revisited*, 76-88. See also Daniella C. Augustine, “the Empowered Church: Ecclesiological Dimensions of the Event of Pentecost,” in John Christopher Thomas, *Pentecostal Ecclesiology*, 157-180; Frank Macchia, “Tongues as a Sign,” *Pneuma* 15, No. 1, Spring 1993; Kenneth Archer, *The Gospel Revisited*, ch. 3, 43-64.

<sup>134</sup> Wacker, *Heaven Below*, 99-111.

<sup>135</sup> *Ibid.*, 99.

outsiders and inadvertent revelations from insiders reveal much about early Pentecostal worship habits—habits characterized by apparent disorder. Wacker examines large quantities of anecdotal evidence (journal entrees, letters between leaders, newspaper articles, etc.) to balance the disparaging perceptions between worshiping participants and those outside the movement of just what went on at Azusa, offering both skepticism and valuable insight. At least for a short period of time, meetings occurred at all hours of the day and night, and time and place became irrelevant due to the waiting on and leading of the Spirit. Wacker shows that uninhibited emotional expression in worship was not the movement’s distinguishing centrality—indeed, Pentecostals were not the first Christians to employ spontaneous bodily responses.<sup>136</sup> Instead, what set the worship services apart was the healing in them. Supernatural signs and wonders accompanied the event of Holy Ghost worship, spilling out into cultural healing as traditional social barriers broke down. Striking equality prevailed between men and women, differing races, and even children, because saints believed that the Spirit spoke and moved through them. Anyone led by the Spirit could exhort the community by leading, preaching, prophesying, and singing in the Spirit. The sheer frequency of Pentecostal meetings and their implicit ritualization resulted in deep communal bonds and cultural formation. Furthermore, Wacker notes that over time, aspects of the Pentecostal worship services implicitly became “holy emblems” and bodily expressions became “sacramentalized.”

Music brought theological balance and catechesis to the mission of Azusa and continues to speak volumes about the movement’s cultural landscape, organization, and theology. Detailed accounts of the early worship services provide a wealth of information

---

<sup>136</sup> Revivalist movements, Quakers, and African slave spiritualities all incorporated bodily worship.

highlighting the Christocentric focus of the movement's liturgy,<sup>137</sup> and as Wacker explains, "well-worn hymns bore layers of meaning that formal theological texts could intimate but not replicate."<sup>138</sup> Stephen Dove further articulates,

The hymns written by Azusa Street participants may be understood as a type of counterbalance to other elements in the service. ... The way hymns were composed and used at the time ... reveals something about Azusa Street that preaching, testimonies, and other means of communication cannot. Through the music of Azusa Street, we are able to see 'the faith and life of a people take flesh.'<sup>139</sup>

While for historians of the movement, the music of Azusa signifies compelling theological frameworks, it functioned in some circumstances as the final step and sacramental sign in a sequence of practices for those seeking religious awakening. Dove recounts two stories found in the *Apostolic Faith* in which a change in the words of a hymn signified the experience of Spirit Baptism. In 1906, one "Brother Burke" from Anaheim, California was

Pleading with God for baptism in the Holy Spirit when he began to sing the line, "The power, the power, the Pentecostal power, is just the same today." He continued to repeat this line of song until the Holy Spirit switched his singing to a more familiar tune, "The Comforter Has Come," presumably marking his baptism in the Spirit.<sup>140</sup>

And again in 1907,

Myrtle Shideler, a missionary on her way to Liberia, provided a lengthy account of her "full testimony" ... Shideler described herself on her knees at a service in New York praying for God's power when God placed a refrain on her heart and lips: "Jesus' blood covers me, I was blind but, hallelujah, now I see." Like Burke, Shideler sang the new chorus she heard from God and only then experienced the baptism in the Spirit for which she had been longing.<sup>141</sup>

---

<sup>137</sup> Stephen Dove, "Hymnody and Liturgy in the Azusa Street Revival, 1906-1908," *Pneuma* (September 1, 2009): 256.

<sup>138</sup> Wacker, *Heaven Below*, 89.

<sup>139</sup> Dove, "Hymnody and Liturgy in the Azusa Street Revival," 256, 262.

<sup>140</sup> *Ibid.*, 254.

<sup>141</sup> *Ibid.* 254-255.

The dominantly kinesthetic worship style of early Pentecostals harkens a sacramental participation with the divine. Albrecht notes, “Human physical movement is closely tied to the movement of the Spirit” and that the Pentecostal “kinesthetic experience speaks of a spirituality that cooperates and participates in the movements of God.”<sup>142</sup> The worshipful expression of the Azusa meetings gave rise to a liturgy of planned spontaneity<sup>143</sup>—what Wolfgang Vondey calls an “‘open arrangement’ oriented along the necessities of the situation and the possibilities provided by the presence of God’s Spirit.”<sup>144</sup> Emerging out of this sense of spiritual liberty were “spontaneous responses to the sermon, shouting, stomping, singing, sighing, dancing, swaying, clapping, humming, and an entire array of kinesthetic activities.”<sup>145</sup> This interactive spirituality physically connected worshipers to the ongoing story of God’s redemption.

Just as the sacraments provide contexts for the inbreaking of eschatological healing, early Pentecostal worship services revealed the way in which the Spirit was healing social wounds. It was in the context of these services that Pentecostals saw the greatest transformational glimpses of heavenly realities. The emergence of Pentecostalism allowed themes of African-American spirituality and white Holiness to converge, beginning to tear down the walls of segregation. Among these themes was the distinctively African American experience of resisting oppression through exuberant worship.<sup>146</sup> In the heat of the revival, traditional social barriers crumbled, while striking

---

<sup>142</sup> Albrecht, *Rites in the Spirit*, 148.

<sup>143</sup> Wacker, *Heaven Below*, 99.

<sup>144</sup> Wolfgang Vondey, “The Making of a Black Liturgy: Pentecostal Worship and Spirituality from African Slave Narratives to American Cityscapes,” *Black Theology: An International Journal* (July 1, 2012): 154.

<sup>145</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>146</sup> Harvey Cox, *Fire from Heaven: the Rise of Pentecostal Spirituality and the Reshaping of Religion in the 21st Century*, 4.8.2001 ed. (Cambridge, MA: Da Capo Press, 2001), 145.

equality prevailed in the context of worship.<sup>147</sup> Women, blacks, and children assumed a visible role in public worship; these otherwise disenfranchised groups spoke freely and commanded respect because Pentecostals believed the Holy Spirit spoke through them. Supernatural signs often accompanied the event of Pentecostal worship,<sup>148</sup> and as Jean-Jacques Suurmond observes, “Those present can experience these [supernatural] expressions as gifts of the Spirit through which such a subjective response can in turn become the vehicle of objective salvation and take on the character of proclamation, encouragement or admonition.”<sup>149</sup> Through this kind of Spirit-empowered worship and witness, the church itself becomes a redemptive sacrament for the world as the eschatological community of God.<sup>150</sup>

Moreover, early Pentecostal hymns reveal an epicletic and eschatologically mindful theology—a theological foundation necessary for the kind of sacramentality I have outlined in this paper. Many at Azusa believed that true worship ought to seek one goal: to make Jesus’ presence real.<sup>151</sup> A number of hymns point to and call for the imminent return of Christ and make clear the urgent nature of evangelism. Eight of the hymns referenced in the *Apostolic Faith* carry the following titles: “A Message Concerning Christ’s Coming,” “Jesus Is Coming,” “When Jesus Comes,” “Hark! The Moments They Are Passing!” “The Warfare, the Rapture, and Afterwards,” “The Signs of the Times,” “The First Resurrection,” and “Jesus Is Coming.”<sup>152</sup> These worshipers

---

<sup>147</sup> Wacker, *Heaven Below*, 103.

<sup>148</sup> According to Wacker, this cultivated a sense that Holy Ghost worship occurred according to divine, not mundane, rules, which meant that traditional social barriers meant little within the context of worship. *Heaven Below*, 100.

<sup>149</sup> Jean-Jacques Suurmond, *Word and Spirit at Play: Towards a Charismatic Theology* (Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1995), 23-24.

<sup>150</sup> Archer, *The Gospel Revisited*, 76.

<sup>151</sup> Wacker, *Heaven Below*, 88.

<sup>152</sup> Dove, “Hymnody and Liturgy in the Azusa Street Revival,” 259.

used songs as reminders that the self had to step aside in order for Christ to step in.<sup>153</sup> The music of the early Pentecostals, highly eschatological in focus, enraptured participants into the story of Jesus' promised return. Thus, the eschatological urgency for evangelism in early Pentecostalism was not a product of immaturity, but of intimacy with the soon coming King.<sup>154</sup>

The felt presence of God has always been a powerful experience, and the highly experiential worship at Azusa was no less transformative. At the center of the movement's theological vision was the incarnate Christ and his soon return. Helping to realize this vision was the revival's hymnody, which was nothing short of sacramental. As a participatory action uniting worshipers with God and with one another, music played a communally unifying role in Azusa's vivacious worship services. Giving leaders a liturgical tool for regularizing the nearly-chaotic kinesthetic expression of emotion, Wacker contends that "Musical harmony induced social harmony ... as singing required a concerted action of many in a common and manifestly pleasurable endeavor."<sup>155</sup> As the congregation shifted their focus from self to Christ through shared song, the Spirit manifested among them, removing social barriers and bringing unity to a diverse and passionate community—by some mystery of grace making them one.

---

<sup>153</sup> Wacker, *Heaven Below*, 96.

<sup>154</sup> While I have explored the central eschatological urgency among early Pentecostals, modern Pentecostals and Charismatics have greatly strayed from their apocalyptic expectations; see Suurmond, *Word and Spirit at Play*, 3-19; and Cox, *Fire from Heaven*, 317.

<sup>155</sup> *Ibid.*, 109-110.

## Chapter 5

### *Music as Sacramental Narrative Participation*

Music is vital to Christian worship as a natural expression of emotion and lived reality that words alone cannot always fully articulate. This is especially true for Pentecostals, who desire an intimate and deeply-felt experiential relationship with God.<sup>156</sup> For Land, Pentecostal spirituality is to experience life as a part of the biblical drama of participation in God’s story.<sup>157</sup> Likewise, Archer emphasizes a “narrative-praxis approach to doing theology,”<sup>158</sup> uniting doing and knowing. Pentecostals affirm a participatory faith which shapes their personal and communal action.<sup>159</sup> Musical worship engages Pentecostal spirituality by facilitating the discovery of personal and communal narratives, allowing worshippers to identify their own stories as part of the grand metanarrative of scripture without losing sight of the breadth and diversity of the human experience. Because of its honest confession and its unifying communal, yet deeply personal nature, music is a sacramentally capable means of worshipful participation in the Pentecostal *via salutis* along the journey toward *theosis*.

Pentecostals read scripture with the intention of it becoming a lived reality in their lives.<sup>160</sup> This integration of scripture as a lived reality is Lee Roy Martin says, “The Pentecostals’ appreciation for the narrative quality of scripture meant that they became a part of the story. Therefore, they no longer looked at the Bible from the outside; instead, they entered the world of the Bible, and the world of the Bible shaped their world.”<sup>161</sup> In

---

<sup>156</sup> Albrecht, *Rites in the Spirit*, 149.

<sup>157</sup> Land, *Pentecostal Spirituality*, 74-75.

<sup>158</sup> Archer, *The Gospel Revisited*, 66.

<sup>159</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>160</sup> For Suurmond, “the story of scripture is interwoven with that of the [Pentecostal] community.” *Word and Spirit at Play*, 22.

<sup>161</sup> Lee Roy Martin, *Pentecostal Hermeneutics: A Reader*, (Leiden, BO: Brill, 2013) 5.

the same way that Pentecostal hermeneutic is shaped by participation, their liturgical practices are deeply participatory. Speaking to the process of liturgical reenactment in worship, Land illustrates that

These ways of remembering the biblical word mediated the biblical realities in a kind of Pentecostal sacramentality in which there was a constant, mutually conditioning interplay between knowledge and lived experience, where learning about God and directly experiencing God perpetually inform and depend upon one another.<sup>162</sup>

Pentecostal spirituality calls for the integration of orthodoxy and orthopraxy into orthopathy, a task which Pentecostals attain primarily through their worship.<sup>163</sup> This narrative form of theology is in continuity with the manner of the earliest Christians and Pentecostals, who were great at telling stories, but not as skilled in explaining them. According to Archer, “confessional-doxological statements flow out of our redemptive encounter” with the Trinity through worship, and the Fivefold gospel reflects the central narrative convictions of Pentecostals.<sup>164</sup>

Thus, music is a recurrent tool for traditioning and catechesis. According to Alvarado, Pentecostal worship is transformational and spiritually formative as a catechizing event into the central tenets of the faith.<sup>165</sup> Thus, Alvarado presents spirit-filled worship as a didactic learning process and the congregation as a learning community. Pentecostals sing their theology, reenacting the Biblical narrative within their liturgy of planned spontaneity. Music simultaneously creates an atmosphere of

---

<sup>162</sup> Land, *Pentecostal Spirituality*, 75.

<sup>163</sup> *Ibid.*, 11.

<sup>164</sup> *Ibid.*, 5.

<sup>165</sup> Johnathan E. Alvarado “Worship in the Spirit: Pentecostal Perspectives on Liturgical Theology and Praxis.” *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 21, no. 1 (April 2012): 137.

receptivity to and participation with God's presence while articulating that experience in one single action. Jewish musician and composer Erik Contzius explains,

Singing expresses that which words and thoughts alone cannot. We sing in joy and in sorrow. Singing moves us in ways inexplicable. When we hear others sing, we can glean their innermost emotions. When we sing ourselves, we experience release and sometimes, relief.<sup>166</sup>

In scripture, music is a vehicle of this release and relief, present when chains are loosened in freedom, fear removed in celebration, and walls torn down in obedient trust. In faith, the imprisoned Paul and Silas began to pray and sing hymns of praise to God, and "suddenly there came a great earthquake, so that the foundations of the prison house were shaken; and immediately all the doors were opened and everyone's chains were unfastened."<sup>167</sup> Likewise, David sang and danced undignified in the streets, expressing his joy as the Ark of the Covenant returned to Israel. He was called a man after God's own heart.<sup>168</sup> Circling Jericho, Joshua had seven trumpets at the front of the procession alongside the ark of God's presence, and when the trumpets blew, the walls fell down. Something about music frees and equips its worshiping participants, so it comes as no surprise that Paul admonishes followers of Christ to encourage each other with psalms, hymns, and spiritual songs.<sup>169</sup>

Musical worship is both deeply personal and deeply communal. It is personal and individual, but not individualistic. Not only does music unite the congregation together in common bonds of fellowship and communion, drawing hearts and thoughts toward

---

<sup>166</sup> Erik Contzius, "Why Do We Sing?," *Erik Contzius* (blog), September 30, 2012, accessed February 18, 2015, <http://contzius.com/why-do-we-sing/>.

<sup>167</sup> Acts 16:25-26.

<sup>168</sup> 1 Sam 13:14.

<sup>169</sup> Eph 5.19; Col 3.16.

God,<sup>170</sup> but it helps individuals to discover their own stories and voices. For Macchia, “Worship is not simply the expression of a leader backed by a monolithic ‘amen.’ Worship is an orchestra of colorfully diverse expressions.”<sup>171</sup> Albrecht notes, “Though the congregation performs together in concert, individual ritualists are free to ‘worship in their own way’ as they give praise in word ... in song ... and in action.”<sup>172</sup> Contzius intimates the valuable interplay between individuality and community in musical expression, stating,

Sometimes we have trouble finding our inner voice. Our psychology and baggage have muted us. This is why we come together as a community. It is a place to sing together. And when we sing together, we can lean on each other’s hearts and spirits. It is comforting to sing with a friend or a loved one. As we become stronger in spirit, we then find our own voice and take that chance of being heard above the din of apathy and despair. Each of us has something to sing about—some have tragedy and loss which needs to be heard; some have joys they must share. When we finally find our voices, may we, as the Psalmist suggests, sing to the Divine Source which strengthens and supports us.<sup>173</sup>

While congregational worship gives rise to the discovery of personal and ecclesial identity, this identity is most fully realized in God’s story. Land holds that such individual and communal participation in the narrative of creation and redemption is a primary concern of Pentecostal spirituality.<sup>174</sup> According to Rice, “The threefold movement within congregational worship thus consecrates one’s self towards periodic and ongoing storying rhythms of the Pentecostal threefold soteriological experiences as we discern through the Spirit their emergence.”<sup>175</sup> Pentecostal worshipers engage both

---

<sup>170</sup> Cecil Knight, *Pentecostal Worship*, ed. Cecil B. Knight (Cleveland, TN: Pathway Pr, 1974), 65.

<sup>171</sup> Frank D. Macchia, “Signs of Grace: Toward a Charismatic Theology of Worship” in *Toward a Pentecostal Theology of Worship*, edited by Lee Roy Martin. (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2016): 156.

<sup>172</sup> Albrecht, *Rites in the Spirit*, 137.

<sup>173</sup> Contzius, “Why Do We Sing?”

<sup>174</sup> Land, *Pentecostal Spirituality*, 74-75.

<sup>175</sup> Monte Lee Rice, “The Pentecostal Triple Way: An Ecumenical Model of the Pentecostal *Via Salutis* and Soteriological Experience,” in *A Future for Holiness: Pentecostal Explorations*, Edited by Lee Roy Martin. (Cleveland: CPT Press, 2013), 168-169.

their own stories and the divine story while singing hymns that recount the narrative of redemption and highlight the ups and downs in the lives of participants. Land expounds,

By interpreting their daily life and worship in terms of the significant events of biblical history, their own lives and actions were given significance. Everybody became a witness to Calvary and his or her own crucifixion with Christ, the biblical Pentecost and a personal Pentecost, the healings of the disciples and his or her own healing and so on. The singing reflected this idea of the present normativity of biblical events and therefore, for that very reason, the necessity of existential appropriation and participation. ... Thus, for them Calvary was not only a specific historical event but also a testimony and focus for daily life.<sup>176</sup>

Likewise, Rice describes the participation in the Pentecostal story as

Restoring to people a sense of ‘voice’, providential awareness, and historical consciousness. This restoration especially proves evident for people who have suffered deep experiences of deprivation in all forms. Such broken people find their true eschatological horizon toward the shaping of history, as the Spirit consecrates them toward apostolic intermediacy into God’s Trinitarian pathos and mission. Hence, they especially discover that their lives help shape history towards the coming fullness of God’s kingdom, as the Holy Spirit scripts in them ongoing testimonies of God’s hand on their lives. In this Pentecostal *via salutis*, believers therefore experience restored primal human vocation as ‘storytellers’ of God’s new creation.<sup>177</sup>

Music captures the breadth of the human experience. From major to minor, dissonant and harmonic, the diversity of chordal structure and melody reflect and accentuate humanity’s range of emotions, both suffering and joyful. True and genuine worship does not forget the pain of the cross, nor the ambiguity and weakness of the human condition.<sup>178</sup> Begbie states,

Music is remarkably instructive ... because more than any other art form, it teaches us how not to rush over tension, how to find joy and fulfillment through a temporal movement that includes struggles, clashes and fractures. The temptation is to pass over what needs to be passed through.<sup>179</sup>

---

<sup>176</sup> Ibid., 73.

<sup>177</sup> Monte Lee Rice, “The Pentecostal Triple Way: An Ecumenical Model of the Pentecostal *Via Salutis* and Soteriological Experience,” in *A Future for Holiness: Pentecostal Explorations*, Edited by Lee Roy Martin. (Cleveland: CPT Press, 2013), 170.

<sup>178</sup> This is seen in the book of Psalms, which carries more laments than any other type of song.

<sup>179</sup> Jeremy Begbie "Sound theology: meaning in music." *The Christian Century* 124, no. 23: (2007), 20.

Dissonance and harmony demonstrate God's redemption of suffering. The fullness of music not only confronts us with the dissonance in our lives, but teaches us to appreciate it. Without disharmony, the song is flat and meaningless. Leroy Ostransky, in *the Anatomy of Jazz*, observes:

What distinguishes superior creative musicians from the mediocre ones of all periods is the manner in which they create resolutions, and to create resolutions it is necessary to set up irresolutions . . . Poor and mediocre jazzmen . . . often do not understand that the quality of their jazz will depend not on any resolution, however elaborate, but rather on the inherent intricacy of the irresolution.<sup>180</sup>

In worship, the suffering of Christ is not forgotten but embraced as Pentecostals sing their theology. This dissonance is necessary for the beautiful resolution of the resurrection, the proclamation of the Lord's presence, and the anticipation for his return. Because music leaves room for such genuine expression, worshipers are invited through song to participate in the fullness of the Christian life. Dying to self and resurrected with Christ, Pentecostals proclaim salvation, healing, sanctification, and the presence and power of the Holy Spirit among us in anticipation of the soon-coming eternal reign the of Lord.<sup>181</sup>

---

<sup>180</sup> Leroy Ostransky, *The Anatomy of Jazz* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1973), 83.

<sup>181</sup> This parallels the kind of Pentecostal Fivefold Gospel articulated by Kenneth Archer in *The Gospel Revisited: Towards a Pentecostal Theology of Worship and Witness* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock Pub, 2011).

## Conclusion

In this study, I have argued that Pentecostalism's theology of worship holds soteriological significance, and that recognizing music as a Pentecostal sacrament would give credence to its purpose and place within Pentecostalism's dynamic spirituality, igniting a passion for intimacy with God and with one another.

In chapter one, I conducted a review of literature which assessed current trends in Pentecostal scholarship pertaining to its distinctive spirituality, theology of worship, and soteriology. In order to construct a Pentecostal theology of the sacraments, I incorporated a narratological framework following the precedent set by Archer, Rice, and Green. The final portion of my review assessed previous theological correlations between music and sacraments. Even outside of Pentecostalism, these articulations have not sufficiently articulated music as a sacrament. Thus, I argued that viewing musical worship as a Pentecostal sacrament would both deepen Pentecostalism's own theology of worship and strengthen its contribution to ecumenical dialogue.

To do this, it was first necessary to articulate a clear Pentecostal theology of the sacraments, given the varied perspectives discussed in the review of literature. Thus, in chapter two, I offered a framework definition of sacraments as ritual actions which enrich the Pentecostal life through their physical catechesis and participation in the story of God, their dialectic temporal contexts for the inbreaking of eschatological realities, and the mutual epiclesis toward transformational communion with the divine and with the community of faith. Beyond cognitive or symbolic representation, these practices facilitate *theosis* by allowing Pentecostals to abide with Jesus in a tangible, perceived reality.

With this theological framework in place, chapter 3 paralleled my definition of sacraments with an analysis of musical worship. By noting the physical nature and semiotic capability of music and analyzing its role in the Pentecostal liturgy, I argued that music functions as a sacramental sign of God’s presence within us, a dynamic context for transformation, and a vehicle of Spirit-empowered unification.

To illustrate the historical validity of this argument, chapter 4 examined the worship practices of the Azusa street mission. This look at early Pentecostal history and hymnody revealed a sacramental use of music that facilitated spiritual awakening in kinesthetic participation, breaking down traditional social barriers and cultivating communal unity in the context of eschatologically mindful worship. This assessment demonstrates that a sacramental theology of musical worship does not stray from the precedent set by historic Pentecostal practice.

In chapter 5, I argued that musical worship plays a crucial role in Pentecostal spirituality by facilitating the discovery of personal and communal narratives, allowing worshippers to identify their own stories as part of the larger narrative of scripture without losing sight of the breadth and diversity of the human experience.

It is clear that music is vital to Pentecostal worship. The mystery of resonance reminds us of the work of the Spirit in our lives as we give utterance through song of our deeply-felt emotion and experience. “Pentecostals are people of the gut,” Matt Huett, a pastor and professor of mine, has often said. Music speaks to us physically, emotionally, and spiritually, expressing those gut feelings in unique and substantial ways. James K. A. Smith observes, “Implicit in the materiality of Christian worship is this sense that God meets us in materiality, and that the natural world is always more than just nature—it is

charged with the presence and glory of God.” Music too, is charged with this presence and glory. As a sacramental sign and means of participation in the biblical story of redemption, music is an essential component of the Pentecostal liturgy, cultivating intimacy in ecclesial and individual relationships with God.

The sacramental nature of musical worship for which I have argued in this thesis indeed provides a dynamic narrative-praxis which honors Pentecostalism’s central convictions and gives focus to its liturgy. Because of its honest confession and its unifying communal, yet deeply personal nature, music is a sacramentally capable means of worshipful participation—a participatory action of narrative-praxis—that nourishes the Pentecostal *via salutis*. Music is both expressive and experiential, drawing Pentecostals toward unique and meaningful encounters with God. This was true for Azusa, and is true today.

## Bibliography

- Albrecht, Daniel E. *Rites in the Spirit: A Ritual Approach to Pentecostal/Charismatic Spirituality*, Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1999.
- Alvarado, Johnathan E. "Pentecostal Epiclesis: A Model for Teaching and Learning." *Pneuma* 35, no. 2 (2013): 180-198. *ATLA Religion Database with ATLASerials*, EBSCOhost (accessed February 10, 2016). <http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/15700747-12341313>.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Worship in the Spirit: Pentecostal Perspectives on Liturgical Theology and Praxis." *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 21, no. 1 (April 2012): 135-151. *Academic Search Complete*, EBSCOhost (accessed February 21, 2016). <http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/174552512X633330>
- Archer, Kenneth J. *A Pentecostal Hermeneutic: Spirit, Word, and Community*, Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2009.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The Gospel Revisited: Towards a Pentecostal Theology of Worship and Witness*. Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2011.
- Augustine, Daniela C. "From Proclamation to Embodiment: The Sacrament of the Word for the Life of the World and Its Destiny in Theosis," in *Toward a Pentecostal Theology of Preaching*, edited by Lee Roy Martin, 82-110. Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2015.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Liturgy, Theosis, and the Renewal of the World," in *Toward a Theology of Pentecostal Worship*, edited by Leroy Marten, p 165-185. Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2016.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Empowered Church: Ecclesiological Dimensions of the Event of Pentecost," in *Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology: The Church and the Fivefold Gospel*, edited by John Christopher Thomas, 157-180. Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2010.
- Begbie, Jeremy. *Theology, Music, and Time*. Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Byars, Ronald P. *Christian Worship: Glorifying and Enjoying God*. Louisville, KY: Geneva Press, 2000.
- Cartledge, Mark J. *Encountering the Spirit: The Charismatic Tradition*. New York: Orbis Books, 2007.
- Contzius, Erik. "Why Do We Sing?" *Erik Contzius* (blog), September 30, 2012. Accessed February 18, 2015. <http://contzius.com/why-do-we-sing/>.
- Coulter, Dale M. "The Whole Gospel for the Whole Person: Ontology, Affectivity, and Sacramentality." *Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies* 35, no. 2 (September 2013): 157-161. *Academic Search Complete*, EBSCOhost (accessed February 8, 2016). <http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/15700747-12341346>
- Cox, Harvey. *Fire from Heaven: The Rise of Pentecostal Spirituality and the Reshaping of Religion in the 21st Century*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley Publishing Co., 1995.

- Dove, Stephen. "Hymnody and Liturgy in the Azusa Street Revival, 1906-1908." *Pneuma* (September 1, 2009): 242-263.
- Driver, Tom F. *The Magic of Ritual: Our Need for Liberating Rites That Transform Our Lives and Our Communities*. Harper, San Francisco, 1992.
- Green, Chris E. W. "'In Your Presence is Fullness of Joy': Experiencing God as Trinity" in *Toward a Pentecostal Theology of Worship*, edited by Lee Roy Martin, 187-199. Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2016.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Toward a Pentecostal Theology of the Lord's Supper: Foretasting the Kingdom*. Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2012.
- Knight, Cecil. *Pentecostal Worship*, edited by Cecil B. Knight. Cleveland, TN: Pathway Pr, 1974.
- Koenig, Sarah. "This is My Daily Bread: Toward a Sacramental Theology of Evangelical Praise and Worship." *Worship* 82, no. 2 (March 2008): 141-161. *ATLA Catholic Periodical and Literature Index*, EBSCOhost (accessed March 28, 2016).
- Land, Steven J. *Pentecostal Spirituality: A Passion for the Kingdom*. Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2010.
- Long, Thomas G. *Hebrews*. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 1997.
- Macchia, Frank D. *Baptized in the Spirit: A Global Pentecostal Theology*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2006.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Tongues as a Sign: Towards a Sacramental Understanding of Pentecostal Experience." *Pneuma* 15, no. 1 (1993): 61-76. *ATLA Religion Database with ATLASerials*, EBSCOhost (accessed January 28, 2016).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Signs of Grace: Toward a Charismatic Theology of Worship" in *Toward a Pentecostal Theology of Worship*, edited by Lee Roy Martin, 153-164. Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2016.
- Martin, Lee Roy. *Pentecostal Hermeneutics: A Reader*. Leiden, BO: Brill, 2013.
- Mosely, David J. R. S. "'Parables' and 'Polyphony': The Resonance of Music as Witness in the Theology of Karl Barth and Dietrich Bonhoeffer," in *Resonant Witness: Conversations Between Music and Theology*, edited by Jeremy S. Begbie and Steven R. Guthrie, 240-270. Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2011.
- Neumann, Peter D. "Encountering the Spirit: Pentecostal Mediated Experience of God in Theological Context." PhD diss., University of St. Michael's College, 2010.
- Ostransky, Leroy *The Anatomy of Jazz* Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1973.
- Rice, Monte Lee. "The Pentecostal Triple Way: An Ecumenical Model of the Pentecostal *Via Salutis* and Soteriological Experience," in *A Future for Holiness: Pentecostal Explorations*, edited by Lee Roy Martin, 145-170. Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2013.
- Smith, James K. A. *Desiring the Kingdom: Worship, Worldview, and Cultural Formation*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2009.
- Shepherd, John, and Wicke, Peter. *Music and Cultural Theory*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1997.
- Suurmond, Jean-Jacques. *Word and Spirit at Play: Towards a Charismatic Theology*. Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1995.
- Taylor, Charles. *Modern Social Imaginaries*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2004.

- Thomas, John Christopher. *Footwashing in John 13 and the Johannine Community*. Edinburgh: CPT Press, 2014.
- Thompson, Matthew K. "Eschatology as Soteriology: The Cosmic Full Gospel," in *Perspectives in Pentecostal Eschatologies: World Without End*. Althouse, Peter, and Waddell, Robert, eds. Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock Pub, 2010.
- Vondey, Wolfgang. *Beyond Pentecostalism: The Crisis of Global Christianity and the Renewal of the Theological Agenda*. Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2010.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Making of a Black Liturgy: Pentecostal Worship and Spirituality from African Slave Narratives to American Cityscapes." *Black Theology: An International Journal* (July 1, 2012): 147-68.
- Wacker, Grant. *Heaven Below: Early Pentecostals and American Culture*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2003.
- Wenk, Matthias. "The Sanctified Community," in *Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology: The Church and the Fivefold Gospel*, edited by John Christopher Thomas, 105-138. Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2010.